

7-7-2022

## 7.7 NYC Districting Commission Hearing Summary

Piper Benedict  
piper.benedict@law.nyls.edu

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting\\_resources](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting_resources)

---

### Recommended Citation

Benedict, Piper, "7.7 NYC Districting Commission Hearing Summary" (2022). *Redistricting Resources*. 33.  
[https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting\\_resources/33](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting_resources/33)

This New York City Districting Commission is brought to you for free and open access by the NY Census and Redistricting Institute at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Redistricting Resources by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS. For more information, please contact [camille.broussard@nyls.edu](mailto:camille.broussard@nyls.edu), [farrah.nagrampa@nyls.edu](mailto:farrah.nagrampa@nyls.edu).



**WE ARE NEW YORK'S LAW SCHOOL**

**The New York City Districting Commission 2022-23 Public Hearing**

**July 7, 2022**

**4-7pm at Staten Island Borough Hall  
10 Richmond Terrace, Staten Island, NY 10301**

**Notes:**

- Commissioner attendance
- Commissioner Schnall – Important that Staten Island’s voice is heard. Continued engagement throughout summer and fall.
- Judge Go – last hearing before draft map. One person, one vote. Importance of protecting right to vote. Constitutional requirement of redistricting.
- Counsel to commission - Explained constraints/criteria that applies to redistricting NYC maps (info also on website):
  - Constitution – “One person, one vote” doctrine
    - Census taken every 10 years - Take into account change in population and demographics
  - VRA 1965
    - ensure plan maintain protections of certain racial and language minorities protected under federal voting rights act, no diluting
    - Analysis to do that
    - Charter reflects that criterion as well
  - Also have population deviation rule under newly-passed state law
    - Difference in population of each difference – the difference between most populous and least populous shall not exceed 5%
  - City charter also lays out the criteria and the order that it must be applied
    - Keep neighborhoods and communities of interest intact
    - Compact shapes
    - Limit crossover districts – covering more than one borough
    - Contiguous districts – natural boundaries
- Commissioner Wurzel – mentioned op-ed
- Clarification that there are not any proposed maps yet
- [Publictestimony@redistricting.nyc.gov](mailto:Publictestimony@redistricting.nyc.gov)

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Brooklyn		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Mercedes Narcisse	New York City Council – District 46	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 46 – make district more compact</li> <li>• She submitted a map with more detail to meet population requirement</li> <li>• Don't dilute any groups' votes</li> <li>• Population loss – make more compact</li> <li>• Inclusion of areas with shared culture, schools</li> <li>• Address inequities</li> </ul>
Council Member Farah Louis	New York City Council Member – District 45	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 45</li> <li>• Don't have hospital, least amount of parks, make sure to expand district south to ensure they gain hospital, parks, schools</li> <li>• Will submit written testimony with recommendations</li> </ul>
Brian Fox		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bay Ridge / Dyker Heights</li> <li>• Emergency services, police department - unified needs</li> <li>• Address needs</li> <li>• Fear of division</li> <li>• Unity throughout community</li> </ul>
Katherine Khatari		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bay Ridge</li> <li>• Don't break up</li> <li>• Keep districts same</li> <li>• Keep Brooklyn in Brooklyn</li> <li>• Keep Staten Island in Staten Island</li> <li>• Concern re consulting firms and experts not understanding NY</li> <li>• Still dealing with issues from COVID</li> </ul>
Angela?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bay Ridge</li> <li>• Share many issues with Staten Island</li> <li>• Mistake to separate the district</li> <li>• Bay Ridge also unique, flood issues, transportation issues</li> <li>• Connected economically</li> <li>• No reason to add Sunset Park or Park Slope to district</li> <li>• Completely different areas</li> </ul>
Liam McCabe		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 43</li> <li>• Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights</li> <li>• Keep neighborhoods together</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share same police, community boards, housing</li> <li>• Referenced years ago neighborhood was divided into six assembly districts</li> <li>• Watered down political voice</li> <li>• Intact city council seat is helpful</li> <li>• Closest election – keep seat competitive</li> </ul>
--	--

Manhattan		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Carmen De La Rosa	New York City Council - District 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 10 - Upper Manhattan</li> <li>• Population decline</li> <li>• Census undercount and double count of certain demographics</li> <li>• District must grow by at least 10,000 people</li> <li>• Take into account communities of interest to the north and east in the Bronx and south in Manhattan</li> <li>• Politically and socially connected</li> <li>• Take into account recently-passed re-zoning in District 10 – more housing units, new residents, district on lower deviation would address this – ensure equal ability to elect candidate of its choice</li> <li>• She will submit written testimony</li> </ul>
Adrienne Felton		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 9 - Harlem</li> <li>• Should have hearing in Harlem</li> <li>• Don't include Polo Grounds into Washington Heights district</li> <li>• District 9 would have to move south and would be represented by someone who doesn't even live in Harlem</li> <li>• 106<sup>th</sup> St. crossing over to Park Ave.</li> <li>• Drawing down to 71<sup>st</sup> St. – threatens cultural integrity and they will be severely marginalized</li> <li>• District would be only Manhattan district without ethnic representation</li> <li>• Opposed to removing Polo Grounds from 9 – would deplete Black historic district</li> <li>• If need increase in population maybe take from District 7</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Pharein Griffith	Manhattan 10 Neighborhood Advisory Board (NAB)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 9</li> <li>• Central Harlem</li> <li>• If Polo Grounds is redistricted into Washington Heights could affect Title 1 funding</li> <li>• Impact on programs</li> <li>• Senior population</li> </ul>
------------------	--	---

Queens		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Karra Mannarino		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Howard Beach</li> <li>• Hurricane Irene, Hurricane Sandy</li> <li>• Unique needs of community</li> <li>• Flood zones, homes along shoreline</li> <li>• Community-based representatives</li> <li>• Don't want to have to work with non-community-based reps</li> <li>• Community Board 10</li> <li>• Keep Howard Beach intact</li> </ul>
Deborrah Smith		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 31</li> <li>• Keep 31 whole</li> <li>• Arverne, Arverne by the Sea, Brookville, Edgemere, Laurelton, Springfield Gardens, Rosedale, and Far Rockaway</li> <li>• Worked hard on Arverne by the Sea project to be in Empire Zone – empowered underserved community                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Employed people from the district and beautified community was built</li> <li>• Allowed people of color to build wealth</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Do not separate Arverne by the Sea from 31</li> <li>• Noted problems with primary election where voters were displaced from their usual place of voting – caused a lot of people not to vote</li> <li>• Many disasters – COVID, hurricanes – area worked together to overcome</li> <li>• 31 should stay as is</li> <li>• JFK redevelopment project                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Economic driver in the district</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Should stay in 31 because 31 encounters all health hazards from JFK so should get benefits</li> </ul>
--	--	--

Staten Island		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Former Council Member Debi Rose	New York City Council - District 49  First African American elected official from Staten Island	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 - North Shore of Staten Island</li> <li>• Don't expand into Brooklyn or Manhattan                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Most densely populated</li> <li>• Highest concentration of Black and Hispanic populations</li> <li>• Emphasized uniqueness of Staten Island</li> <li>• Discussed history of redlining</li> <li>• SI has small Black population – most in North Shore</li> <li>• Asian and Black populations are fastest growing on Staten Island</li> <li>• Most racially and ethnically diverse district</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Ensure fair and effective representation of groups protected by VRA</li> <li>• Keep neighborhoods and communities intact</li> <li>• District 49 should not be broken up – would disenfranchise communities</li> <li>• Rent burdened, food/transportation deserts</li> <li>• Economic needs of schools</li> <li>• Needs for healthcare, healthy food, green spaces, social, civic, neighborhood networks, language</li> <li>• Current pop. - 171,145 – 0.9% shy of projected goal</li> <li>• Keep North Shore intact as it exists today</li> <li>• Diversity, address historic inequities, empower residents</li> </ul>
William Stanford Jr. (Five Borough Man)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Specify where exactly the hearing will be held</li> <li>• Bigger room</li> <li>• Don't start before 6pm</li> <li>• Should be only 50 city council districts</li> <li>• Small borough - Don't need three districts in Staten Island</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cut middle district out</li> <li>• Take 51 and collaborate with 49, make 51, 50</li> </ul>
Cathlene Rivera		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 - West Brighton, North Shore</li> <li>• Don't merge with area of Brooklyn or Manhattan</li> <li>• Nothing in common with those areas             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Not Ethnically, socio-economically, nor racially</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Mentioned Assembly district that got combined with Battery Park City – very different housing makeup             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• North Shore has many NYCHA developments</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Don't reduce process to a numbers game – real people</li> <li>• Minority groups – Hispanic, Black, Asian</li> <li>• Immigrant populations</li> <li>• VRA – don't dilute voting power of racial minority groups</li> <li>• Merging with another borough would hurt community</li> <li>• Reflect reality of community rather than numbers and lines on map</li> </ul>
Stephanie Chaveau?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 – North Shore</li> <li>• Diversity, arts, culture, restaurants, some transportation (not enough), cultural differences</li> <li>• Most diverse district in City Council</li> <li>• Growing Southeast Asian population</li> <li>• Latino population</li> <li>• Fabric of community</li> <li>• Maintain the district as it is</li> <li>• Don't put ocean between</li> </ul>
Mark Anderson	Westerleigh Improvement Society (president)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 50</li> <li>• 2 issues</li> <li>• Does not approve of districts crossing into other boroughs             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staten Island is unique                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Low density - Only has 6% of population of the city</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8,000 people per sq mile vs. 37,000 in Brooklyn and 70,000 in Manhattan</li> <li>• Large % of Staten Island needs cars to get to school, work, and buses locally and to get to Manhattan</li> <li>• Zoned for 1-2 fam houses</li> <li>• Large % of home ownership – concerned with over taxation, other issues with water bills and property taxes, etc.</li> <li>• Mixing with other boroughs is problematic for Staten Island and other boroughs bc so different</li> <li>• District 50 marginalized significantly</li> <li>• He pulled up a map</li> <li>• Showed small portion that is in 49 but should be in 50</li> <li>• North of 50 has major issues with crime, social services, housing issues that 50 does not have</li> <li>• Covid – cook book trying to put together vs shootings and stabbings, quite different from 49</li> <li>• Would like to incorporation that little area into 50 – more like midisland</li> </ul>
<p>Jazzy Robinson?</p>	<p>National Council of Negro Women (NCNW)</p> <p>Alliance for South Asian Labor</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Not forgotten borough – underestimated borough</li> <li>• District 49 should not be broken up</li> <li>• Pushed back on high crime comment – crime everywhere – proud of diversity, uniqueness of 49</li> <li>• Melting pot of Staten Island</li> <li>• Do not merge with Brooklyn or Manhattan</li> <li>• have enough numbers</li> </ul>
<p>Aurelia Curtis</p>	<p>Project Hospitality</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Redistricting will affect district for next 10 years and possibly beyond</li> <li>• Emphasized value of having city council member who truly sees and understands the needs of her community</li> <li>• Focus on the human part of this</li> </ul>



New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current representative understands their needs, that funding cannot be diluted, listens to their needs</li> <li>• Importance of funding for schools, housing</li> <li>• make sure families are not left behind</li> <li>• Consider demographics, socio-economics when considering redrawing</li> <li>• combining North Shore communities with other areas simply because they're close by would dilute resources that are needed in 49</li> </ul>
Roy Moskowitz		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 50</li> <li>• Allegedly the "mid-island" district</li> <li>• However it does not contain – mall area, New Springville, Heartland Village – these should be in 50</li> <li>• Should not include eastern neighborhoods near the water</li> <li>• Mid-island not served by trains</li> <li>• Jewish populations</li> <li>• Switch true mid-island neighborhoods in 51<sup>st</sup> with those of 50<sup>th</sup> on East Shore</li> <li>• Makes more sense and would be politically neutral</li> </ul>
Joe ?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Population deviation = offensive</li> <li>• Community, not a set of numbers</li> <li>• Supported by elected officials</li> <li>• combining with other borough ?</li> </ul>
Mary Bullock		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Geography is destiny</li> <li>• Ocean between Staten Island and rest of city</li> <li>• Mentioned history of Staten Island during revolutionary war</li> <li>• Would like to continue to be the forgotten borough – keep independent from other boroughs</li> <li>• Different state of mind in Staten Island</li> <li>• Right to geographic and historic uniqueness</li> <li>• density</li> </ul>
Terry Troia	Project Hospitality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Significantly diverse community</li> <li>• 21% Black; 31% Latino; 11% Asian</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diverse new immigrant population – Africa, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Middle East, Southeast Asia, East Asia</li> <li>• Muslim communities, Sikh communities, Buddhist center, Hindu communities</li> <li>• Yeshivas – ultra orthodox, Hasidic in West Brighton and Port Richmond</li> <li>• New immigrants who struggle to achieve full civic status</li> <li>• Students and young people – many DACA recipients</li> <li>• Need one city council member who will be strength of voice for diverse communities in north shore</li> <li>• Underrepresented Staten Islanders</li> <li>• Don't divide</li> <li>• Don't combine with other boroughs</li> <li>• Trim if you must but look at neighborhoods that might be similar in character to mid-island area</li> </ul>
Telee Brown	?  Staten Island Liberian Community Association  Community Board 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Efforts to dissolve District 49 would amount to building a wall so communities could not access services</li> <li>• Liberian community</li> <li>• Supposed to provide fair representation and prevent arbitrary or discriminatory boundaries</li> <li>• Keep communities intact</li> <li>• Preserve District 49 – keep culture, attributes</li> </ul>
Ira Washington?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 – keep together</li> <li>• Park Hill</li> <li>• Mentioned election - Impact on district – people didn't know where to vote</li> <li>• Keep district together</li> <li>• Don't separate</li> </ul>
Yavel Flores?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 - North Shore</li> <li>• Impact from COVID</li> <li>• North shore has largest</li> <li>• Sri Lankans; Liberians; Hispanics</li> <li>• Need to remain one council district</li> <li>• Impoverished communities – need singular voice</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• So different from rest of borough</li> <li>• Don't separate communities of color on North Shore</li> </ul>
Stephanie Ward	Staten Island Women who March	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Protect this community's collective power</li> <li>• Echoed Council member Rose</li> <li>• Don't dilute this community any further</li> <li>• Different needs than rest of Staten Island and rest of city – housing, transportation, economic needs</li> <li>• Needs rep who can advocate for North Shore's needs</li> <li>• Don't split up or combine with other boroughs or with mid-island</li> </ul>
Marcy Bishop		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 – don't split with other boroughs</li> <li>• On behalf of Council Member Hanks</li> <li>• Keep communities together</li> <li>• Keep North Shore district in the borough</li> <li>• Distinct interests and needs</li> <li>• Largest minority community in Staten Island</li> <li>• Diverse community leaders and organizations</li> <li>• North Shore is particularly unique in terms of race and ethnicity</li> <li>• Adding to another borough - uniqueness would be diluted and could cause socio-economic and cultural implications</li> <li>• Jeopardize resources needed for district to thrive</li> </ul>
Dr. Regina Cassidy		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• North Shore</li> <li>• Unique, diverse, complex</li> <li>• Rich in ethnicities, cultures, viewpoints, parks, cultural centers, food</li> <li>• Unique needs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Population is dense</li> <li>• Housing – one of highest challenges and priorities</li> <li>• Affordable units are hard to find and houses too</li> <li>• Homeless population</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Need supportive housing for recovery and rehabilitation</li> <li>• Access to healthcare</li> <li>• Need more medical and mental health resources on North Shore</li> <li>• North Shore should have its own representative or representatives</li> </ul>
Colleen S?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• On behalf of Staten Island Borough President Vito Fossella</li> <li>• Support Council Member testimony that strongly recommends keeping the three districts within the borough</li> <li>• Split between boroughs would be a disadvantage to constituents</li> <li>• Different needs</li> <li>• Different voices compared to rest of city</li> <li>• Would dilute Staten Island's voting power</li> </ul>
? Yellow hat and suspenders		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• North Shore is diverse community – Black, Brown, immigrant community</li> <li>• Trying to develop strong voting power – should not be broken up</li> <li>• Should not be part of Manhattan or Brooklyn – distinct communities</li> <li>• Don't split up North Shore</li> <li>• Keep as it is right now</li> </ul>
Arlette Cepeda	La Colmena	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 – North Shore</li> <li>• Echoed Council Member Rose</li> <li>• One of most diverse areas of Staten Island</li> <li>• Fair districts</li> <li>• Don't dilute voices of those who need resources and support</li> <li>• Class, religion, ethnicity, family structure</li> <li>• Mentioned proposed maps</li> </ul> <p>(Chair Walcott clarified that there are no proposed maps yet from the commission)</p>
? Garcia	Staten Island Community Center	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 - North Shore</li> <li>• 52% majority minority district</li> <li>• diversity</li> <li>• Struggle with             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• poverty</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Affordable housing</li> <li>• Job training</li> <li>• Youth programs</li> <li>• Financial entitlement programs</li> <li>• Immigrant</li> <li>• Latino, Sri Lankan - Many different languages are spoken on North Shore</li> <li>• One council member currently looking after 49 and making needs heard</li> <li>• Would reduce voting power if combined with other boroughs</li> <li>• Would make getting funds harder</li> </ul>
Gene Guerra	Travis Civic Association (president)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Common sense</li> <li>• No comparison between needs of Staten Islanders and any other borough in NY</li> <li>• Public transportation, roadway, commuter needs, rail system, way of life is far different than any other borough in NY</li> <li>• Districts should remain self-contained on the island</li> </ul>
Michelle Molina	El Centro del Inmigrante	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't want to be diluted</li> <li>• Hispanic voting power</li> <li>• Extremely diverse</li> <li>• North Shore - 50 dialects spoken by people from Latin America</li> </ul>
Agnes VanDina		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Oakwood</li> <li>• Looking for data on each district</li> </ul> <p>Chair Walcott explained that data is on website in the primer, and they put link in the zoom chat</p>
Iman?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Asked commission to consider spirituality</li> <li>• Make decision based on the will of the people</li> <li>• Echoed Council Members Rose and Hanks</li> <li>• Continue to be separate entity, independent borough</li> <li>• Keep Staten Island the way it is</li> </ul>
Catherine Paradiso		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Want representative that understands needs, history of successes and failures</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staten Island has been disenfranchised historically             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't have subways</li> <li>• Have less city services</li> <li>• Opioid epidemic</li> <li>• Quality of life issues</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Need to keep districts just exclusively on Staten Island, otherwise priorities will be split and competing</li> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> </ul>
Joseph Torres?	Project Hospitality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• North Shore – unified people</li> <li>• Growing concentration of need on the North Shore</li> <li>• Don't divide communities</li> <li>• Need to remain together and keep 49 intact</li> </ul>
Peter?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• On behalf of council members:</li> <li>• Asking Staten Island keep three districts entirely within the borough</li> <li>• 49, 50, 51</li> <li>• Keep communities of interest together</li> <li>• Shall not cross boroughs</li> <li>• Very distinct from other boroughs</li> <li>• Only borough without subway connecting to rest of city</li> <li>• Social, geographic, and political independence</li> <li>• Most suburban, parks, open spaces</li> <li>• 69% own their homes</li> <li>• Politically and ideologically diverse</li> <li>• Property taxes, water bills, tolls</li> <li>• Different infrastructure and safety needs</li> <li>• Don't combine with other boroughs</li> </ul>
Benedict Snyder?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 – keep intact, don't change</li> <li>• Echoed same sentiment as most speakers</li> <li>• Uniqueness</li> <li>• Disenfranchised</li> <li>• 49 has unique culture</li> <li>• Senior citizens</li> <li>• Food pantry</li> <li>• Liberians, Asians, Hispanic, etc.</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Rev. Antoinette Donegan		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Northshore should not be with Brooklyn or any other borough</li> <li>• Racially diverse, different from other parts of Staten Island</li> <li>• Separating North Shore would not be good</li> <li>• Representation, resources, housing, medical facilities, transportation</li> <li>• North Shore depends on public transportation – most don't have cars</li> <li>• Only have buses</li> <li>• Gun violence crisis</li> <li>• High poverty pockets</li> <li>• Elected officials that are already in office are only ones who understand issues</li> <li>• Need to stay as whole in 49</li> </ul>
Samuel Owusu?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Echo sentiments above</li> <li>• Uniqueness of Staten Island</li> <li>• diversity</li> <li>• West Africans</li> <li>• ? – audio was unclear</li> <li>• Keep 49 together</li> </ul>
Anthony Reinhart	Staten Island Republican Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 49, 50, 51 – should remain same</li> <li>• Take into account uniqueness of Staten Island</li> <li>• Keep contained in county</li> <li>• Keep communities of interest together</li> <li>• Don't cross over to other boroughs</li> <li>• Only borough to have one school district</li> <li>• All residents can reach council offices without paying bridge toll</li> <li>• Don't extend to other borough</li> </ul>
Helen Settles	Project Hospitality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49 - North Shore</li> <li>• Uniqueness</li> <li>• Don't split North Shore – it's unique, diverse, and works together as a family</li> <li>• Keep North Shore together – lots of nonprofits, organizations, need to keep together</li> </ul>
Hector Fernandez		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concurs with most speakers</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Take into account that there are always winners and losers</li> <li>• Staten Island should not lose</li> <li>• Very different from other boroughs             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Flooding, long commute time into Manhattan, turkeys, deer, cars</li> </ul> </li> <li>• The borough is very distinct – should remain separate</li> <li>• Don't merge with Brooklyn or Manhattan</li> </ul>
Abou Sy	Staten Island Immigrant Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep existing districts</li> <li>• Staten Island is one community</li> <li>• Don't divide</li> <li>• Immigrant communities</li> <li>• Have come a long way, don't want to go back to square one</li> <li>• Keep Staten Island within one borough</li> <li>• Differences</li> <li>• Access to resources</li> <li>• Fighting against inequality</li> </ul>
Mohammad ?	Alliance of South Asian American Labor (ASAAL)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Staten Island is unique</li> <li>• South Asian</li> <li>• Close ties</li> <li>• Immigrants</li> <li>• Staten Island as a whole is a unit</li> <li>• Census not accurate – undercount</li> <li>• Don't consider us as a census number – consider unique culture, needs, social life</li> </ul>
Robert P?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staten Island is a family community</li> <li>• Rich in culture, Unique</li> <li>• No place like Staten Island</li> <li>• Emphasized the first African American leaders in Staten Island and closeness of the borough</li> <li>• Don't change things</li> </ul>
Amed?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• African community of Staten Island</li> <li>• Took a lot to get to where they are today</li> <li>• Latin American, African communities on North Shore</li> <li>• Support for Staten Islanders to allow them to continue to grow</li> </ul>



**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recognize the struggles</li> <li>• Comfortable with elected officials they already know</li> <li>• Borough where stuff is done</li> <li>• Dysfunctional but works</li> </ul>
Rev. ?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District 49</li> <li>• Uniqueness - Sri Lankan restaurants, Jamaican restaurants</li> <li>• Black community dating back to revolutionary time</li> <li>• Harbor of welcoming Black people</li> <li>• Park Hill - Liberians</li> <li>• Nigerian</li> <li>• North Shore has deep history</li> <li>• Keep district together</li> </ul>

<b>Witness Name</b>	<b>Organization(s)</b>	<b>Testimony</b>
Ben Weinberg	Citizens Union	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Process should be conducted in fair, transparent, independent manner</li> <li>• Suggestions for maximizing participation                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scheduling before/after work hours</li> <li>• Make testimonies and proposed maps public</li> <li>• Increase advertising and outreach</li> <li>• Preparing testimony takes time</li> <li>• Use community and ethnic media outlets</li> <li>• Proactively seek input</li> <li>• Hold hearings in communities</li> <li>• Adopt code of ethics – to remain impartial, address political conflicts</li> <li>• Include written explanation with data and other factors when releasing draft map</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Submitted written testimony (Chair Walcott explained that some of the testimony is posted online and the rest will be shortly)</li> </ul>