

2015

Cases and Text on Property 6th Ed.

Susan F. French

University of California at Los Angeles

Gerald Korngold

New York Law School

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

French, Susan F. and Korngold, Gerald, "Cases and Text on Property 6th Ed." (2015). *Books*. 17.
https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/17

This is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS. For more information, please contact camille.broussard@nyls.edu, farrah.nagrampa@nyls.edu.

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
Raymond Pryke Professor of First Amendment Law
University of California, Irvine School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business
Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Professor of Law
Stanford Law School

Cases and Text on **PROPERTY**

Sixth Edition

Susan Fletcher French

Professor of Law Emerita
University of California at Los Angeles

Gerald Korngold

Professor of Law
New York Law School



Wolters Kluwer

Copyright © 2015 Susan F. French and Gerald Korngold.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.wolterskluwerlb.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.wolterskluwerlb.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-2500-5 (Casebound)

ISBN 978-1-4548-4820-2 (Loose Leaf)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

French, Susan F., 1943- author.

Cases and text on property / Susan Fletcher French, Professor of Law Emerita University of California at Los Angeles; Gerald Korngold, Professor of Law New York Law School.— Sixth edition.

pages cm. — (Aspen casebook series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4548-2500-5 (alk. paper)

1. Property—United States. I. Korngold, Gerald, author. II. Title.

KF560.C33 2015

346.7304—dc23

2014040031

About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading global provider of intelligent information and digital solutions for legal and business professionals in key specialty areas, and respected educational resources for professors and law students. Wolters Kluwer Law & Business connects legal and business professionals as well as those in the education market with timely, specialized authoritative content and information-enabled solutions to support success through productivity, accuracy and mobility.

Serving customers worldwide, Wolters Kluwer Law & Business products include those under the Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International, Loislaw, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs family of products.

CCH products have been a trusted resource since 1913, and are highly regarded resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers products provide essential information to attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, the product line offers analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International products provide the global business community with reliable international legal information in English. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on Kluwer Law journals, looseleafs, books, and electronic products for comprehensive information in many areas of international legal practice.

Loislaw is a comprehensive online legal research product providing legal content to law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

ftwilliam.com offers employee benefits professionals the highest quality plan documents (retirement, welfare and non-qualified) and government forms (5500/PBGC, 1099 and IRS) software at highly competitive prices.

MediRegs products provide integrated health care compliance content and software solutions for professionals in healthcare, higher education and life sciences, including professionals in accounting, law and consulting.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a division of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York. Wolters Kluwer is a market-leading global information services company focused on professionals.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Susan F. French, Reporter for the *Restatement, Third, of Property, Servitudes*, taught Property, Wills and Trusts, Land Use, and Community Association Law at the University of California, Davis from 1975 until 1988 and at the University of California, Los Angeles School of Law, from 1989 through 2014. She served as an Adviser to Professor Casner on the *Restatement, Second, Donative Transfers*, and as an Adviser to the *Restatement, Third, of Property, Donative Transfers*. Her publications include articles on powers of appointment, class gifts, lapse and survival problems, and perpetuities, in addition to works on servitudes and common interest communities. She is co-author (with Wayne S. Hyatt) of the casebook *Community Association Law* (2d Ed. 2008). She also publishes a biennial edition of *A California Companion for the Course in Wills, Trusts & Estates*.

Gerald Korngold is Professor of Law at New York Law School. After private practice in the area of real estate law, he entered law teaching and focuses on the fields of property, real estate transactions, conservation law and policy, and international real estate transactions. Professor Korngold has published books and articles on real estate transactions, commercial lending, landlord and tenant, estates and future interests, servitudes and covenants, conservation easements, homeowner associations, and real property taxation. He is an elected member of the American Law Institute and the American College of Real Estate Lawyers. Professor Korngold served as an Adviser to the *Restatement, Third, of Property, Servitudes*, and is a Visiting Fellow at the Lincoln Institute of Land Policy in Cambridge, Massachusetts.

The original authors of this casebook were A. James Casner and W. Barton Leach, who published the first edition in 1951.

A. James Casner (1907-1990) began his teaching career at the University of Illinois, joined the Harvard Law School faculty in 1938 as a visiting lecturer, and became a regular faculty member in 1940. In 1930, Professor Casner began a long association with the American Law Institute, working with Richard Powell, the Reporter for the first Restatement of Property. Casner became associate reporter for chapter 23 of that Restatement (gifts to heirs and the like), and went on to serve as adviser and reporter for many projects. He was the Reporter for the Restatement, Second, of Property, Landlord Tenant, and Donative Transfers. Professor Casner was the general editor of the American Law of Property (1952-54).

Professor Casner pioneered the use of revocable inter vivos trusts to avoid the expense, delay, and publicity of probate. It became the centerpiece of his treatise on estate planning, first published as a single volume in 1953, and expanded to six volumes by the fifth edition published in 1984. By the time of his death,

the revocable intervivos trust had become a standard tool of estate planners throughout the United States.

W. Barton Leach (1900-1971) clerked for Justice Oliver Wendell Holmes and then taught at the Harvard Law School from 1929 until his retirement in 1969. He was a Special Reporter for the chapters on powers of appointment and the statute of limitations in the first Restatement of Property and contributed the chapters on powers and the common law rule against perpetuities in the American Law of Property (published 1952). Perhaps his best known pieces are the classic *Perpetuities in a Nutshell*, 51 Harv. L. Rev. 638 (1938) and *Perpetuities: The Nutshell Revisited*, 78 Harv. L. Rev. 973 (1965). Leach was a great teacher, a great wit, and a talented musician who played the accordion. He was a tireless campaigner for law reform, and almost single-handedly advanced the wait and see doctrine that ultimately prevailed, under Professor Casner's leadership, in the Restatement, Second, of Property, Donative Transfers.

Professors Leach and Casner both served in the Air Force during World War II. They returned to law teaching after the war and decided to pool their resources and develop a new basic property casebook. A temporary edition was published in 1947 and the first standard edition in 1951. *Cases and Text on Property* has been a leading casebook ever since.

*For my husband, Tom Rowe,
my daughter Sarah,
and my grandchildren Ellie and Dylan*
—SFF

*For
My father of blessed memory,
David,
Ethan, Ellie, Gabriel and Benjamin,
Margaret and Matt,
and, especially, Alice*
—G.K.

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxix</i>

PART I

INTRODUCTION TO PROPERTY: BASIC IDEAS, LEGAL PROTECTIONS, ACQUISITION BY CAPTURE, CONQUEST, ADVERSE POSSESSION, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY	1
--	----------

Chapter 1	Introduction to Property: Basic Ideas and Causes of Action	3
Chapter 2	Acquiring Property: Capture, Finds, Bailments, and Salvage	71
Chapter 3	Acquisition of Property by Conquest, Adverse Possession, and Prescription	143
Chapter 4	Property Rights in Creative Works	199

PART II

OWNERSHIP INTERESTS IN PROPERTY	295
--	------------

Chapter 5	Possessory Estates and Future Interests	297
Chapter 6	Landlord-Tenant	351
Chapter 7	Concurrent Estates and Marital Property	471

PART III

VOLUNTARY TRANSFERS OF PROPERTY	503
--	------------

Chapter 8	Lifetime Gifts That Are Not in Trust	505
Chapter 9	The Modern Real Estate Transaction*	533
Chapter 10	Protection Against Discrimination in Housing	627

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xxvii
Acknowledgments	xxix

PART I INTRODUCTION TO PROPERTY: BASIC IDEAS, LEGAL PROTECTIONS, ACQUISITION BY CAPTURE, CONQUEST, ADVERSE POSSESSION, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION TO PROPERTY: BASIC IDEAS AND CAUSES OF ACTION	3
A. Terminology and Ideas	4
1. Terminology	4
2. Ideas	4
B. Legal Protections for Property: Actions for Trespass, Conversion, and Nuisance	5
1. Protecting the Land Holder's Right to Exclude: Trespass	6
<i>Jacque v. Steenberg Homes, Inc.</i>	6
Functions of the Right to Exclude	12
Limitations on the Right to Exclude	12
<i>State v. Shack</i>	14
Blackstone and the Right to Exclude	20
<i>Canons of Property Talk, or Blackstone's Anxiety</i>	20
2. Protecting the Use and Enjoyment of Land: Private Nuisance	21
<i>Rattigan v. Wile</i>	21
<i>Wernke v. Halas</i>	29
3. Protecting Personal Property: Trespass and Conversion	33
<i>Plotnik v. Meihaus</i>	33
<i>Intel Corporation v. Hamidi</i>	36
<i>Kremen v. Cohen</i>	46
Restatement (Second) of Torts § 222A (1965)	53
<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i>	54
Meaning of Property Varies with Context	67
Human Organs as Property	68

CHAPTER 2

ACQUIRING PROPERTY: CAPTURE, FINDS, BAILMENT, AND SALVAGE		71
A. The Capture Doctrine		71
1. Wild Animals		71
<i>Pierson v. Post</i>		71
<i>Keble Against Hickringill</i>		77
<i>Keeble v. Hickeringill</i>		78
First in Time, Trespassers, and <i>Ratione Soli</i>		81
<i>Ghen v. Rich</i>		82
More About Wild Animals		85
Governmental Regulation of Wild Animals and Fisheries and the Public Trust		85
Problem: Reasoning by Analogy		86
<i>Popov v. Hayashi</i>		87
2. Oil and Gas		94
<i>Anderson v. Beech Aircraft Corporation</i>		94
The Capture Doctrine, Wild Animals, and Natural Gas		98
3. Water		99
a. Groundwater		100
<i>Cline v. American Aggregates Corporation</i>		100
Property Rules and Liability Rules		105
b. Water in Lakes and Streams: Riparian Rights and Prior Appropriation		106
Restatement (Second) of Torts: Introductory Note on the Nature of Riparian Rights and Legal Theories for Determination of the Rights		106
Prior Appropriation and Riparian Systems Compared		108
c. Diffuse Surface Waters (Runoff)		110
B. Finders and Bailees		110
1. Finders versus Wrongdoers		111
<i>Armory v. Delamirie</i>		111
2. Bailees versus Wrongdoers		113
<i>The Winkfield</i>		114
3. Finders versus Owners of the <i>Locus in Quo</i>		116
<i>Hannah v. Peel</i>		116
<i>McAvoy v. Medina</i>		120
<i>Benjamin v. Lindner Aviation, Inc.</i>		121
<i>Wrongful Possession of Chattels: Hornbook Law and Case Law</i>		128
Problem		130
Treasure Trove		130
C. Sunken Treasure and Salvage Law		132
<i>Columbus-America Discovery Group v. Atlantic Mutual Insurance Co.</i>		132
The Abandoned Shipwreck Act of 1987		140
UNESCO Convention on Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage		142

CHAPTER 3

ACQUISITION OF PROPERTY BY CONQUEST, ADVERSE POSSESSION, AND PRESCRIPTION	143
A. Conquest	143
<i>Johnson and Graham's Lessee v. M'Intosh</i>	144
B. Adverse Possession and Prescription of Interests in Land	151
1. Adverse Possession	154
<i>Ewing v. Burnet</i>	154
Problems in Applying the Statute of Limitations: Tacking	156
<i>Nome 2000 v. Fagerstrom</i>	157
<i>Lawrence v. Town of Concord</i>	163
Problems in Applying the Statute of Limitations: Tolling for Disability	171
Color of Title	173
<i>Kiowa Creek Land & Cattle Co. v. Nazarian</i>	173
2. Prescription	175
<i>Dieterich International Truck Sales, Inc. v. J.S. & J. Services, Inc.</i>	175
C. Adverse Possession of Chattels and Preservation of Cultural Heritage	179
<i>Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus v. Goldberg & Feldman Fine Arts, Inc.</i>	179
<i>Solomon R. Guggenheim Foundation v. Lubell</i>	188
<i>Rosner v. United States</i>	193
Current Controversies Challenge the Capture, Conquest, and Prescription Doctrines	197

CHAPTER 4

PROPERTY RIGHTS IN CREATIVE WORKS	199
A. Property Rights in Personae and the Right of Publicity	199
<i>The Human Persona as Commercial Property: The Right of Publicity</i>	200
<i>Zacchini v. Scripps-Howard Broadcasting Co.</i>	201
<i>White v. Samsung Electronics America, Inc.</i>	206
Questions	207
<i>Keller v. Electronic Arts, Inc.</i>	207
Problems: Right of Publicity and the First Amendment	216
B. Copyright	218
Copyright Act, 17 U.S.C. § 106	218
1. Purpose of Copyright and the Fair Use Doctrine	218
<i>Suntrust Bank v. Houghton Mifflin Company</i>	218
<i>Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music, Inc.</i>	223
2. What Can Be Copyrighted?	236
Copyright Act, 17 U.S.C. § 102	236
<i>Oddzon Products, Inc. v. Oman</i>	236
<i>Feist Publications, Inc. v. Rural Telephone Service Co.</i>	239

Copyright and the First Sale Doctrine	245
3. Copyright and the Internet	246
<i>American Broadcasting Cos., Inc. v. Aereo, Inc.</i>	246
Misappropriation and Common-Law Unfair Trade Doctrines	251
C. Trademark and Trade Dress	252
Lanham Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1125(a)	253
1. Trademark	253
<i>Qualitex Co. v. Jacobson Products Co.</i>	253
2. Trade Dress	260
<i>Traffix Devices, Inc. v. Marketing Displays, Inc.</i>	260
3. Trademark Dilution	264
4. Cyberpiracy	265
<i>Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc. v. Tabari</i>	266
D. Patent Law Protection	269
1. Patent Eligibility	270
<i>Diamond v. Chakrabarty</i>	270
<i>Bilski v. Kappos</i>	272
<i>Association for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc.</i>	280
<i>Alice Corporation Pty. Ltd. v. CLS Bank International</i>	284
Patent Trolls and the Supreme Court	290
2. Plant Patents	291
<i>Bowman v. Monsanto Company</i>	291

PART II OWNERSHIP INTERESTS IN PROPERTY

CHAPTER 5

POSSESSORY ESTATES AND FUTURE INTERESTS	297
Language Used to Create Estates: Words of Limitation and Words of Purchase	299
Problems	300
Who Are the Heirs? Inheritance of Property	300
What If There Are No Heirs? Escheat	303
A. The Defeasible Fee Simple: Controlling Land Use and Behavior by Threat of Forfeiture	303
<i>Station Associates, Inc. v. Dare County</i>	305
<i>Red Hill Outing Club v. Hammond</i>	310
Restraints on Alienation and Unenforceable Conditions	313
Problem	314
<i>City of Palm Springs v. Living Desert Reserve</i>	315
Differences Among the Defeasible Fees: Adverse Possession, Alienability, and Duration	319
B. Life Estates and Remainders	321
1. Life Estates	322
<i>Nelson v. Parker</i>	322
<i>In re Estate of Jackson</i>	325

Waste	327
Alienability of Life Estates; Sale to Support Life Tenant	328
2. Remainders, Reversions, and Executory Interests	329
Note: The Importance of Classifying Future Interests	331
C. The Trust	332
D. The Rules Against Perpetuities and Other Doctrines that Destroy Future Interests	334
Uniform Statutory Rule Against Perpetuities (USRAP)	338
Exemptions from the Common-Law Rule Against Perpetuities	340
<i>Symphony Space, Inc. v. Pergola Properties, Inc.</i>	340

CHAPTER 6

LANDLORD-TENANT	351
A. The Landlord-Tenant Relationship	352
1. The Leasehold Estates	352
<i>Providence Land Services, LLC v. Jones</i>	353
2. Themes in Current Landlord-Tenant Law	355
B. Landlord's Obligations and Tenant's Remedies	358
1. Duty to Deliver Possession	358
<i>Teitelbaum v. Direct Realty Co.</i>	358
Problem	360
2. Duty to Protect the Tenant's Quiet Enjoyment:	
Constructive Eviction	360
<i>Blackett v. Olanoff</i>	360
<i>Wesson v. Leone Enterprises, Inc.</i>	363
Problems: Constructive Eviction	372
3. Condition of the Premises: The Warranty of Habitability	372
<i>Javins v. First National Realty Corp.</i>	372
N.Y. Real Prop. Law § 235(b)	381
Problems: Warranty of Habitability	385
4. Landlord's Tort Liability	386
<i>Miller v. David Grace, Inc.</i>	387
Problems: Landlord Liability for Personal Injuries	395
5. Duty Not to Discriminate in Leasing	395
C. Tenant Duties and Landlord Remedies	396
1. Tenant Duties	396
a. Duty to Preserve the Premises	396
<i>Sigsbee Holding Corp. v. Canavan</i>	396
N.Y. Real Prop. Acts. Law § 803	399
Problems: Waste	401
b. Duty to Operate	402
<i>Piggly Wiggly Southern, Inc. v. Heard</i>	402
Problems: Continuous Operation Clauses	406
c. Duty to Pay Rent	406
(i) Destruction of the Premises	406
<i>Albert M. Greenfield & Co. v. Kolea</i>	406

(ii) Rent Controls	409
<i>Rent Control and the Theory of Efficient Regulation</i>	410
<i>Residential Rent Controls: An Evaluation</i>	410
<i>Residential Rent Control</i>	412
<i>Home Is Where the Heart Is: A Brief Reply to Professor Epstein</i>	413
2. Landlord's Remedies	415
a. Recovery of Possession	415
(i) Forfeiture	415
(ii) Self-Help	416
<i>No Easy Way Out: Making the Summary Eviction Process</i>	
<i>a Fairer and More Efficient Alternative to Landlord</i>	
<i>Self-Help</i>	416
<i>Jordan v. Talbot</i>	418
Problem	422
(iii) Summary Process	423
(iv) Security in Tenure: Retaliatory Conduct	424
<i>Elk Creek Management Company v. Gilbert</i>	424
b. Monetary Damages	431
(i) The Calculus of Remedies	431
Problem	432
(ii) Landlord's Duty to Mitigate	432
<i>Austin Hill Country Realty, Inc. v. Palisades Plaza</i>	432
Restatement (Second) of Property—Landlord and	
Tenant § 12.1(3)	437
Uniform Residential Landlord and Tenant	
Act § 4.203(c)	437
Problem	439
(iii) Acceleration Clauses	440
<i>Aurora Business Park Associates v. Michael Albert, Inc.</i>	440
Note and Questions	444
Problems: Acceleration Clauses	445
(iv) Recovery Devices	445
D. Succession to Rights and Obligations: Assignments and Subleases	447
1. Liability for Rent and Other Covenants	447
a. Assignments	447
<i>Kelly v. Tri-Cities Broadcasting, Inc.</i>	447
Problem	454
b. Subleases	454
<i>American Community Stores Corp. v. Newman</i>	454
2. Power to Assign or Sublet	461
<i>Julian v. Christopher</i>	461
Problems: Consent to Assignment	468

CHAPTER 7

CONCURRENT ESTATES AND MARITAL PROPERTY	471
A. An Overview of the Current Estates: Alienability	472
B. Problems with Sharing Possession	473
<i>Martin v. Martin</i>	474

<i>Estate of Hughes v. Patton</i>	476
<i>Delfino v. Vealencis</i>	480
<i>LEG Investments v. Boxler</i>	485
C. Joint Tenancy with Right of Survivorship: Creation and Severance	488
<i>Downing v. Downing</i>	490
<i>People v. Nogarr</i>	493
<i>Smolen v. Smolen</i>	496
Modern Role of the Four Unities	499
D. Marital Property	499

PART III VOLUNTARY TRANSFERS OF POWER

CHAPTER 8

LIFETIME GIFTS THAT ARE NOT IN TRUST	505
A. Oral Gifts	506
<i>Irons v. Smallpiece</i>	506
Function of the Delivery Requirement	507
Problem and Notes: Delivery	508
Acceptance	509
Revocability	510
<i>Newell v. National Bank of Norwich</i>	511
B. Gifts Made by Check	513
<i>In re Estate of Smith</i>	514
<i>Woo v. Smart</i>	516
Symbolic Delivery and Delivery to Third Person	519
C. Deeds of Gift	520
<i>Gruen v. Gruen</i>	521
D. Delivery to a Third Party	526
<i>Chandler v. Chandler</i>	526
E. Joint Bank Accounts and Donative Intent	530

CHAPTER 9

THE MODERN REAL ESTATE TRANSACTION	533
A. Introduction to the Real Estate Transaction	533
1. Overview of a Transaction	533
<i>Residential Real Estate Transactions: The Lawyer's Proper Role—Services—Compensation</i>	533
2. The Lawyer's Professional Responsibility	545
<i>In re Conduct of Baer</i>	545
Problem	549
3. Brokers	549
<i>Tristram's Landing, Inc. v. Wait</i>	549
Problems: Agent's Commission	553

B. Contract of Sale	554
1. Statute of Frauds	554
a. Contracts for Sale of Land Under the Contract	554
b. The Statute and Deeds	555
2. Contract Conditions	555
a. Marketable Title	556
<i>Conklin v. Davi</i>	556
Note: Installment Land Contracts	560
Problem	561
b. Equitable Conversion/Risk of Loss	561
<i>Bryant v. Willison Real Estate Co.</i>	561
Problem	566
c. Quality of the Property	566
<i>Stambovsky v. Ackley</i>	566
Problems: Caveat Emptor	571
d. Contract Remedies	572
C. The Deed	573
1. Overview	573
Problem	574
2. Delivery	574
3. Description	575
4. Covenants for Title	577
<i>Seymour v. Evans</i>	578
Problems: Covenants for Title	585
D. The Mortgage	586
1. Glossary and Cast of Characters	586
2. Function of a Mortgage	588
3. Deeds of Trust	589
4. Security Interests Other Than Real Estate Mortgages and Deeds of Trust	589
5. The Real Estate Mortgage as It Was Developed in the Courts	590
6. The Mortgagee's Security Interest: Title Theory, Lien Theory	591
7. Foreclosure in Modern Practice	592
<i>Williams v. Kimes</i>	593
E. The Recording System	596
1. Introduction	596
a. The Mechanics of Recording: The Grantor-Grantee Index and the Tract System	597
b. Classification of the Recording Acts	599
(i) Notice	600
Mass. Gen. Laws Ann. ch. 183, § 4	600
(ii) Race-Notice	600
Mich. Comp. Laws § 565.29	600
(iii) Period of Grace	600
Del. Code Ann. tit. 25, § 153	600
(iv) Race	601
N.C. Gen. Stat. §47-18	601

c. Types of "Notice"	601
Problems: Recording	601
2. Record Notice	602
<i>Ryczkowski v. Chelsea Title & Guaranty Co.</i>	602
<i>Morse v. Curtis</i>	604
<i>Genovese Drug Stores, Inc. v. Conn. Packing Co., Inc.</i>	606
Problems: Chain of Title	609
3. Inquiry Notice	609
<i>Sanborn v. McLean</i>	609
Problem	612
4. Marketable Title Acts and Similar Solutions	612
F. Title Protection	613
1. The Torrens System	613
<i>Commonwealth Electric Co. v. MacCardell</i>	614
2. Title Insurance	618
<i>Somerset Savings Bank v. Chicago Title Insurance Co.</i>	618
Problems: Compare Title Insurance with General Warranty Covenant	625

CHAPTER 10

PROTECTION AGAINST DISCRIMINATION IN HOUSING	627
A. Protection Under the Federal Constitution	627
Fourteenth Amendment to the U.S. Constitution	627
<i>Shelley v. Kraemer</i>	628
B. Protection Under the Civil Rights Act of 1866 and the Federal Fair Housing Act	634
The Civil Rights Act of 1866, 42 U.S.C. § 1982	635
<i>Jones v. Alfred H. Mayer Co.</i>	635
Civil Rights Act of 1968, Title VIII—Fair Housing & Title VIII	637
Have Fair Housing Laws Made a Difference?	640
C. Discrimination Against the Handicapped	641
Discrimination in the Sale or Rental of Housing and Other Prohibited Practices	641
<i>Hill v. Community of Damien of Molokai</i>	642
D. Discrimination on the Basis of Familial Status	648
§ 3602. Definitions . . .	648
§ 3607. Exemption . . .	649
<i>Simovits v. Chanticleer Condominium Ass'n</i>	649
E. Discrimination on the Basis of Marital Status and Sexual Orientation	656
<i>Smith v. Fair Employment and Housing Commission</i>	656

PART IV LAND USE PLANNING AND REGULATION

CHAPTER 11

NUISANCE	669
<i>Adams v. Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Co.</i>	669
<i>Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Company, Inc.</i>	675
What Is a Nuisance? The Role of Social Utility	679
Light and Air	681
Sensitive Uses	682
Restatement (Second) of Torts § 821F. Significant Harm	682
Coming to the Nuisance and Changing Neighborhoods	682

CHAPTER 12

SERVITUDES AND COMMON INTEREST COMMUNITIES	685
A. Introduction	685
Running with the Land and Running with Interests in the Land	685
Types of Servitudes and Servitude Categories	686
Common Interest Communities	687
A Bit of History: Disintegration and Integration of Servitudes Law	687
B. Easements and Profits	689
1. Creation of Easements and Profits	690
a. Intent	690
(i) Easement or Fee?	690
<i>Brown v. The Penn Central Corporation</i>	690
(ii) Easement or License?	692
<i>Stratis v. Doyle</i>	692
b. Creation by Estoppel	695
Restatement (Third) of Property § 2.10, Servitudes	
Created by Estoppel	695
<i>Mund v. English</i>	695
c. Creation by Implication	697
(i) Implied on the Basis of Prior Use	698
<i>Van Sandt v. Royster</i>	698
(ii) Implied on the Basis of Necessity	701
<i>Morrell v. Rice</i>	701
d. Creation by Prescription	706
<i>Paxson v. Glovitz</i>	706
Comparing Easements by Implication from Prior Use, by	
Necessity, and by Prescription	709
e. Creation by Dedication, Condemnation, and Other	
Forced Sales	710
<i>Goulding v. Cook</i>	711
f. Creating Easements for Third Parties	713

2. Scope of Easements and Profits	714
Restatement (Third) of Property § 4.10, Use Rights Conferred by a Servitude	714
a. Location, Relocation, and Use of Easements	715
Restatement (Third) of Property § 4.8, Location, Relocation, and Dimensions of a Servitude	715
b. Use of Easement for Non-Dominant Land	718
<i>Brown v. Voss</i>	718
c. Succession, Exclusivity, Assignability, and Divisibility	721
Problem	721
<i>City of Pasadena v. California-Michigan Land & Water Co.</i>	722
<i>Fairbrother v. Adams</i>	724
Assignability and Divisibility of Easements and Profits in Gross	725
Problem	726
3. Modification and Termination of Easements and Profits in Gross	727
Restatement (Third) of Property § 7.10, Modification and Termination of a Servitude Because of Changed Conditions	727
C. Covenants	727
1. The English Background	728
Negative Easements in English Law	732
2. Covenants and Negative Easements in America	733
<i>Runyon v. Paley</i>	734
<i>Sonoma Development, Inc. v. Miller</i>	744
Differences Between Real Covenants and Equitable Servitudes in American Law	748
Conservation and Historic Preservation Servitudes	750
3. Creation of Running Covenants	750
a. Express Creation by Written Instrument	751
Note: Relationship Between Covenants and Zoning	752
Problem	752
b. Creation by Estoppel	753
<i>Shalimar Association v. D.O.C. Enterprises, Ltd.</i>	753
c. Covenants Created by Implication	758
d. Covenants Created by Prescription and Eminent Domain	758
4. Validity of Servitudes	759
Restatement (Third) of Property § 3.1, Validity of Servitudes: General Rule	760
The Touch or Concern Doctrine and the Restatement (Third)	760
a. Open-Ended Covenants to Pay Money	762
<i>Neponsit Property Owners' Association, Inc. v. Emigrant Industrial Savings Bank</i>	762
Restatement (Third) of Property § 7.12, Modification and Termination of Certain Affirmative Covenants	768
b. Covenants Not to Sue	769
<i>1515-1519 Lake View Boulevard Condominium Ass'n v. Apartment Sales Corp.</i>	769
c. Direct and Indirect Restraints on Alienation	722
Problem	773
Problems: Validity	774

d.	Covenants Against Competition	774
	<i>Davidson Bros., Inc. v. D. Katz & Sons, Inc.</i>	774
	<i>Greenbelt Homes, Inc. v. Nyman Realty, Inc.</i>	779
e.	Design Controls	780
f.	Covenants Restricting Household Occupants and Personal Freedoms	782
	<i>Nahrstedt v. Lakeside Village Condominium Ass'n, Inc.</i>	783
	Judicial Review of Association Decision Making	790
5.	Succession to Covenants: Vertical Privity and Restatement (Third)	792
6.	Modification, Amendment, and Termination of Covenants	793
a.	Changed Conditions	794
	Restatement (Third) of Property § 7.10, Modification and Termination of a Servitude Because of Changed Conditions	794
	<i>Rick v. West</i>	794
	Note: Developers' Powers to Modify or Release Covenants	797
b.	Amendment	800
	<i>Evergreen Highlands Association v. West</i>	800
c.	Termination	805
	<i>Westwood Homeowners Ass'n v. Lane County</i>	805
	Restatement (Third) of Property, § 7.9, Termination by Foreclosure Sale or Bankruptcy Proceedings	810

CHAPTER 13

	THE TAKINGS CLAUSE	811
A.	Taking Property for Public Use	812
	<i>Kelo v. City of New London</i>	813
	<i>Kelo, Popularity, and Substantive Due Process</i>	827
	<i>The Judicial Reaction to Kelo</i>	828
	<i>Opinion of the Justices (Public Use of Coastal Beaches)</i>	828
	What Can Be Taken Using the Eminent Domain Power?	834
B.	Regulatory Takings	835
	<i>Penn Central Transportation Company v. New York</i>	836
	The Modern Property Rights Movement	850
	<i>More Unfinished Stories: Lucas, Atlanta Coalition, and Palila/ Sweet Home</i>	850
	<i>Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council</i>	851
	Government Subsidies and Coastal Development	873
	<i>The Track Record on Takings Legislation: Lessons from Democracy's Laboratories</i>	874
C.	Judicial Takings	877
	<i>Judicial Takings</i>	877
	<i>Stop the Beach Renourishment, Inc. v. Florida Dep't of Environmental Protection</i>	878
	<i>Judicial Takings: A Medley of Misconceptions</i>	884

D. Temporary Takings	885
<i>Arkansas Game and Fish Commission v. United States</i>	885
<i>Arkansas Game and Fish Commission v. United States: Takings Law, Without a Theory</i>	892
E. Relation Between Due Process and Takings Clauses	893
<i>Lingle v. Chevron U.S.A., Inc.</i>	893
F. Exactions	898
<i>Koontz v. St. Johns River Water Management District</i>	898
 <i>Table of Cases</i>	 909
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	917
<i>Index</i>	921

PREFACE

First published in 1951 by Harvard Professors A. James Casner and W. Barton Leach, *Cases and Text on Property* established the contours of the modern Property course, integrating into one casebook material previously taught in separate courses including personal property, estates in land, future interests, conveying, and landlord and tenant. Through subsequent editions, the book has evolved to reflect continuing changes in property law and the society it serves. The increasing importance of intellectual property, common interest communities, and constitutional limits on the ability of government to acquire and regulate property, as well as other changes, are reflected in the materials included in this sixth edition.

This edition also responds to changes in the first year curriculum that have cut the number of hours devoted to Property and increased student options to pursue, or opt out of, studying land transactions, zoning, marital property, and trusts and wills. We have cut back from 1,370 pages in the fifth edition to 944 in this sixth edition. Chapters on medieval land law and zoning have been cut entirely and coverage of marital property is limited to a note that covers the differences between community and common law property regimes, the question whether professional degrees, celebrity status, and frozen ova, sperm, and embryos are marital property subject to division on divorce, rights of the surviving spouse on death of the first spouse, and pre-marital agreements. We have also replaced a number of principal cases with notes and have ruthlessly edited those that remain.

Major changes in this edition include beginning with a new chapter that introduces basic terminology and ideas about property and three causes of action that vindicate rights to possess, use and enjoy property: trespass, nuisance, and conversion. We have added exciting new cases on intellectual property: *Keller v. Electronic Arts, Inc.* (right of publicity), *American Broadcasting Cos. Inc. v. Aereo Inc.* (copyright), *Toyota Motor Sales, USA, Inc. v. Tobari, Inc.* (nominative fair use of trademarks). We have also added the latest cases from the U.S. Supreme Court on patentable subject matter: *Bilski v. Kappos*, *Association for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc.*, and *Alice Corporation Pty. Ltd. v. CLS Bank International*. *Bowman v. Monsanto* on infringing use of patented seeds rounds out Chapter 4.

In other changes, nuisance coverage is split between Chapter 1, which covers nasty neighbor disputes, and Chapter 11, which covers conflicting land use cases. New cases on landlord tenant law are *Providence Land Services LLC v. Jones* (lease with no end date), *Miller v. David Grace, Inc.* (landlord tort liability), *Elk Creek Management Co. v. Gilbert* (retaliatory eviction), and *Austin Hill Country Realty, Inc. v. Palisades Plaza* (landlord's duty to mitigate). Chapter 7 adds new cases on tenancy in common, an increasingly important way of holding title: *Estate of Hughes v. Patton* (ouster), and *Leg Investments v. Boxler* (effect of right of first refusal on ability to partition). Two new cases have been added to Chapter 9 on real estate transactions: *Genovese Drug Stores, Inc. v. Conn. Packing Co.* (chain of title), and *Commonwealth Electric Co. v. MacCardell* (Torrens system).

Finally, Chapter 13 now combines eminent domain and regulatory takings. Several older cases have been removed to make way for *Kelo v. City of New London*, *Stop the Beach Renourishment, Inc. v. Florida Dep't of Environmental Protection*, *Arkansas Game and Fish Commission v. United States*, *Lingle v. Chevron U.S.A.*, and *Koontz v. St. Johns River Water Management District*.

Despite the cuts, which make this book well suited for a four-unit course, it can also be readily adapted for a five- or six-unit course. Most of the fifth edition cases that have been cut will be available on our website along with supplemental materials.

Professors Casner and Leach ended their Preface to the second edition of this book, in 1969, by saying: "*We wonder why all of our colleagues are not fighting to get a chance to teach the first-year property course. We can only surmise that they want to live more sheltered lives. We do not envy them.*" We, too, would not trade places with our colleagues. Property is a fascinating and ever-evolving subject.

- Property law engages some of the most important and contentious topics of our time including allocation, use, and conservation of natural resources; protection of and access to the fruits of intellectual and creative activity; land use regulation; condemning land for private industry; privatizing local government through common-interest communities; improving substandard housing; and eliminating discrimination in housing.
- Property law involves some of the most immediate and personal of human interactions such as buying a house or renting an apartment; fighting with neighbors over noise, smells, pets, water, and boundaries; protecting property against trespassers; making gifts; providing for the family on death; dividing property on divorce.
- Property law draws the attention of some of the most interesting legal thinkers of our time, as it has in prior generations. The literature is rich.

The materials in this book are designed to expose students to the broad sweep of property law and to allow them to gain the basic knowledge critical to understanding property issues and relationships. They engage students in searching analysis of the policy choices that face judges and legislatures, and help them move along the road to becoming lawyers and scholars. The materials have been selected not only for their ability to teach law, lawyering, and legal analysis, and to highlight significant policy issues, but also with an eye to the human dramas and real-life consequences that make studying Property so interesting, as well as so important. The style and presentation are designed to be user-friendly with informative notes, examples, and charts. Questions and problems throughout the book focus attention in the soundness of rulings, examine the underlying policy issues, and encourage students to think beyond the decided cases.

To improve readability of the materials, we have sometimes omitted citations, corrected apparent typographical and spelling errors and broken up or combined paragraphs in opinions without noting the intervention. Footnotes by the court or a quoted author retain their original numbers; footnotes we have added are numbered consecutively throughout a chapter. Textual omissions are indicated by ellipses.

Susan F. French
Gerald Korngold

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

American Bar Association, Model Rules of Professional Conduct, 2014 Edition. Copyright © 2014 by the American Bar Association. Reprinted with permission. Copies of ABA Model Rules of Professional Conduct, 2014 Edition are available from Service Center, American Bar Association, 321 North Clark Street, Chicago, IL 60654, 1-800-285-2221. This information or any portion thereof may not be copied or disseminated in any form or by any means or stored in an electronic database or retrieval system without the express written consent of the American Bar Association.

American Bar Association, Residential Real Estate Transaction: The Lawyer's Proper Role-Services-Compensation, 14 Real Property, Probate & Trust Journal, 581-607. Reprinted with permission. © Copyright 1979 by the American Bar Association. This information or any or portion thereof may not be copied or disseminated in any form or by any means or stored in an electronic database or retrieval system without the express written consent of the American Bar Association.

American Land Title Association, ALTA Owner's Policy (10/17/92). Reprinted by permission.

American Law Institute, Restatement (Second) of Property-Landlord Tenant, Vol. 1 (1977). Copyright © 1977 by the American Law Institute. Reprinted by permission.

American Law Institute, Restatement (Second) of Torts (1979). Copyright © 1979 by the American Law Institute. Reprinted by permission.

American Law Institute, Restatement (Third) of Property, Servitudes (2000). Copyright © 2000 by the American Law Institute. Reprinted by permission.

Berger, Curtis, Home is Where the Heart Is: A Brief Reply to Professor Epstein, 54 Brooklyn Law Review (1989). Copyright © 1989 Curtis Berger. Reprinted by permission of Brooklyn Law Review.

Braunstein, Michael, Structural Change and Inter-Professional Competitive Advantage: An Example Drawn from Real Estate Conveyancing, 62 Missouri L. Rev. 241, 278-279 (1977). Reprinted by permission.

Continuing Education of the Bar—California, Table of Consanguinity and Chart of Relationships, reproduced from California Decedent Estate Practice, Second Edition, Vol. 1, copyright © 2014 by the Regents of the University of California, with permission.

Downs, Anthony, Residential Rent Controls: an Evaluation, The Urban Land Institute (1988). Reprinted by permission from the publisher ULI—The Urban Land Institute, 1025 Thomas Jefferson St., NW, Washington, D.C. 20007-5201.

Echeverria, John D. and Thekla Hansen-Young, *The Track Record on Takings Legislation: Lessons from Democracy's Laboratories* 28 *Stan. Envtl. L.J.* 439, 441-46 (2009).

Epstein, Richard, *Rent Control and the Theory of Efficient Regulation*, 54 *Brooklyn Law Review* (1988). Copyright © Richard Epstein. Reprinted by permission of Brooklyn Law Review.

Gerchick, Randy G., *No Easy Way Out: Making the Summary Eviction Process a Fairer and More Effective Alternative to Landlord Self-Help*, 41 *UCLA L. Rev.* 759 (1994). Copyright © 1994, Randy G. Gerchick, reprinted by permission.

Glendon, Mary Ann, *The Transformation of American Landlord-Tenant Law*, 23 *Boston College L. Rev.* (1982). Copyright © 1982, Mary Ann Glendon. Reprinted by permission.

Helmholz, R.H., *Wrongful Possession of Chattels: Hornbook Law and Case Law*, 80 *Northwestern U. Law Rev.* 1221-1224 (1986). Copyright © 1986 Northwestern University School of Law, *Law Review*, reprinted by permission.

Houck, Oliver A., *Unfinished Stories II*, 75 *U. Colo. L. Rev.* 331 (2004). Reprinted with permission of the University of Colorado Law Review.

Kades, Eric, *The Dark Side of Efficiency: Johnson v. M'Intosh and the Expropriation of Indian Lands*, 148 *U. Penn. L. Rev.* (2000). Reprinted by permission of the author.

Kennedy, Duncan, *The Effect of the Warranty of Habitability on Low Income Housing: "Milking" and Class Violence*, 15 *Fla. St. U.L. Rev.* 485 (1987). Copyright © 1987 Florida State University Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

McCarthy, J. Thomas, *The Human Persona as Commercial Property*, 19 *Columbia VLA Journal of the Law and Arts* (1995). Reprinted by permission of the author.

Meyers, Charles J., *The Covenant of Habitability and the American Law Institute*, 27 *Stanford L. Rev.* (1975). Reprinted by permission.

National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, *Uniform Residential Landlord and Tenant Act*, 7B *Uniform Laws Annotated* (1985). Copyright © 1985 by the Uniform Law Commission. Reprinted by permission.

National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, *Uniform Statutory Rule Against Perpetuities*. Copyright © 1990 by the Uniform Law Commission. Reprinted by permission.

Rabin, Edward, *The Revolution in Residential Landlord-Tenant Law: Causes and Consequences*, 69 *Cornell L. Rev.* 517, 562 (1984). Copyright © 1984 by Cornell Law Review. Reprinted by permission.

Radin, Margaret Jane, *Residential Rent Control*, 15 *Phil. & Pub. Aff.* 350, 359-62 (1986). Copyright © 1986 by John Wiley and Sons Inc. Reprinted by permission.

Rose, Carol M., *Canons of Property Talk, or Blackstone's Anxiety*, 108 *Yale L.J.* 601 (1998). Reprinted by permission of The Yale Law Journal Company and

Fred B. Rothman & Company from *The Yale Law Journal*, Vol. 108, pages 601-632.

Rose, Carol M., "Servitudes, Security, and Assent: Some Comments on Professors French and Reichman," V55: 6 *Southern California Law Review*, 1403-1414 (1982). Reprinted with the permission of the *Southern California Law Review*.

Somin, Ilya, *The Judicial Reaction to Kelo*, 4 *Alb. Gov't L. Rev.* 1, 2-3 (2011). Reprinted with the permission of the *Albany Government Law Review*.

Stevens, Justice John Paul (Ret.), *Kelo, Popularity, and Substantive Due Process* 63 *Ala. L. Rev.* 941 (2012).

Thompson, Jr., Barton H., *Judicial Takings* 76 *Va. L. Rev.* 1449, 1451-52 (1990). Used by permission of *Virginia Law Review*.

Underkuffler, Laura S., *Judicial Takings: A Medley of Misconceptions* 61 *Syracuse L. Rev.* 203, 206-08 (2011). Reprinted with permission of the author.

PART I

INTRODUCTION TO PROPERTY: BASIC IDEAS, LEGAL PROTECTIONS, ACQUISITION BY CAPTURE, CONQUEST, ADVERSE POSSESSION, AND CREATIVE ACTIVITY

To achieve proper self-development—to be a person—an individual needs some control over resources in the external environment. The necessary assurances of control take the form of property rights.

Margaret Jane Radin, *Property and Personhood*,
34 Stan. L. Rev. 957 (1982)

[I]n a state in which private property does not exist, citizens are dependent on the good will of government officials Whatever they have is a privilege and not a right. . . . Any challenge to the state may be stifled or driven underground by virtue of the fact that serious challenges could result in the withdrawal of the goods that give people basic security.

Cass R. Sunstein, *On Property and Constitutionalism*,
14 Cardozo L. Rev. 907, 915 (1993)

Property plays a fundamental role in our society, providing us with the material things we need to sustain life and a base from which we can participate in civic life. For most of us it does much more. We use our clothes, cars, and personal possessions to differentiate ourselves from one another; we use our property to shelter and nurture our families; and we use our wealth to support causes we want to support. Protection of our property is vital to our sense of security and is a core function of our legal system. But property law does not just protect pre-existing entitlements. It mediates disputes among those with too little property and those who have “too much,” sometimes forcing reallocations for private or public good. It also resolves disputes among public-minded folks who claim that owners of historic sites and buildings, wetlands, wildlife habitat, rain forests, and the like should be regulated to protect public interests and the owners who want to stay in control of “their” property. Other disputes involve community claims of rights to regulate development in the interests of planning to meet community objectives for safety, traffic control, amenities, and fiscal support,

and more contentiously, claims of the government to take private property for economic development. Property lies at the core of our society. Throughout history disputes over property have been some of the most contentious and they remain so today.

In the first four chapters of this book we introduce you to four very fundamental aspects of this critical subject: (1) the basic causes of action available to protect interests in property; (2) acquiring property by capture, finds, and salvage; (3) acquiring property by conquest, adverse possession, and prescription; and (4) protecting property acquired by creative activity (herein of intellectual property).

To illustrate the very broad range of property law, we have included cases ranging from land to human body parts, with stops for wild animals, oil and gas, water, cash, sunken treasure, stolen art, human cannonball performances, celebrity personas, copyrights, trademarks, and patents. We also introduce you to a variety of perspectives on the role of property—particularly private property.