

2022

## 8.22.22 - NYC Districting - Manhattan Public Hearing

Piper Benedict



**WE ARE NEW YORK'S LAW SCHOOL**

**The New York City Districting Commission 2022-23 Public Hearing**  
**Monday August 22, 2022 @ 5:30pm to 9pm**  
**Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture,**  
**515 Malcolm X Blvd., Harlem, Manhattan, 10037**

<b>The Bronx</b>		
<b>Witness Name</b>	<b>Organization(s)</b>	<b>Testimony</b>
Oscar Grant	Pelham Parkway Resident Council	<p><b>District 15 / 13</b>  <b>Pelham Parkway</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Between White Plains Rd. and Jacobi Hospital</li> <li>• Draft would move area to other side of Bronx Zoo</li> <li>• Prime real estate of the Bronx</li> <li>• Don't move area to other district – Southern Blvd.</li> </ul>
Roxanne Delgado	Pelham Parkway Resident Council	<p><b>District 15 / 13</b>  <b>Pelham Parkway</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't push Pelham Parkway houses from 13 to 15</li> <li>• 15 is a poorer district</li> <li>• Funding would be limited</li> <li>• Many NYCHA residents in 15</li> <li>• Bronx Green Middle School would also be moved which could hurt funding</li> <li>• Noted political concerns too – district being cut to protect incumbent</li> </ul>
Marie McCullough?	Bronx Community Board 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted that people don't understand the process or what redistricting is</li> <li>• Map is hard to understand</li> <li>• Lack of info on demographics, environmental concerns, housing stock, businesses in area, transportation, etc.</li> <li>• Concourse Village – 6 buildings – 3 buildings in 16 and three in 17</li> <li>• Doesn't understand inclusion of prison population</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Brooklyn		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Council Member Farah Louis	New York City Council – District 45	<p><b>District 45</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposes preliminary map – removes deep rooted community interest and historical aspects from 45</li> <li>• Understand 45 must grow</li> <li>• Draft would negatively impact 45 which has always been predominantly Black and Caribbean by expanding into West Midwood and parts of Borough Park</li> <li>• Draft disproportionately impacts neighborhoods within Community Board 17 and 18, breaking up portions of Flatbush, Canarsie, East Flatbush, and Remsen</li> <li>• Keep Tilden High School, Meyer Levin Junior High, Brooklyn Science and Engineering Junior High in 45</li> <li>• Keeping borders of East Flatbush, Remsen Village, and Kings Highway and parts of Flatlands in 45</li> </ul>
Abraham Malachowski?		<p><b>District 45</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep 45 and its historical aspects whole</b></li> <li>• Draft would negatively impact community ties in Flatlands and Flatbush section of 45</li> <li>• Keep district whole and expand Flatlands/Canarsie portion – expand northeast to capture more of Ave. I to E. 59<sup>th</sup> St. – would gain PS251K</li> <li>• Keep Church Ave. from New York Ave. until Schenectady – business corridor – Little Caribbean</li> <li>• Keep Tilden High School, Meyer Levin, and the 80s in Remsen Village – Avenues A and B</li> </ul>
Dr. Ruth ?		<p><b>District 45</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't move stuff – will affect organizing and institutions that work together</li> <li>• Moving into Midwood area would cause conflict</li> <li>• Keep lines where they are</li> </ul>
Daniel Lowd?		<p><b>District 43</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep 43 same as it is now</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bay Ridge and Dyker Heights should remain together</li> <li>• Don't combine Bay Ridge and Sunset Park in 38</li> <li>• Sunset Park also divided at all levels of gov</li> <li>• Combining Bay Ridge and Sunset Park would dilute both voices</li> <li>• They should maintain historic boundaries</li> </ul>
--	--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Manhattan		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Hazel Dukes	NAACP	<p><b>District 9</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unity Map – district 9 community of interest</li> <li>• Keep existing area intact</li> <li>• Should include Schomburg Plaza, Clinton Housing, Lehman Housing, Lakeview Apartments, Duke Ellington Circle, Boys and Girls Harbor, The African Center, and Harlem Meer                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would make district more compact</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Draft left key institution intact – Polo Grounds and ? Houses                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Need to remain in the district</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Mark Levine	Manhattan Borough President	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Communities of common interest must be held together in districts</li> <li>• It's in the charter – keep intact neighborhoods and communities with established ties of common interests and associations</li> <li>• Should not cross boroughs, contiguous</li> <li>• <b>Harlem</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• reiterated Dr. Dukes's points re district 9</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Roosevelt Island</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• unambiguously part of Manhattan</li> <li>• don't combine with western Queens</li> <li>• also objects to parts or UES (Sutton Place, between 54<sup>th</sup> and 79<sup>th</sup>) being put with western Queens</li> <li>• Community Board 8 would be divided amongst 3 districts</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep communities of interest together</li> <li>• <b>Hell's Kitchen</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strong community</li> <li>• Don't divide</li> <li>• 3 – should follow the border of Broadway up to 55<sup>th</sup> St. (as currently drawn)</li> <li>• 4 – could go as far west as Broadway rather than 10<sup>th</sup> Ave., should follow Broadway to Columbus Cir.</li> <li>• 6 – should only go as far south as 54<sup>th</sup> St.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Council Member Shaun Abreu	New York City Council – District 7	<p><b>District 7</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Adjustments to district 7 borders <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Save the 160s</li> <li>• Must lose some ground to district 10</li> <li>• But 7's northern border should extend to 165 west of Fort Washington Ave. and to 163<sup>rd</sup> St. west of Broadway</li> <li>• Lower 160s = distinct community, cannot be broken apart</li> <li>• He has put a lot of money and effort into that area</li> <li>• Would harm district 10 – dilution of Latino vote</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Keep two council members for Washington Heights</li> <li>• If 10 needs to take from 7, it should grow down to 155<sup>th</sup> east of Amsterdam</li> <li>• District 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Northern part of their border should form a straight line down 96<sup>th</sup> St. – clean, compact border between 6 and 7</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Borders proposed in preliminary map for 7 should remain <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Manhattan Valley must remain a part of 7</li> <li>• Manhattanville Houses and Grand Houses must remain in 7</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Council Member Erik Bottcher	New York City Council – District 3	<p><b>District 3</b></p> <p><b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft splits Hell's Kitchen into three districts</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cohesive, tightknit community with shared history</li> <li>• Should remain in same district as Chelsea and West Village</li> <li>• Should be in same district as theaters</li> <li>• Support Unity Map for 3</li> </ul>
Council Member Gale Brewer	New York City Council – District 6	<p><b>District 6</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map for UWS</li> <li>• Include Columbus Circle in 6</li> <li>• 96<sup>th</sup> St. down to W 54<sup>th</sup> west of Broadway and includes Columbus Circle and Harborview NYCHA development – same management as Amsterdam Houses</li> <li>• These NYCHA developments need to be in same district</li> <li>• PS 75 should be in 6</li> <li>• Don't include Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Also supports keeping Roosevelt Ave. in Manhattan</li> </ul>
Assemblymember Inez Dickens	Assembly District 70	<p><b>District 9</b></p> <p><b>“Hands off Harlem”</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current map was drawn to protect the people of African descent</li> <li>• Economic, social justice, culture</li> <li>• Important that Harlem remains solid, together, united</li> <li>• Supports map that they drew that closely resembles the Unity Map</li> <li>• Only place in Manhattan where people of African descent do not have their voices diluted</li> <li>• District 9 – as far as Schomburg Plaza at 110<sup>th</sup> St. to as far north as Ralph Rangel Houses, Polo Grounds, and Rucker 159<sup>th</sup> St. and Frederick Douglass Blvd.</li> <li>• Go by the numbers to protect people of African descent</li> </ul>
Assemblymember Al Taylor	Assembly District 71	<p><b>District 9</b></p> <p><b>“Hands off Harlem”</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't disturb Harlem's lines in a way that would hinder Black representation</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Charter – fair and effective representation of groups protected by VRA</li> <li>• Should strengthen Black communities</li> <li>• Keep Harlem’s history in mind</li> </ul>
Senator Cordell Cleare	Senate District 30	<p><b>District 9</b> <b>“Hands off Harlem”</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep Harlem whole in district 9</li> <li>• These historic places should be included in 9: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Schomburg Plaza</li> <li>• Lehman Houses</li> <li>• Lakeview Apartments</li> <li>• Duke Ellington Circle</li> <li>• Boys and Girls Harbor</li> <li>• The Africa Center</li> <li>• Harlem Meer</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Should start at Rucker Park and Polo Grounds and end by including Harlem Meer and other areas mentioned above</li> </ul>
Council Member Kristin Richardson Jordan	New York City Council – District 9	<p><b>District 9</b> <b>Cannot keep the old map</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Essential that Harlem has a Black plurality</li> <li>• Draft map restores 50% Black plurality</li> <li>• Keeps all blocks above 116<sup>th</sup> St. – Polo Grounds don’t move</li> <li>• Keeps all blocks west of 5<sup>th</sup> Ave.</li> <li>• Draft map restores voting rights as VRA district</li> <li>• Will not vote for any district map that doesn’t restore voting rights and Black plurality</li> <li>• Noted that they have fact sheets, and town hall Sept. 12, open to ideas</li> <li>• People should not be advocating for old map</li> </ul>
<b>Representatives from Hell’s Kitchen (Keep Hell’s Kitchen whole)</b>		
Aleta LaFargue	Manhattan Plaza Tenants Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted the strong community from AIDS crisis to COVID pandemic</li> <li>• Deeply committed and organized community</li> </ul>
Christopher LeBron		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Respect boundaries - 59<sup>th</sup> St., 34<sup>th</sup> St., 8<sup>th</sup> Ave. to Hudson River</li> <li>• Majority minority community</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Don't dilute vote of Hell's Kitchen</li> </ul>
Christine Gorman	<p>Hell's Kitchen Democrats</p> <p>Hell's Kitchen Neighborhood Coalition</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Community Board 4 uses the boundaries, tourism guidebooks use the boundaries, news publications use the boundaries</li> <li>• Very diverse</li> <li>• Noted Special Clinton District</li> <li>• 2013 council map placed most of neighborhood in District 3</li> <li>• But preliminary map splits Hell's Kitchen into three chunks</li> <li>• Special Clinton District won't be main focus of any council member making it easier for developers to pick apart</li> <li>• Violates Charter – keep neighborhoods/communities of interest intact</li> <li>• Hell's Kitchen is a neighborhood with common interests</li> </ul>
Paul Devlin	<p>Democratic Party District Leader</p> <p>Appointee to Community Board 4</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consider plan that would keep Hell's Kitchen intact and protect Special Clinton District</li> <li>• Better balance among Asian and Hispanic communities</li> <li>• Unity Map keeps Hell's Kitchen whole</li> </ul>
David Stewart	45 <sup>th</sup> and 46 <sup>th</sup> St. Block Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Charter – Hell's Kitchen is undeniably a neighborhood</li> <li>• High crime rate, housing</li> <li>• A lot of issues that need to be addressed – need to be able to go to elected leaders to solve problems</li> <li>• Draft - Representation would be diluted</li> <li>• Not just about lines, about lives of people that live in the community</li> </ul>
Richard Marins	47-48 St. Block Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dividing neighborhood into three districts where they'll make up small part of those districts</li> <li>• Would not be able to solve problems</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> </ul>



## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Melissa Mark-Viverito		<p><b>District 8</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Last redistricting cycle split communities of interest in East Harlem</li> <li>• This is an opportunity to address those issues</li> <li>• Communities of interest were diluted <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Taft Houses (NYCHA) was split into two districts</li> <li>• Lexington Houses (NYCHA) was taken out of District 8 – common interests with 8 – does not have common interests with 6</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Unity Map addresses some of these concerns <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• One issue with Unity Map – removal of 121 to 125 on Park Ave. – would like to bring back into district 8</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Concern re Staten Island district sizes on draft map – unfair</li> </ul>
Tricia Shimamura		<p><b>Districts 26 and 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft map for 26 and 5</li> <li>• Worked on projects including East River Esplanade</li> <li>• Charter – keep neighborhoods and communities of interest intact</li> <li>• Proposed map would split families with significant shared interests <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PS 158, 183, 217 – all in school district 2 – but would be represented by council member who primarily represents schools two other districts in Queens</li> <li>• Budget issues</li> <li>• East River Esplanade – critical to have council member from East side who understands this – doesn't make sense to split up</li> <li>• Roosevelt Island – keep together with Manhattan</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Russel Squire	Community Board 8	<p><b>Districts 26 and 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to current draft for 26 and 5</li> <li>• Don't combine parts of UES and Roosevelt Island with District 26</li> <li>• Would continue to be a predominantly Queens-based district</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Charter – keep neighborhoods and communities of interest together             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft map separates strip of UES from rest of neighborhood</li> <li>• Also separates Roosevelt Island from rest of Manhattan – little in common with Queens</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Hospitals and healthcare institutions on UES should remain in surrounding district 5             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Land use/other issues – same council member should represent hospitals and surrounding area</li> <li>• Memorial Sloan Kettering, Hospital for Special Surgery, Rockefeller University – oppose draft map</li> <li>• Would also distort provision of healthcare services in 26 on Queens side</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Submitted resolution that includes draft map</li> </ul>
Meryl Brodsky	<p>District Leader in 73<sup>rd</sup> Assembly District</p> <p>Turtle Bay Association</p> <p>Friends of Dag Hammarskjold Plaza</p>	<p><b>Districts 4, 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> <li>• Draft lines take part of her district in east 60s out of the 4<sup>th</sup> and into the 5<sup>th</sup> – extending only to E. 59<sup>th</sup> St.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creates limited access to Community Board 6 and 8</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Charter – each district must be reasonably compact and not oddly shaped – oddly shaped trapezoid</li> </ul>
Lynn Shinozaki		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep Roosevelt Island with Manhattan</li> <li>• Opposed to draft map – adopt CB 8 map</li> <li>• Roosevelt Island – diverse community</li> <li>• Putting Roosevelt Island with Queens breaks promise that many living there were promised that Roosevelt Island will always be a part of Manhattan</li> <li>• Would damage their faith and trust in gov.</li> </ul>
Richard Robbins		<p><b>District 6</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Upper West Side</li> <li>• Need to keep communities like Harlem, Hell’s Kitchen, and UWS intact</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current plan doesn't make sense when looking at communities</li> <li>• UWS – 59<sup>th</sup> St. to 110<sup>th</sup> St. – same as border of community board and police precincts, local newspapers cover the area too</li> <li>• Draft breaks up UWS District 6             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Would include parts of Midtown down to 49<sup>th</sup> St. that are not part of the UWS</li> <li>• Would exclude core parts of UWS above 95<sup>th</sup> St.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Unity Map is step in right direction but needs more</li> <li>• Leave 103<sup>rd</sup> St. and other parts of 6 above 96<sup>th</sup> St. in district 6 – leave UWS intact</li> </ul>
Joan Fabio		<p><b>District 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Same demographics and needs of district 5</li> <li>• Draft for <b>26 and 5</b> – do not make sense and fail to adhere to charter criteria             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Neighborhoods and communities of interest are not kept intact</li> <li>• Not compact</li> <li>• Extreme crossover</li> <li>• Oddly shaped</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Emphasized hospitals and medical institutions – doesn't make sense for them to be represented by Queens council member             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Common needs that can only be met by Manhattan officials</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Also parks and greenspace needs to be represented by Manhattan council member</li> </ul>
Maury Davis?	Esplanade Gardens	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concern re Polo Grounds, Rangel Houses being taken out of district</li> <li>• Historical part of central Harlem</li> <li>• Keep communities intact</li> </ul>
Mei Lee?	<p>Chinese Progressive Association</p> <p>APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce</p>	<p><b>District 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chinatown and LES = community of interest, should be kept together</li> <li>• Draft does keep the community of interest together</li> <li>• Almost same as Unity Map for district 1</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Keeps whole the Asian American communities of interest in the other boroughs</li> </ul>
Shari Weiner	<p>Community Board 8 Manhattan</p> <p>*Testifying as resident of UES</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Districts 4 and 5</b></li> <li>Draft does not meet criteria from charter</li> <li>Staten Island – configuration negatively impacts rest of city – violates one person, one vote</li> <li>Reduce number of districts on Staten Island so that other 48 districts are not adversely affected</li> <li><b>District 4</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No more than twice as long as it is wide – not the case on draft</li> <li>Oddly shaped</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>District 5/26</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Roosevelt Island and Manhattan might not get fair representation, services, funding in 26</li> <li>Don't combine these very different areas</li> </ul> </li> <li>Adopt Community Board 8's proposed map</li> </ul>
Joshua Clennon		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Echoes Hazel Dukes, Inez Dickens, Al Taylor, Cordell Cleare</li> <li>Keep Hands off Harlem</li> <li>Population is within deviation</li> <li>Important to maintain historical parts of community             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Schomburg Plaza</li> <li>Lakeview Apartments</li> </ul> </li> <li>Already have plurality with current district</li> <li>Consider maintaining Harlem as it is now</li> <li>Do not divide community</li> <li>Maintain neighborhoods and developments that are in Harlem</li> </ul>
Catie Savage	Hell's Kitchen Litter Legion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Hell's Kitchen</b></li> <li>Pandemic related sanitation budget cuts</li> <li>9<sup>th</sup> Ave. from 43<sup>rd</sup> to 57<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Ave. from 44<sup>th</sup> to 55<sup>th</sup> – have supplemental cleaning services paid for with city council discretionary funding under the NYC Cleanup Initiative</li> </ul>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• With draft lines – community would have to get three council members to work together to allocate funding to small portions of their larger districts</li> <li>• Support Unity Map for district 3</li> <li>• Keep Hell’s Kitchen whole</li> </ul>
Jennifer Raab	President of Hunter College	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> <li>• Draft splits Hunter College main campus into two districts                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Buildings are connected above or below ground with entrances on both sides of Lexington Ave.</li> <li>• Lexington Ave. skybridge would function as border crossing between Districts 4 and 5</li> <li>• The school = community of interest and must stay intact</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Placement of Hunter College’s easternmost Manhattan properties into new district 26                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Has scientists working in Cornell’s Belfer Research Building on 69<sup>th</sup> St. east of 1<sup>st</sup> Ave.</li> <li>• Also 74<sup>th</sup> and York – foundation shared with Memorial Sloan Kettering</li> <li>• These two extensions of the college’s main campus would be in 26                                     <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Should be in a Manhattan district</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>• Charter – keep communities of interest intact</li> <li>• Don’t adopt the draft lines for 4, 5, and 26</li> </ul>
Elaine Walsh	East 86 <sup>th</sup> St. Merchants and Residents Association	<p><b>District 26 and 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don’t adopt draft for 26 and 5</li> <li>• Not keeping to Charter provisions</li> <li>• Will create practical difficulties for impacted areas</li> <li>• Submitted letter</li> <li>• Would need office in Manhattan</li> <li>• Adds confusion to 5 – who represents them?</li> <li>• Who do they ask for services?</li> <li>• Safety and sanitation issues</li> <li>• Zoning issues</li> <li>• Will have funding issues</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Oddly shaped, extreme crossover district</li> <li>• Would diminish voices on both sides of river</li> <li>• Staten Island should be reexamined</li> </ul>
Council Member Christopher Marte	New York City Council – District 1	<p><b>District 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support draft for District 1             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft includes East River Housing Corporation in single district (currently divided) should be in one district</li> <li>• Adds Vladeck Houses to district 1</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Changes to northern part of district that he recommends:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Include what is currently in district 1 in NoHo area – NoHo and SoHo are alike – zoning, historical identity, demographics, similar retail/residential space</li> <li>• Bleeker, Bond, Great Jones, and southern portion of E. 4<sup>th</sup> between Bowery to Broadway – should be in 1</li> <li>• Also include Silver Tower – Broadway to LaGuardia Place</li> <li>• Northern border should be Bleeker St.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Kyle Athayde	Chair of Manhattan Community Board 6	<p><b>District 4, 5, and 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to current draft</li> <li>• Hundreds of residents attended community meeting to voice opposition to draft</li> <li>• Board held emergency meeting to pass resolution that opposes this draft</li> <li>• Keep neighborhoods and communities intact, keep districts compact, limit crossover, and avoid oddly shaped districts</li> <li>• Draft doesn't meet the criteria</li> <li>• Communities will not be well represented – will only be small percentage of 26</li> <li>• Would require two offices – one in each borough</li> <li>• Echoes Raab re Hunter College</li> <li>• Municipal services and long-term planning would be hindered</li> <li>• Greenspaces</li> <li>• Requests</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bring StuyTown and 34<sup>th</sup> St. east of 1<sup>st</sup> Ave back into CD 4</li> <li>• Bring Sutton Place and East Side communities back into CD 5 – including Roosevelt Island</li> </ul>
Gwendolyn Riles?		<p><b>Roosevelt Island</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't move Roosevelt Island to Queens district</li> <li>• School systems would be affected</li> </ul>
Christopher Collins		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Crossover district</li> <li>• Disfavored by city charter</li> <li>• District 34 – Bushwick, Ridgewood – no topographical border – this one works, they're similar</li> <li>• District 8 – South Bronx and East Harlem – consists of communities with similar demographics and housing – works</li> <li>• Citizens aren't harmed by these</li> <li>• But draft for 26 doesn't work             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dilutes racial and language groups in Queens</li> <li>• Separates communities of interest</li> <li>• Creates major practical difficulties for provision of municipal services</li> <li>• Simply not necessary</li> <li>• Community boards in both boroughs have submitted alternatives</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Robert Kolakawski?		<p><b>District 5, 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to redistricting neighborhood into Queens district</li> <li>• Echoes Inez Dickens re connectivity</li> <li>• Should be compact and not oddly shaped</li> <li>• Don't have connectivity</li> <li>• Queens and Manhattan are connected by Queensboro bridge – can't reach Roosevelt Island from that bridge</li> <li>• Tramway – no way to get to Queens by the tramway</li> <li>• Queens is connected to Roosevelt Island by bridge at 36<sup>th</sup> Ave - isn't even in 26 – no connection to Manhattan</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ferry Service does connect but only Roosevelt Island and Long Island City are in the district</li> <li>• F train – but still not great for connectivity</li> <li>• Seniors will have hard time getting to council office</li> </ul>
<b>Roosevelt Island Group</b>		
Joyce Short		<p><b>District 5/26</b> <b>Roosevelt Island</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community was built to give low-income families affordable homes in Manhattan</li> <li>• Population is diverse – socioeconomically, religions, etc.</li> <li>• One of safest areas in Manhattan</li> <li>• Identify as Manhattan neighborhood</li> <li>• Need funds that Manhattan council members supply to run nonprofits and create quality of life</li> <li>• Tramway is in Manhattan (4 min ride)</li> <li>• Only contiguous connection with district 26 is a Ferry that can be an hour wait</li> <li>• Tramway needs Manhattan permits for maintenance, repairs, improvements</li> <li>• Both sides of tram must be in same district in Manhattan</li> </ul>
Barbara Parker		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This change will not work for Roosevelt Island or Queens</li> <li>• Different interests and needs</li> <li>• Would be losing council person that understands Roosevelt Island</li> </ul>
Dr. Doris Djoric?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No connection to Queens</li> </ul>
Ellen Palavy?	<p>Manhattan Community Board 8</p> <p>Roosevelt Island Community Coalition</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep Roosevelt Island with district 5 Manhattan</li> <li>• Strong roots to Manhattan, no roots to Queens</li> <li>• Community of interest</li> <li>• Tram</li> <li>• Queens doesn't know their issues</li> <li>• Inaccessible to Queens</li> <li>• No easy access to Julie Won's office</li> <li>• Shared history with Manhattan</li> </ul>



## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

Alex Bores	Democratic nominee for State Assembly – District 73	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Roosevelt Island is part of Manhattan</li> <li>• East side of Manhattan is part of Manhattan</li> <li>• Shouldn't be able to be on skybridge and be in two districts – keep Hunter College main campus in one district</li> </ul>
Margaret Lehman		<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft for 5 and 26</li> <li>• Funding would be unbalanced</li> <li>• Community would be marginalized</li> <li>• Would not be well represented</li> </ul>
Charles Warren	Community Board 8 *Testifying in individual capacity	<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft does not conform with charter</li> <li>• UES – historic districts and different zoning and very different from 26</li> <li>• Council member for 26 would have difficulty adequately representing Roosevelt Island and UES</li> <li>• Community Board 8 has resolution with proposed map</li> </ul>
Anita McDonough?		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep Hell's Kitchen intact</b></li> <li>• Opposed to draft map for Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• UES representative could not understand needs and wants of Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Splitting neighborhoods would dilute voice</li> </ul>
Valerie Mason	East 72 <sup>nd</sup> St. Neighborhood Association	<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft does not work for anyone – violates charter</li> <li>• No contiguity</li> <li>• District 4 draft also doesn't work – goes up FDR – doesn't connect StuyTown to UES</li> <li>• Look at community board 8's unanimously passed resolution that puts forth solution for 4, 5 with least amount of disruption</li> </ul>
Alida Camp	Community Board 8 Manhattan *Testifying individually	<p><b>District 4, 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft plan does not work for 4, 5</li> <li>• Violates charter and would cause harm to communities on UES</li> <li>• District 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creates noncontiguous and oddly shaped district</li> <li>• North of 59<sup>th</sup> St.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• StuyTown not connected – FDR is only connection</li> <li>• District 5</li> <li>• Community of interest – congestion pricing – impact on businesses – these concerns not shared with 26</li> <li>• Community Board 8 submitted map</li> </ul>
Al Sapienza		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft doesn't make sense</li> <li>• When redistrict city, put the people first, put the taxpayer first, not the political party or outcome of election</li> <li>• Can't break up neighborhoods</li> <li>• Keep neighborhoods cohesive</li> <li>• Harlem, Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Not ethical, not good for people</li> <li>• UES – medical institutions, large property taxes – nothing in common with Sunnyside</li> </ul>
Shannon Murkowski?		<p><b>District 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't move three of UES schools to 26             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• PS 183 would now be in 26</li> <li>• Council member would represent school but not most of the families who send kids to those schools</li> </ul> </li> <li>• representative be busy with Queens issues</li> <li>• They work well with current council member in 5</li> </ul>
Sheila O'Connor		<p><b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Neighbors support each other and work together</li> <li>• Mostly represented by one district currently and it's essential that it stay that way</li> <li>• Would be disaster to divide neighborhood</li> <li>• Diverse community that is one and deserves to be kept together</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map for district 3</li> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> </ul>
Donna Veronica Gill		<p><b>Harlem</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Echoes Dr. Dukes</li> <li>• Harlem's plurality is paramount</li> </ul>
Gregory Christopher Baggett	A. Philip Randolph Square	<b>District 9 - Harlem</b>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

	Neighborhood Alliance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Preserve Harlem's cultural and historic integrity through proposed lines</li> <li>• Modification to first draft as well as Unity Map <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Taking out Lakeview, can add Taft development</li> <li>• Could also add Manhattanville development – increases community of interest in district 9</li> <li>• Both developments use resources in 9</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Communities of interest not only based on race</li> </ul>
Julina Dun?		<b>Harlem</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• cost of living concerns, housing costs</li> <li>• Don't dilute voice</li> <li>• Don't break up communities</li> </ul>
William Stanford		<b>District 7</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Above 181<sup>st</sup> St. in Manhattan river to river</li> </ul> <b>District 10</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 181<sup>st</sup> to 155<sup>th</sup> St. river to river</li> </ul>
Marie Charles?	Harlem East Block Association  Miss NY 2022	<b>District 9</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports draft map</li> <li>• Keep 116 to 124 from east side to Park Ave to 5<sup>th</sup> Ave intact</li> <li>• Include with district 9, Central Harlem</li> <li>• Have traditionally maintained close relationship with nearby blocks and tenant associations</li> </ul>
Marco Tamayo		<b>District 5</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft for district 5</li> <li>• New 26 district would not serve communities</li> <li>• Should adopt Community Board 8's recommendation for 5</li> </ul>
Julius Tajudeen?	Preserve Harlem's Legacy	<b>District 9</b> <b>Hands off Harlem</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted VRA section 5 – inoperable under Shelby v. Holder. And noted section 2 – enforcement of 15<sup>th</sup> Amendment</li> <li>• Redistricting is voting rights matter – supersedes charter</li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Protect voting rights of Black citizens in district 9</li> <li>• Clarified “plurality” and “majority”</li> <li>• District 9 is plurality</li> <li>• VRA is concerned with Black citizenship</li> <li>• Doesn’t matter what census says</li> <li>• Still has majority in 9 so has right to elect candidate of choosing</li> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> </ul>
Cynthia Gardstein		<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sutton Place South</li> <li>• Supports map submitted by Community Board 8</li> <li>• Will submit testimony</li> <li>• Guidelines that shall be met <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep communities and neighborhoods whole</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Don’t divide Sutton Place and Sutton Place South and Roosevelt Island and various streets and neighborhoods from 5 and move across to 26</li> </ul>
Dale Nelson	161 <sup>st</sup> St. Block St. Association	<p><b>District 7</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Save the 160s</b></li> <li>• Lower 160s should remain part of 7 and not become part of 10</li> <li>• 7’s northern border should extend at least to 165 west of Fort Washington Ave. and 163 west of Broadway</li> <li>• Washington Heights = heart of 7</li> <li>• Have been able to elect representatives that understand community and address needs</li> <li>• 165 – 158 St. = tightknit community</li> </ul>
Francesco Martinez		<p><b>District 7</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Save the 160s</b></li> <li>• Protect Latino vote</li> <li>• Noted same borders as above for district 7</li> <li>• Do not dilute Latino vote or pack into single district</li> </ul>
Rosanna Giacalone?	45 Sutton Place South	<p><b>District 4 / 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Violates charter criteria</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

## New York Census and Redistricting Institute

	Community District 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Neighborhoods and communities of interest not kept intact</li> <li>• Not compact</li> <li>• Extreme crossover</li> <li>• Oddly shape</li> <li>• Communities would not receive attention or funding – would make up only 27% of district 26</li> <li>• Parks would be separated from residents who enjoy them</li> <li>• Supports Community Board 8 plan</li> </ul>
Robert Berliner		<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sutton Place</li> <li>• Comparing Queens side of 26 to proposed Manhattan side <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Different education level, income, age, home value, etc.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Large disparity between the two locations</li> <li>• Would lump together areas of conflicting interests, different needs, different city services</li> <li>• Concerns re East River Esplanade, congestion prices</li> <li>• Proposed plan for 26 needs to be reconsidered</li> </ul>
Joseph Hyde		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Keep Hell's Kitchen whole</b></li> <li>• Supports Unity Map for Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Don't break up Hell's Kitchen into three parts</li> <li>• Would lose ability to advocate for neighborhood successfully</li> <li>• Issues in neighborhood are getting worse and worse</li> </ul>
Mark Horstein		<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft for 5/26</li> <li>• Demographic differences in Queens 26 vs Manhattan - doesn't make sense</li> <li>• Echoed Berliner above re demographics</li> <li>• 5 has different needs</li> <li>• Would be minority in 26</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

Nalyse Seymour?		<p><b>Keep Hell's Kitchen Whole</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Don't divide into three parts</li> <li>• Unnecessary change that will make issues related to housing, race, gender, diversity more difficult</li> <li>• Keeps all of Chelsea in CD 3 but divides Hell's Kitchen</li> <li>• Hispanic, Black, Asian populations in Hell's Kitchen would be diluted</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> </ul>
John Keller	Manhattan Community Board 6	<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports resolution passed by Community Board 6 and 8</li> <li>• Potential impact on five schools currently in district 5</li> <li>• Local representation for schools is important</li> <li>• Submitted written testimony</li> </ul>
Lo Vandervo?	Carnegie Hill Neighbors on UES	<p><b>District 5 / 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to preliminary plan for cross borough district 26</li> <li>• Agree with community board 8 letter to commission</li> <li>• Violates charter</li> <li>• Hunter College 68<sup>th</sup>/Lex – split in half</li> <li>• Roosevelt Island would be taken away from Manhattan 5 – has always been a part of Manhattan</li> <li>• Take a look at proposal from Community Board 8</li> </ul>

Queens		
Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Jo-Ann Yoo	Asian American Federation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Language access is an important issue for Asian Americans – need to keep communities together</li> <li>• Richmond Hill and Ozone Park – marginalized bc voice is divided every election cycle into multiple districts</li> <li>• Draft splits into four districts</li> <li>• Growing Nepali and Tibetan populations in Woodside</li> </ul>

**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Korean community of Bayside</li> <li>• Both Asian communities of interest – have been split up</li> <li>• Violates charter</li> <li>• Supports Unity Map - VRA/charter</li> <li>• Process has been confusing re registering for testimony</li> </ul>
Jessica Cardenas?		<p><b>District 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Opposed to draft for 26</li> <li>• Woodside Queens</li> <li>• Latinx community, immigrants</li> <li>• Feel no one has reached out to community to translate</li> <li>• Noted Census issues during pandemic</li> <li>• Noted need for a hospital</li> </ul>

Witness Name	Organization(s)	Testimony
Jumaane Williams	NYC Public Advocate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Noted history of packing and cracking</li> <li>• Keep communities of interest intact</li> <li>• Need to prioritize fair and accurate representation for all New Yorkers – prioritizing people who have experienced most marginalization in the past</li> <li>• Transparency is key</li> <li>• Concerns his office has received:                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bronx – Yemeni community split between 13 and 15</li> <li>• Brooklyn – Latinx community in 38 are divided into two districts</li> <li>• Queens – 26 crossing into Manhattan</li> <li>• Manhattan – several blocks removed from district 9 and placed in 8</li> <li>• Brooklyn – 45 – concern re district changing – looks like it may lose some Black residents and pick up some orthodox Jewish communities – could dilute voice for both communities</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Lack of engagement from communities like 16 and 17 - Should provide more opportunities for communities to engage</p>

New York Census and Redistricting Institute

<p>Isabelle Muhlbauer</p>	<p>LatinoJusticePRLDEF  Unity Coalition</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unity Map</li> <li>• Protect coalition districts</li> <li>• <b>District 38</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• district where Latinx community has shown ability to effectively elect candidates of their choice</li> <li>• adopt Unity Map for 38 that does not split Sunset Park or remove Red Hook</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>District 7</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Adopt Unity Map version of 7 which keeps the voting power of Latinx voters intact by keeping Latinx community of 168<sup>th</sup> St. and west of Broadway in 7</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>District 8</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Adopt Unity Map for 8 which keeps La Marqueta in 8 and does not displace sitting council member for community</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<p>Asher Ross</p>	<p>New York Immigration Coalition Action</p>	<p>Proposed lines</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• split communities of color in Woodside, Ridgewood, and Richmond Hill in Queens</li> <li>• And Kensington in Brooklyn</li> <li>• And Red Hook and Sunset Park</li> </ul> <p><b>District 38</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• draft eliminates district with large plurality people of color – historically strong representation from Latino elected officials</li> </ul> <p><b>District 26</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• plurality Asian district is changed to having large white plurality</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Keep immigrant communities and communities of color whole</li> </ul>
<p>Lurie Daniel Favors</p>	<p>Center for Law and Social Justice – Medgar Evers College  Unity Map Coalition</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unity Map – adheres to VRA and charter</li> <li>• Protects racial and language minorities to fullest extent of the law</li> <li>• Adheres to charter in correct ranked order</li> <li>• Protecting communities of interest = primary goal</li> </ul> <p><u>Brooklyn</u></p>



**New York Census and Redistricting Institute**

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ocean Hill must be kept whole</li> <li>• Important to also think about the future of populations in districts</li> <li>• Take small section of Crown Heights and combine with 35 – to ensure legacy families are able to be maintained</li> <li>• Don't crack districts in Canarsie</li> </ul> <p><u>Bronx</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Appreciate keeping Northern Bronx communities of interest whole</li> <li>• But also need to keep communities of interest whole in Central Bronx</li> </ul> <p><u>Staten Island</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Should not benefit from their exclusionary policies</li> </ul>
<p>Ashley Chen</p>	<p>Chinese American Planning Council (CPC)</p> <p>APA Voice Redistricting Taskforce</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supports Unity Map</li> <li>• Sunset Park – keeps AAPI community and Latinx community whole without diluting voting power – share common concerns – District 38 has historically been represented well by council member</li> <li>• Bensonhurst – AAPI community currently divided into four districts – needs to be kept as whole as possible – unity map does this</li> <li>• LES and Chinatown – keeps in one district</li> </ul>