

2022

## 8.22.22 - NYC Districting - Virtual Public Hearing

Piper Benedict



**WE ARE NEW YORK'S LAW SCHOOL**

**The New York City Districting Commission 2022-23 Public Hearing**  
**Monday August 22, 2022 @ 11:00 am - 1:00 pm.**  
*Virtual*

Brooklyn		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Ari Kagan	New York City Council – District 47	<p><b>District 47</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to the draft map for 47</li> <li>• Would like district to reflect what was done before last redistricting</li> <li>• Communities of interest should be in same district</li> <li>• Should include Coney Island, Sea Gate, ? Village, Luna Park, ? Part of Brighton Beach, ?</li> <li>• Supports creating Asian district</li> </ul>
Don Lee	Homecrest Community Services	<p><b>Keep Bensonhurst together</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bensonhurst – divided into 38, 44, 47, 43</li> <li>• The new Asian majority district is not enough percentage to give up two Asian plurality districts</li> <li>• Struggle with funding</li> <li>• Dividing into three isn't any better</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map - Unites and keeps whole the community of interest</li> </ul>
Jackie Huang	Sunshine House	<p><b>District 43</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports new Asian majority district 43</li> <li>• Even with increase in population, Asian voice is not heard</li> <li>• Council members have not been listening to their voice</li> <li>• Current map splits Sunset Park, Dyker Heights, and Bensonhurst</li> <li>• Current district 38, 43, 47, 44 - not representing Asian community well</li> </ul>
Chris McCreight		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights should be in same district – connected by families, institutions, and history</b></li> <li>• Opposition to draft map – separates communities</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports creating Asian majority district but the draft is not the way to do it</li> <li>• Keep communities of interest together</li> <li>• Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights - Same community board, sanitation, and precinct</li> </ul>
Lori Huang	United Chinese Association of Brooklyn	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map – two strong plurality Asian districts</li> <li>• Don't divide Bensonhurst into three districts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Asian voice is diluted (make up only 1/4 in each district currently)</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Bensonhurst is compact and diverse – same stores, services, transportation lines, etc.</li> </ul>
Ron Wallace	Foster Park Sports	<p><b>District 45</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Opposed to draft map for 45</b></li> <li>• Predominately Caribbean and South Asian neighborhood</li> <li>• Work with Flatlands and Canarsie - these would be cut out</li> <li>• Would hinder partnerships</li> <li>• Would lose resources, healthcare institutions, parks, senior care</li> </ul>
Ekram Alrowmeim	Academy of Medical and Public Health Services  APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• creates two strong plurality Asian districts – one keeps Bensonhurst whole, the other keeps Asian and Latino community of interest in Sunset Park together</li> <li>• Draft divides Bensonhurst and creates plurality white neighborhood to detriment of Asian/Latino district</li> <li>• Keep Bensonhurst as whole as possible</li> <li>• Sunset Park does not have a lot in common with Bay Ridge</li> </ul>
Lining He		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bensonhurst</li> <li>• <b>In favor of new 43<sup>rd</sup> district</b></li> <li>• Keep communities in mind over politicians</li> <li>• Want to have a voice in city council</li> </ul>
Wai Chan	Homecrest Community Services APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Unify Bensonhurst in one district</b></li> <li>• Have always been underrepresented at city level</li> <li>• Need to unify Bensonhurst into one district</li> <li>• Appreciate new Asian district but dividing Bensonhurst into three districts is wrong</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would dilute resources and funding</li> </ul>
Jing Lei		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bensonhurst</li> <li>• <b>Supports creation of new district 43</b></li> <li>• Reflects demographic changes</li> <li>• Fair representation of the will of people rather than politicians</li> <li>• Strong community support for new 43</li> <li>• Will help to unite instead of divide underrepresented communities</li> <li>• Will allow Asian groups to work together</li> </ul>
Ansen Tang	<p>United Chinese Association of Brooklyn</p> <p>APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Unite Bensonhurst in one district</b></li> <li>• Draft divides Bensonhurst into three districts</li> <li>• No elected official that will listen to concerns</li> <li>• Share issues - Affordable housing, hate crimes, language services, etc.</li> <li>• Bensonhurst is compact neighborhood – enough population to have its own district</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Don't dilute minority voting power</li> </ul>

Manhattan		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Julie Menin	New York City Council – District 5	<p><b>District 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Restore neighborhoods of Sutton Place, UES, and Roosevelt Island to district 5</b></li> <li>• draft map separates communities of interest</li> <li>• Received calls and emails from hundreds of constituents almost all expressing displeasure with draft lines</li> <li>• Draft also has problematic effects re schools, transportation, parks, etc.                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PS 158, PS 183, PS 217 – would be moved to 26 (primarily Queens school districts)</li> <li>• Dividing council member between three school districts</li> <li>• Also separates Roosevelt Island Tram</li> <li>• F train would have three members representing Roosevelt Island station</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Eliminates parkland from 5 – would be moved to 26 where they’re not as easily accessible to majority of residents – funding issues</li> <li>• Community Boards 6 and 8 have issued resolutions in opposition to the preliminary map</li> </ul>
Council Member Keith Powers	New York City Council – District 4	<p><b>District 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concern re lines for UES connecting to Queens</li> <li>• Could affect constituent services, funding, land use decisions, etc.</li> <li>• Resistance to crossover districts</li> <li>• Reflecting concerns from his district and district adjacent to his who feel that their neighborhoods should be kept intact as much as possible</li> </ul>
State Senator Brad Hoylman	State Senate – District 27	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep Hell’s Kitchen as united as possible, ideally within one district</b></li> <li>• 8<sup>th</sup> Ave. to Hudson River between W. 34<sup>th</sup> St. and W. 59<sup>th</sup> St.</li> <li>• Proposed map breaks up Hell’s Kitchen into three districts (three majority white districts – potentially in violation of VRA)</li> <li>• Vibrant, politically active community, fighting for affordable housing, parks, small business, LGBTQ rights</li> <li>• Noted Clinton Special District – created to preserve community</li> <li>• Fully included in Community Board 4</li> <li>• So much easier for senator to work with one council member and one community board</li> <li>• Diverse neighborhood – increase in Hispanic and Asian Americans</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map – keeps Hell’s Kitchen whole</li> </ul>
Carolina Tanjutco		<p><b>District 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Roosevelt Island must remain with Manhattan District 5</b></li> <li>• Concern re home value if grouped with Queens and possible issues regarding quality of life, NYPD, libraries, etc.</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Violation of charter – crossover, oddly shaped, not compact</li> <li>• Mainly residential and works well with Manhattan representative</li> </ul>
Barbara Knecht		<p><b>Keep Hell’s Kitchen whole</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> <li>• Should keep neighborhoods and communities of interest intact                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Physical boundaries of the neighborhood = community of interest</li> </ul> </li> <li>• VRA – preliminary map increases white population and reduces Hispanic, Black, Asian population</li> <li>• Clinton Special District – dividing district would hinder goals of special district</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map – Keeps Hell’s Kitchen whole</li> </ul>
Sarah Chu	Community Board 8 *Speaking in personal capacity	<p><b>District 5 and 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft for 5 and 26</li> <li>• 26 will be negatively impacted – will become more white and less Asian</li> <li>• Families in 5 will be negatively impacted                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• New 26 absorbs John Jay Park and PS 158</li> <li>• New map only includes a few blocks of families in the school district</li> <li>• Separates the school/park from the vast majority of residents who rely on these services</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Worried that the draft advantages developers</li> </ul>
Frank Farance		<p><b>District 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep Roosevelt Island with district 5</b></li> <li>• Roosevelt Island should still be connected with Manhattan UES</li> <li>• Draft violates charter</li> <li>• Tramway connects Roosevelt Island to Manhattan</li> <li>• Charter – “to the maximum extent practicable” – other ways to do this</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Suzanne Harvey	West 44 <sup>th</sup> St. Better Block Association	<p><b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Hell's Kitchen = cohesive, active, influential community, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• diverse, new asylum seekers, homeless people and others in need</li> <li>• very effective community</li> <li>• breaking up the community would make the community not effective</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Against proposed map, supports Unity Map</li> </ul>
Robert Jackman		<p><b>District 5 and 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 5 is heavily populated by senior citizens who can walk to council office – now would have to cross the river</li> <li>• Violate charter</li> <li>• Not good for people in Manhattan, seniors, and not good for people in Queens</li> <li>• Resources</li> <li>• 5 has a lot of healthcare while Queens side does not have healthcare – district would be skewed when looking at healthcare access</li> <li>• Would further erode trust in gov.</li> <li>• Concern re Staten Island getting three council members with low population</li> </ul>
Erica Bersin		<p><b>District 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep 5 the same as it is now</b></li> <li>• Issues with proposed lines for 26 and 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted the appearance that 26 has healthcare access if moved to 26</li> <li>• Seniors not having access to their representative</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Joining of Manhattan and Queens doesn't work</li> <li>• Follow charter</li> </ul>
Elizabeth OuYang		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports District 1</li> <li>• Keeps Chinatown and LES together</li> <li>• But supporting Unity Map bc it's best for Asian Americans throughout the city</li> <li>• For transparency - Requests release of other map that commission considered that did not keep Staten Island districts wholly on Staten Island</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Steven Herring		<b>District 3</b> <b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Small businesses</li> <li>• Important to have single city council member to address problems</li> <li>• Optics of creating three white districts – likely violation of VRA</li> <li>• Supports the Unity Map</li> <li>• Preserve diversity</li> </ul>
Leslie Woodruff		<b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Concern re homeless hotels, drug usage, quality of life issues, sanitation cuts</li> <li>• The homeless hotels would be in different district even though they interact with them</li> </ul>
Tom Harris	Times Square Alliance	<b>Keep Hell's Kitchen Whole</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Extend boundary for 3 and 4 from Broadway/42<sup>nd</sup> St to Columbus Cir.</li> <li>• Times Square is connected with Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Residents, businesses, entertainment</li> </ul>
Elke Fears	W 47 <sup>th</sup> / 48 <sup>th</sup> Street Block Association	<b>District 3</b> <b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Defined boundaries, strong sense of community</li> <li>• Splitting Hell's Kitchen will harm purpose of Clinton Special District</li> <li>• Would make it easier for developers to chip away at special district</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> </ul>
Jean-Daniel Noland		<b>Keep Hell's Kitchen intact</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fierce sense of community, distinct sense of place</li> <li>• Special historic legacy</li> <li>• Waves of immigrants</li> <li>• LGBTQ</li> <li>• Now asylum seekers sent from Texas</li> <li>• Distinct section of the city</li> </ul>
Brian Weber		<b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cohesive and unified community</li> <li>• Common concerns and issues</li> <li>• Draft map divides community among 3, 4, and 6</li> </ul>



New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concerned that voices will be significantly diluted</li> <li>• Consider using the Unity Map – keeps Hell’s Kitchen intact</li> <li>• Echo comments of Senator and neighbors who spoke today</li> <li>• Will submit testimony</li> </ul>
Lara Secchin	Friends of Upper East Side Historic Districts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Including Roosevelt Island and 55 blocks of Sutton Place and UES in Queens 26 will have negative consequences</li> <li>• UES and Queens = different character</li> <li>• Different priorities</li> <li>• UES = densest neighborhood in NYC</li> <li>• Need representative that understands the neighborhood</li> </ul>

Queens		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Rodney Reid		<p><b>District 28</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep Rochdale Village whole in 28</b></li> <li>• Doesn’t make sense to draw line through this housing development</li> <li>• Line even goes through a building</li> <li>• Draft has Rochdale Village split into three districts</li> </ul>
David Pecoraro	Community Board 13	<p><b>Keep District 31 close to what it currently is</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Rosedale, Laurelton, Springfield Gardens, Cambria Heights</li> <li>• Share common interest of home ownership</li> <li>• Happy with representative</li> </ul>

Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Somia Elrowmeim (someone spoke on her behalf)	Women’s Empowerment Coalition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Arab, Muslims, and immigrant communities</li> <li>• Communities need to stay together</li> </ul>