

2022

8.22.22 - NYC Districting - Virtual Public Hearing

Piper Benedict
piper.benedict@law.nyls.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting_resources

Recommended Citation

Benedict, Piper, "8.22.22 - NYC Districting - Virtual Public Hearing" (2022). *Redistricting Resources*. 38.
https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/redistricting_resources/38

This New York City Districting Commission is brought to you for free and open access by the NY Census and Redistricting Institute at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Redistricting Resources by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS. For more information, please contact camille.broussard@nyls.edu, farrah.nagrampa@nyls.edu.



WE ARE NEW YORK'S LAW SCHOOL

The New York City Districting Commission 2022-23 Public Hearing
Monday August 22, 2022 @ 11:00 am - 1:00 pm.
Virtual

Brooklyn		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Ari Kagan	New York City Council – District 47	District 47 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opposed to the draft map for 47 • Would like district to reflect what was done before last redistricting • Communities of interest should be in same district • Should include Coney Island, Sea Gate, ? Village, Luna Park, ? Part of Brighton Beach, ? • Supports creating Asian district
Don Lee	Homecrest Community Services	Keep Bensonhurst together <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bensonhurst – divided into 38, 44, 47, 43 • The new Asian majority district is not enough percentage to give up two Asian plurality districts • Struggle with funding • Dividing into three isn't any better • Supports Unity Map - Unites and keeps whole the community of interest
Jackie Huang	Sunshine House	District 43 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports new Asian majority district 43 • Even with increase in population, Asian voice is not heard • Council members have not been listening to their voice • Current map splits Sunset Park, Dyker Heights, and Bensonhurst • Current district 38, 43, 47, 44 - not representing Asian community well
Chris McCreight		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights should be in same district – connected by families, institutions, and history • Opposition to draft map – separates communities

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports creating Asian majority district but the draft is not the way to do it • Keep communities of interest together • Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights - Same community board, sanitation, and precinct
Lori Huang	United Chinese Association of Brooklyn	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports Unity Map – two strong plurality Asian districts • Don't divide Bensonhurst into three districts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asian voice is diluted (make up only 1/4 in each district currently) • Bensonhurst is compact and diverse – same stores, services, transportation lines, etc.
Ron Wallace	Foster Park Sports	District 45 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opposed to draft map for 45 • Predominately Caribbean and South Asian neighborhood • Work with Flatlands and Canarsie - these would be cut out • Would hinder partnerships • Would lose resources, healthcare institutions, parks, senior care
Ekram Alrowmeim	Academy of Medical and Public Health Services APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports Unity Map • creates two strong plurality Asian districts – one keeps Bensonhurst whole, the other keeps Asian and Latino community of interest in Sunset Park together • Draft divides Bensonhurst and creates plurality white neighborhood to detriment of Asian/Latino district • Keep Bensonhurst as whole as possible • Sunset Park does not have a lot in common with Bay Ridge
Lining He		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bensonhurst • In favor of new 43rd district • Keep communities in mind over politicians • Want to have a voice in city council
Wai Chan	Homecrest Community Services APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unify Bensonhurst in one district • Have always been underrepresented at city level • Need to unify Bensonhurst into one district • Appreciate new Asian district but dividing Bensonhurst into three districts is wrong

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would dilute resources and funding
Jing Lei		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bensonhurst • Supports creation of new district 43 • Reflects demographic changes • Fair representation of the will of people rather than politicians • Strong community support for new 43 • Will help to unite instead of divide underrepresented communities • Will allow Asian groups to work together
Ansen Tang	United Chinese Association of Brooklyn APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unite Bensonhurst in one district • Draft divides Bensonhurst into three districts • No elected official that will listen to concerns • Share issues - Affordable housing, hate crimes, language services, etc. • Bensonhurst is compact neighborhood – enough population to have its own district • Supports Unity Map • Don't dilute minority voting power

Manhattan		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Julie Menin	New York City Council – District 5	District 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restore neighborhoods of Sutton Place, UES, and Roosevelt Island to district 5 • draft map separates communities of interest • Received calls and emails from hundreds of constituents almost all expressing displeasure with draft lines • Draft also has problematic effects re schools, transportation, parks, etc. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PS 158, PS 183, PS 217 – would be moved to 26 (primarily Queens school districts) • Dividing council member between three school districts • Also separates Roosevelt Island Tram • F train would have three members representing Roosevelt Island station

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Eliminates parkland from 5 – would be moved to 26 where they're not as easily accessible to majority of residents – funding issues • Community Boards 6 and 8 have issued resolutions in opposition to the preliminary map
Council Member Keith Powers	New York City Council – District 4	District 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concern re lines for UES connecting to Queens • Could affect constituent services, funding, land use decisions, etc. • Resistance to crossover districts • Reflecting concerns from his district and district adjacent to his who feel that their neighborhoods should be kept intact as much as possible
State Senator Brad Hoylman	State Senate – District 27	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keep Hell's Kitchen as united as possible, ideally within one district • 8th Ave. to Hudson River between W. 34th St. and W. 59th St. • Proposed map breaks up Hell's Kitchen into three districts (three majority white districts – potentially in violation of VRA) • Vibrant, politically active community, fighting for affordable housing, parks, small business, LGBTQ rights • Noted Clinton Special District – created to preserve community • Fully included in Community Board 4 • So much easier for senator to work with one council member and one community board • Diverse neighborhood – increase in Hispanic and Asian Americans • Supports Unity Map – keeps Hell's Kitchen whole
Carolina Tanjutco		District 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Roosevelt Island must remain with Manhattan District 5 • Concern re home value if grouped with Queens and possible issues regarding quality of life, NYPD, libraries, etc.

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Violation of charter – crossover, oddly shaped, not compact • Mainly residential and works well with Manhattan representative
Barbara Knecht		<p>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Submitted written testimony • Should keep neighborhoods and communities of interest intact <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Physical boundaries of the neighborhood = community of interest • VRA – preliminary map increases white population and reduces Hispanic, Black, Asian population • Clinton Special District – dividing district would hinder goals of special district • Supports Unity Map – Keeps Hell's Kitchen whole
Sarah Chu	Community Board 8 *Speaking in personal capacity	<p>District 5 and 26</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opposed to draft for 5 and 26 • 26 will be negatively impacted – will become more white and less Asian • Families in 5 will be negatively impacted <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New 26 absorbs John Jay Park and PS 158 • New map only includes a few blocks of families in the school district • Separates the school/park from the vast majority of residents who rely on these services • Worried that the draft advantages developers
Frank Farance		<p>District 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keep Roosevelt Island with district 5 • Roosevelt Island should still be connected with Manhattan UES • Draft violates charter • Tramway connects Roosevelt Island to Manhattan • Charter – “to the maximum extent practicable” – other ways to do this

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Suzanne Harvey	West 44 th St. Better Block Association	Keep Hell's Kitchen whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hell's Kitchen = cohesive, active, influential community, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> diverse, new asylum seekers, homeless people and others in need very effective community breaking up the community would make the community not effective Against proposed map, supports Unity Map
Robert Jackman		District 5 and 26 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5 is heavily populated by senior citizens who can walk to council office – now would have to cross the river Violate charter Not good for people in Manhattan, seniors, and not good for people in Queens Resources 5 has a lot of healthcare while Queens side does not have healthcare – district would be skewed when looking at healthcare access Would further erode trust in gov. Concern re Staten Island getting three council members with low population
Erica Bersin		District 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Keep 5 the same as it is now Issues with proposed lines for 26 and 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Noted the appearance that 26 has healthcare access if moved to 26 Seniors not having access to their representative Joining of Manhattan and Queens doesn't work Follow charter
Elizabeth OuYang		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supports District 1 Keeps Chinatown and LES together But supporting Unity Map bc it's best for Asian Americans throughout the city For transparency - Requests release of other map that commission considered that did not keep Staten Island districts wholly on Staten Island

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Steven Herring		District 3 Keep Hell's Kitchen whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small businesses • Important to have single city council member to address problems • Optics of creating three white districts – likely violation of VRA • Supports the Unity Map • Preserve diversity
Leslie Woodruff		Keep Hell's Kitchen whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports Unity Map • Concern re homeless hotels, drug usage, quality of life issues, sanitation cuts • The homeless hotels would be in different district even though they interact with them
Tom Harris	Times Square Alliance	Keep Hell's Kitchen Whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extend boundary for 3 and 4 from Broadway/42nd St to Columbus Cir. • Times Square is connected with Hell's Kitchen • Residents, businesses, entertainment
Elke Fears	W 47 th / 48 th Street Block Association	District 3 Keep Hell's Kitchen whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Defined boundaries, strong sense of community • Splitting Hell's Kitchen will harm purpose of Clinton Special District • Would make it easier for developers to chip away at special district • Supports Unity Map
Jean-Daniel Noland		Keep Hell's Kitchen intact <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fierce sense of community, distinct sense of place • Special historic legacy • Waves of immigrants • LGBTQ • Now asylum seekers sent from Texas • Distinct section of the city
Brian Weber		Keep Hell's Kitchen whole <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cohesive and unified community • Common concerns and issues • Draft map divides community among 3, 4, and 6

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concerned that voices will be significantly diluted • Consider using the Unity Map – keeps Hell’s Kitchen intact • Echo comments of Senator and neighbors who spoke today • Will submit testimony
Lara Secchin	Friends of Upper East Side Historic Districts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Including Roosevelt Island and 55 blocks of Sutton Place and UES in Queens 26 will have negative consequences • UES and Queens = different character • Different priorities • UES = densest neighborhood in NYC • Need representative that understands the neighborhood

Queens		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Rodney Reid		District 28 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keep Rochdale Village whole in 28 • Doesn’t make sense to draw line through this housing development • Line even goes through a building • Draft has Rochdale Village split into three districts
David Pecoraro	Community Board 13	Keep District 31 close to what it currently is <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rosedale, Laurelton, Springfield Gardens, Cambria Heights • Share common interest of home ownership • Happy with representative

Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Somia Elrowmeim (someone spoke on her behalf)	Women’s Empowerment Coalition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arab, Muslims, and immigrant communities • Communities need to stay together