Immigration and Nationality Law: Problems and Strategies (2018)

Lenni Benson  
*New York Law School, lenni.benson@nyls.edu*

Lindsay Curcio

Veronica Jeffers

Stepehn Yale_Loehr

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books

Recommended Citation

https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/66

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS.
IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY LAW: PROBLEMS AND STRATEGIES

Lenni B. Benson
Professor of Law
New York Law School

Lindsay A. Curcio
Principal, Law Office of Lindsay A. Curcio
Adjunct Professor, New York Law School

Veronica M. Jeffers
Associate at Fragomen, Del Rey, Bernsen & Loewy, LLP
Adjunct Professor, Southwestern Law School

Stephen W. Yale-Loehr
Miller Mayer, LLP
Adjunct Professor of Law, Cornell University Law School
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1 IMMIGRATION LAW IN CONTEXT: EXPLORING THE FOUNDATIONS OF CONSTITUTIONAL POWER AND IMMIGRATION CONTROLS FROM CRIMINAL PENALTIES TO EMPLOYER SANCTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 1.01</td>
<td>WELCOME TO IMMIGRATION LAW</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>What is Immigration Law?</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Much of Immigration Law is Based on the Analysis of Statutes and</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regulations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>The Variety and Forms of Immigration Practice</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[1] Family Law</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[7] Immigration Law Is Everywhere</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Immigration Law as a Form of Administrative Law Practice</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[1] Introduction to the Problem Method</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 1-1: Where Do We Begin? Where Do We Stand?</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[2] Anthony Nimba’s Goal is “citizenship”</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Citizenship at Birth: Born Abroad to U.S. Parents</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Citizenship at Birth: Born in the Territory</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Citizenship by Naturalization</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Citizenship by Naturalization of Your Parents</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Comparative Rights and Obligations of Lawful Permanent Residents</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and U.S. Citizens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Refining Problem 1-1: Celia and Anthony</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 1-1: Notes and Questions</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| § 1.02  | IMMIGRATION LAW AND THE U.S. CONSTITUTION                            | 33   |
| A.      | Where Is the Power?                                                 | 33   |
|         | *Chae Chan Ping v. United States*                                    | 37   |
|         | Notes and Questions                                                  | 40   |
|         | *Fong Yue Ting v. United States*                                     | 42   |
|         | Notes and Questions                                                  | 53   |
| B.      | Sanctions and the Preemption Debate                                  | 54   |
| [1]     | Criminal or Civil Sanctions?                                         | 54   |
| [2]     | Controlling Immigration through Employer Sanctions                  | 57   |
|         | Problem 1-2: The I-9 Audit                                           | 58   |
|         | Problem 1-2: Essential Materials                                     | 58   |
# Table of Contents

Problem 1-2: Notes and Questions .............................................. 58

*Hoffman Plastic Compounds, Inc. v. NLRB* ........................................ 59
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 64
Problem 1-3: Where Do We Stand? ............................................. 66
Problem 1-3: Essential Materials .................................................. 66

*Chamber of Commerce of the United States v. Whiting* ................. 74
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 98

C. State Criminal Sanctions .......................................................... 102

*Arizona v. United States* ............................................................. 102
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 119

---

## Chapter 2  
**IMMIGRATION POWER: FINDING THE DIVIDING LINES** .................................................. 123

§ 2.01 RIGHTS AND PROCEDURES AT THE BORDER .............................................. 123

A. The Statutes and Regulations Guarding the Border ...................... 123

B. The Inspection Process .............................................................. 125

[1] Note on the Workload of the CBP ........................................... 125

[2] Factual Background for the Problems 2-1 to 2-5 ....................... 127

Problem 2-1: Joseph Brown (Lawful Permanent Resident) and Debbie Brown (U.S. Citizen) .......................................................... 130

Problem 2-1: Essential Materials .................................................. 131
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 131

C. Admission and the Nonimmigrant Visa Entrant ......................... 137

Problem 2-2: Pierre Abdullah (Nonimmigrant Worker) ................... 137

Problem 2-2: Essential Materials .................................................. 139
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 139

*Meng Li v. Eddy* ........................................................................ 140
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 144

[1] Can Expedited Removal Be Challenged After Departure? ............ 144
a. Errors and Challenges to Expedited Removal? .......................... 144
c. National Security and Special Registration .................................. 145
d. From Special Registration to Biometric Screening ....................... 146


[4] Removal as a National Security Risk — INA § 235(c) ................. 149

D. Expedited Removal and the Asylum Seeker .................................. 149

Problem 2-3: Marta Hapta-Selassie (Asylum Seeker) and her Minor Children .......................................................... 149

Problem 2-3: Essential Materials .................................................. 150
Notes and Questions ................................................................... 150
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Credible Fear and the Complexity of the Process</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Does Anyone at the Border Have the Right to Counsel?</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2.02</td>
<td>CONSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS: RIGHTS AT THE BORDER</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Exploring the Scope of Due Process</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Yamataya v. Fisher</em></td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>The Nature of Administrative Hearings and Some Measure of Due Process</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>United States ex rel. Knauff v. Shaughnessy</em></td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Alternatives to Expedited Removal — Regular Removal Proceedings</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Landon v. Plasencia</em></td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2.03</td>
<td>CROSSING INTO THE INTERIOR? RIGHTS WITHIN THE U.S. TERRITORY</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem 2-4: Constitutional Analysis of Expanded Expedited Removal</td>
<td>189</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem 2-5: National Security Needs?</td>
<td>190</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>191</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Materials for Problems 2-4 and 2-5</td>
<td>191</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>209</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 2.04</td>
<td>REVISITING THE DIVIDING LINES</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>The Role of Detention at the Border</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Clark v. Suarez Martinez</em></td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Arrest, Detention, and Rights for Everyone or No One?</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem 2-6: Retesting Dividing Lines</td>
<td>232</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem 2-6: Essential Materials</td>
<td>234</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>234</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3</td>
<td>NONIMMIGRANT VISAS AND MAINTAINING STATUS IN THE UNITED STATES</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 3.01</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Nonimmigrant Status and the Issue of Nonimmigrant Intent</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Nonimmigrant Intent</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of Contents

**Lauvik v. INS** .......................................................... 242
  Notes and Questions .................................................. 244

[2] The Department of State 30/60 Day Rule .......................... 245
[3] Changed Circumstances ............................................... 246
[4] Special Rules for Immediate Relatives ............................... 246

*In re Ibrahim* .......................................................... 246

**Brownwell v. Carija** ................................................ 248

**B.** The Issue of Temporariness ....................................... 251

**C.** The Issue of Activity: The Foreign National’s Plans and Choosing the Right Nonimmigrant Visa Classification ....................... 253

§ 3.02 **EXPLORING THE NONIMMIGRANT CATEGORIES** ............... 255

**A.** Short-Term Visitors: B-1/B-2, VWP, C-1 and D ................. 255
  [1] Temporary Visitors — B-1/B-2 and VWP ................................ 255
  [2] Travelers in Transit or TWOV (C-1, C-2, C-3) ...................... 256
  [3] Crewmen (D-1, D-2) .................................................. 256

**B.** Students, Exchange Visitors, and Trainees: F-1, M-1, J-1 and H-3 .... 257
  [1] Academic Students (F-1) ............................................. 257
  [2] Vocational Students (M-1) .......................................... 259
  [3] Exchange Visitors (J-1) ............................................. 259
  [4] Trainees (H-3) ....................................................... 261

**C.** Temporary Workers (H-1B, H-2A, H-2B, L-1, O-1) and Treaty Nationals (E-1/E-2, TN, H-1B1, E-3) ..................... 261
  [1] Specialty Occupations (H-1B) ..................................... 261
  [2] Temporary Agricultural or Non-Agricultural Workers (H-2A, H-2B) ... 262

**D.** Intracompany Transferees (L-1) .................................. 262

**E.** Individuals of Extraordinary Ability (O-1) ....................... 263

**F.** Treaty Traders/Treaty Investors (E-1/E-2) ....................... 263

**G.** Miscellaneous Treaty Nationals: U.S.-Canada-Mexico (TN), U.S.-Singapore-Chile (H-1B1), U.S.-Australia (E-3) .................. 265
  [1] U.S.-Canada-Mexico (TN) .......................................... 265
  [2] U.S.-Singapore-Chile (H-1B1) and U.S.-Australia (E-3) ............ 269

**H.** Uncommon Classifications: R, U, T and S ........................ 270
  [1] Religious Workers (R-1) ............................................. 270
  [2] Victims of Domestic Violence (U-1) ................................ 270
  [3] Victims of Trafficking in Persons (T-1) ............................ 270
  [4] Witnesses and Informants (S-5, S-6) ................................ 271

**I.** There is No “Catch-All” Temporary Visa Category .................. 271

§ 3.03 **Strategic Use of the Nonimmigration Categories** ............ 273

**A.** Background for Problems .......................................... 273

xii
# Table of Contents

B. Multiple Options for the Business Executive ................................. 274
   Problem 3-1: Manuel Hayek, CEO of Manzana Computers, S.A., Now CFO of Az-Tech, International ............................. 274
   Problem 3-1: Essential Materials ........................................ 275

   [1] Visitors for Pleasure ............................................. 275
       In re Healy .................................................................... 275
       Notes and Questions .................................................. 280

       In re Hira ...................................................................... 281
       In re Minei ..................................................................... 284
       Notes and Questions .................................................... 285

   [3] Counseling Your Client ............................................... 285


C. Categories Based on Educational Training or Skills .......................... 289
   Problem 3-2: Edgar Smith & Sherry Kit .................................. 289
   Problem 3-2: Essential Materials .......................................... 290
   Problem 3-2: Notes and Questions ........................................ 291
   In re Michael Hertz Associates ............................................ 292
   Young China Daily v. Chappell .............................................. 294
   In re [The Case of the Specialty Occupation and the L.A. Auto Show] ................................................................. 297
   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 303
   In re [The Case of the Unevaluated Foreign Degree] ................. 304
   In re Sea, Inc. ...................................................................... 307
   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 311

   [1] Single vs. Multiple Job Sites and the LCA Requirement .......... 315
   In re [The Case of the Missing Labor Condition Applications] .... 315

   Notes and Questions .......................................................... 319

D. Looking for Nonimmigrant Visa Options: Country Specific .......... 320
   [3] Effect of Corporate Reorganization on Maintenance of H-1B Status ................................................................. 324

E. Maintaining Status in the United States ....................................... 325
   [1] General Requirements .................................................. 325
   [2] Extending or Changing Status ......................................... 325

F. Maintaining Status Under Special Circumstances .......................... 326
   [1] Leaves of Absence ...................................................... 326
   [2] Benching ..................................................................... 327
   [3] Severance ................................................................. 327
# Table of Contents

| [4] Liability for Transportation Costs | 328 |
| G. Nonimmigrant Categories for Other Workers | 329 |
| Problem 3-2-2: What About Sherry Kit? | 329 |
| Problem 3-2-2: Notes and Questions | 329 |
| H. Multinational Transfer and the Benefits of Global Business Enterprise | 331 |
| Problem 3-3: Alejandra Martinez and her Spouse José | 331 |
| Problem 3-3: Essential Materials | 332 |
| Problem 3-3: Notes and Questions | 333 |
| In re | 334 |
| Notes and Questions | 343 |
| Problem 3-4: Maria Lopez | 346 |
| Problem 3-4: Essential Materials | 346 |
| In re Walsh | 347 |
| Notes and Questions | 354 |
| In re [The Case of the Training Program That Lacked a Curriculum] | 355 |
| Notes and Questions | 359 |

§ 3.04 WEAIVING NONIMMIGRANT AND IMMIGRATION OPTIONS — THINKING AHEAD | 360 |
A. Temporary Options That Anticipate the Future | 360 |
| Problem 3-5: Samuel Moore and Lily Maxwell | 360 |
| Problem 3-5: Essential Materials | 361 |
| B. Family-Based Nonimmigrant Visa Classifications | 362 |
| [1] Who Qualifies as a Fiancé(e)? | 362 |
| [2] Legally Able and Actually Willing to Marry | 363 |
| In re [The Case of the Missing First Husband] | 363 |
| [3] The Petitioner and Beneficiary Must Have Met in Person Within Two Years Before Filing the Petition | 364 |
| In re [The Case of the Proxy Marriage] | 364 |
| C. Change of Status: Moving from One Temporary Category to Another | 366 |
| Bitar v. United States Dep't of Justice | 368 |
| Notes and Questions | 371 |
| D. Options for the Talented, the Entrepreneurial, the Extraordinary | 371 |
| Problem 3-6: Luis Marini | 371 |
| Problem 3-6: Essential Materials | 372 |
| Problem 3-6: Notes and Questions | 372 |
| In re [The Case of Extraordinary Ability in the Arts and Entertainment: Distinction] | 373 |
| In re [The Case of Extraordinary Ability in Business: Rising to the Very Top of Your Field] | 376 |
| Notes and Questions | 381 |

§ 3.05 EXPLORING UNCOMMON NONIMMIGRANT VISAS | 381 |
Table of Contents

A. Religious Workers (R-1) ............................................. 381
   Problem 3-7: A Wing and a Prayer: Religious Workers and Journalists
       (Isaiah Nimba and Patrick Ogedengbe) .......................... 381
   Problem 3-7: Essential Materials .................................. 382
   Problem 3-7: Notes and Questions ................................. 382
B. Exceptional Categories for Victims of Crime ..................... 383
   Problem 3-8: Eating Your Cake and Having it Too: Shaun
       Caggiano ....................................................... 383
   Problem 3-8: Essential Materials .................................. 384
   Gail Pendleton, \textit{Winning U Visas After the Regulations} ...... 384
   Problem 3-8: Notes and Questions .................................. 388
   Problem 3-9: The Maid Who Saw and Felt Too Much: Carmen
       Caragay ......................................................... 390
   Problem 3-9: Essential Materials .................................. 391
   Problem 3-9: Notes and Questions .................................. 391

Chapter 4 IMMIGRANTS AND PATHS TO PERMANENT RESIDENT STATUS .............. 393

§ 4.01 INTRODUCTION: CHOOSING A STRATEGY .......................... 393
A. Immigrants Versus Nonimmigrants .................................. 393
B. Background for Problems: Az-Tech Six Months Later .......... 393
C. Finding the Right Petitioner ....................................... 394
   Overview: Immigrant Visa Classifications and the Numerical
   Restrictions? ...................................................... 395
D. Immediate Relatives .................................................. 396
E. Other Family-Sponsored Immigrants ................................ 396
F. Employer-Sponsored Immigrants .................................... 397

§ 4.02 THE FAMILY-BASED CATEGORIES .................................. 400
A. Immediate Relatives: Who Qualifies as an Immediate Relative? 400
   Family Defined .................................................... 401
   [1] Definition of “Child” ............................................. 402
       \textit{Fiallo v. Bell} .............................................. 402
       Notes and Questions ............................................ 414
       Problem 4-1: Max: Sam’s Son and Lily’s Soon-to-be Stepson 415
       Problem 4-1: Essential Materials ................................ 416
       Problem 4-1: Notes and Questions ............................... 416
       Notes and Questions ............................................ 419
       \textit{In re Li} ...................................................... 419
       Notes and Questions ............................................ 424
       DOS on International Adoption via B-2 in Lieu of IR3/4 ...... 426
# Table of Contents

[3] Definition of Parents .................................................. 428
   *Medina-Morales v. Ashcroft* ........................................ 428
   Notes and Questions .................................................. 430

[4] Definition of Spouse .................................................. 431
   Problem 4-2: Celia and Anthony Nimba ................................ 431
   Problem 4-2: Essential Materials .................................... 432
   Problem 4-2: Notes and Questions .................................... 432
   *United States v. Orellana-Blanco* .................................. 432


C. Processing Issues ...................................................... 439
   [1] Nonimmigrant vs. Immigrant Intent ............................... 439
   [2] The Personal Interview ............................................. 439
   [4] Processing Time Delays ............................................. 440
   [5] Death of the Petitioner ............................................ 440

D. Conditional Lawful Permanent Resident Status Generally .......... 440
   [1] The CLPR Spouse .................................................. 441
   [4] How Important Is It That the Marriage Was Entered into in "Good Faith"? .................................................. 442
      *De Rodriguez v. Holder* ............................................ 443
      Problem 4-3: Maria Lopez ........................................... 448
      Problem 4-3: Essential Materials .................................. 449
      Problem 4-3: Notes and Questions .................................. 449

E. Family-Based and Employment-Based Preference Categories, and Understanding the Visa Bulletin .................................. 452
   [1] What Is the Visa Bulletin and Learning How to Read It ........ 452
      State Dep't. Releases November Visa Numbers; Explains Employment Based Retrogression .......................... 459

F. Employment-Based Preference Categories ................................ 461
   [1] Introduction ....................................................... 461
# Table of Contents


Problem 4-4: Maria Lopez (Revisited) ............................................. 478

Problem 4-4: Notes and Questions ................................................... 479

Problem 4-5: Alejandra Martinez and her Husband José ....................... 480

Problem 4-5: Essential Materials ...................................................... 480

Problem 4-5: Notes and Questions ................................................... 481

*In re Cleveland Municipal School District* ...................................... 481

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 485

Problem 4-6: Can Alejandra Qualify for Eb-2 Classification With her Bachelor's Degree? .......................................................... 485

*In re Delitizer Corp. of Newton* ..................................................... 485

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 487


Problem 4-7: Edgar Smith [And Sherry Kit] ........................................ 488

Problem 4-7: Notes and Questions ................................................... 489

§ 4.03 WHEN CAN LABOR CERTIFICATION BE WAIVED? ......................... 490

A. Nation Interest Waivers ............................................................ 490

*In re New York State Dot* .............................................................. 491

B. When Is Labor Certification Not Required? ..................................... 495

Problem 4-8: Manuel Hayek, CEO of Manzana Computers S.A., Now CFO of Az-Tech International ............................................ 496

Problem 4-8: Essential Materials ...................................................... 496

Problem 4-8: Notes and Questions ................................................... 497

*IKEA U.S., Inc. v. United States DOJ INS* ......................................... 497

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 500

Problem 4-9: Carlos, Manuel’s Domestic Partner .................................... 501

Problem 4-9: Essential Materials ...................................................... 501

Problem 4-9: Notes and Questions ................................................... 501

C. Individual Labor Certification ...................................................... 501

Problem 4-10: Father Isaiah Nimba .................................................. 505

Problem 4-10: Essential Materials ...................................................... 505

Problem 4-10: Notes and Questions ................................................... 505

Problem 4-11: Luis Marini ............................................................... 506

Problem 4-11: Essential Materials ...................................................... 507

Problem 4-11: Notes and Questions ................................................... 507

*In re [The Case of the Extraordinary Ad Man]* ................................. 507

Notes and Questions ................................................................. 513

D. EB-5 Investors .............................................................................. 513

*In re Ho* ...................................................................................... 514
Table of Contents

§ 4.04 THE FINAL STEP: IMMIGRANT VISA PROCESSING OR ADJUSTMENT OF STATUS .................................. 520
A. Overview: Completing the Process of Becoming an Immigrant ............................................. 520
B. Immigrant Visa Processing; Exploring Consular Processing ............................................. 521
  [1] Returning Abroad ........................................................................................................... 521
  [2] The Interview .............................................................................................................. 522
  [3] The Decision .............................................................................................................. 522
C. Adjustment of Status ...................................................................................................... 522
  [1] Staying in the United States ....................................................................................... 522
  [3] Traveling on Advance Parole While Pending Adjustment of Status ....................... 523
  [4] The Interview ........................................................................................................... 524
  [5] The Decision ............................................................................................................. 524
Problem 4-12: Anthony Nimba and Celia Guiterrez-Nimba .................................................. 525
Problem 4-12: Essential Materials ...................................................................................... 525
Problem 4-12: Notes and Questions ................................................................................... 526
In re Cavazos ....................................................................................................................... 526
Notes and Questions ......................................................................................................... 528
[6] Inspection and Admission ............................................................................................. 528
  In re Arequinlin ............................................................................................................... 528
[7] Maintaining Status — Critical to Eligibility for Adjustment of Status ......................... 530
  In re Hall ......................................................................................................................... 531
[8] Exceptions to the Bars to Adjustment Found in INA § 245(c): ................................. 533
  Immediate Relatives & Employment-Sponsored Immigrants ..................................... 533
[9] Adjustment of Status Under INA § 245(i) — a Generous Exception that may still be Relevant ................................................................. 534
  Problem 4-13: Pierre Abdullah ...................................................................................... 535
  Problem 4-13: Essential Materials ............................................................................... 535
  Problem 4-13: Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 535

Chapter 5 INADMISSIBILITY: IN EVERY CONTEXT ................. 539

§ 5.01 INADMISSIBILITY: AN INTRODUCTION ......................... 539
§ 5.02 WHERE DOES INADMISSIBILITY OCCUR? ....................... 540
  A. Admission .................................................................................................................. 541
  B. Entry as Opposed to Admission .............................................................................. 543
     Delgadillo v. Carmichael ............................................................................................ 543
     Notes and Questions ................................................................................................. 545
§ 5.03 GROUNDS OF EXCLUSION OR INADMISSIBILITY ........... 546
  A. National Security and Ideology ............................................................................... 546
     Kleindienst v. Mandel .............................................................................................. 547
# Table of Contents

Notes and Questions ........................................ 557

*American Academy of Religion v. Napolitano* ........................................ 557

Notes and Questions ........................................ 566

B. National Security Concerns Expanded ........................................ 567

C. Status and Visa Violators ........................................ 569

1. Problem 5-1: Overstay ........................................ 569
2. Problem 5-1.2: Withdrawal of Admission ........................................ 570
3. Problem 5-1.3: Overstay Bars on Readmission ........................................ 570

D. Unlawful Presence ........................................ 570
1. When Does the Ground of Inadmissibility Apply? ........................................ 570
Notes and Questions ........................................ 571
2. A Waiver of Unlawful Presence Bars ........................................ 572
   *In re X* ........................................ 572
Notes and Questions ........................................ 576

E. Misrepresentation, Fraud, and Other Immigration Violations ........................................ 576
1. The Power of the Fraud Ground ........................................ 576
   Problem 5-2: Fraud and Misrepresentation ........................................ 577
Notes and Questions ........................................ 578
2. Section 212(i) Waiver ........................................ 578

F. Other Immigration Violations ........................................ 578

G. Criminal Grounds ........................................ 579
1. Problem 5-3: Criminal Past ........................................ 579
2. Starting to Analyze a Case with a Criminal Offense Issue ........................................ 580
3. What Is a Conviction? ........................................ 582
4. Admitting Elements of the Crime ........................................ 582
   *In re* ........................................ 582
Notes and Questions ........................................ 585
5. The Categorical Approach or When Can the DHS Look Behind a Conviction? ........................................ 587
6. Circuit Courts of Appeal Are Rejecting the Modified Categorical Approach Used in *Silva-Trevino* ........................................ 588
   *Jean-Louis v. AG of the United States* ........................................ 588
7. More on the Modified Categorical Approach ........................................ 589

H. Other Criminal Offenses ........................................ 599

§ 5.04 EXPLORING WAIVERS ........................................ 600

A. Criteria for the Waiver of Inadmissibility for Nonimmigrants ........................................ 600
   *In re Hranka* ........................................ 600
Notes and Questions ........................................ 601

B. Waivers Continued — Immigrants and Nonimmigrants ........................................ 602
Table of Contents

Problem 5-4: Exploring Waivers for Criminal Grounds ........................................ 602
C. Waivers and Criminal Offenses Redux ..................................................... 603
   In re: [case Involving A 212(h) Waiver] .............................................. 604
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 610
D. More about Waivers ............................................................................ 611

§ 5.05 THE LINK BETWEEN INADMISSIBILITY AND DEPORTATION ........ 612
A. How the Grounds of Inadmissibility Operate at the Border and
   Beyond .................................................................................................. 612
   Problem 5-5: How Inadmissibility can Lead to Removal ......................... 612
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 613
B. The Issue of Admission — Fleuti in the Twenty-First Century .......... 613
C. Lawful Permanent Resident with Conviction Returning to the United States
   after a Short Trip .................................................................................. 614
   Vartelas v. Holder .............................................................................. 614
   Notes and Questions .......................................................................... 625
D. New Relief from the Three and Ten Year Overstay Bars ......................... 625
   [1] Travel with Advance Parole .............................................................. 625
   In re Arrabally and Yerrabelly ............................................................. 626

Chapter 6 DEPORTABILITY AND THE REMOVAL PROCESS ............ 635

§ 6.01 THE POWER TO REMOVE ................................................................. 635
A. Introduction to Deportation .................................................................. 635
B. A Civil Sanction .................................................................................... 637
C. The Consequences of Greater Removal Enforcement ......................... 637
D. Removal: Deportation Compared with Inadmissibility ......................... 639
   Problem 6-1 ......................................................................................... 639
   Problem 6-1: Essential Materials .......................................................... 639
   Problem 6-1: Notes and Questions .......................................................... 640
   [1] Compare These Time Limits for People Ordered Removed .......... 642

§ 6.02 EXPLORING SOME OF THE GROUNDS OF DEPORTABILITY .... 644
A. Marriage Fraud ..................................................................................... 644
   Problem 6-2: Marriage Fraud (Anthony and Celia) .............................. 644
   Problem 6-2: Essential Materials .......................................................... 644
   Problem 6-2: Notes and Questions .......................................................... 645
B. Violating the Immigration Laws ............................................................. 646
C. Security Related Grounds ...................................................................... 647
   Problem 6-3 ......................................................................................... 647
   Problem 6-3: Essential Materials .......................................................... 648
Table of Contents

Harisiades v. Shaughnessy .......................................................... 648
Problem 6-3: Notes and Questions ............................................. 658

D. Grounds Relating to False Documents and Misrepresentation ............ 660
[1] False Documents at Work .................................................... 660
Problem 6-4 ............................................................................. 660
Problem 6-4: Essential Materials ............................................... 661
Immigration & Naturalization Service v. Lopez-Mendoza ....................... 661
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 675
Flores-Figueroa v. United States .................................................. 676
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 681
In re Barcenas-Barrera ................................................................. 683
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 686

E. Criminal Grounds of Deportability ............................................ 686
[1] The Intersection of Criminal and Immigration Law ......................... 686
Problem 6-5 ............................................................................. 686
Problem 6-5: Essential Materials ............................................... 687
Problem 6-5: Notes and Questions ............................................... 687
Kawashima v. Holder .................................................................. 688
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 698
Singh v. Mukasey ...................................................................... 699
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 707
In re Lakhwinder Singh ................................................................. 708
[2] Conviction Within Time Period Following Admission ....................... 709
[3] Multiple Criminal Convictions ................................................ 709
[4] Aggravated Felony .................................................................. 710

F. Other Criminal Grounds of Deportability .................................... 711
[1] Controlled Substance ............................................................. 711
[2] Firearms ............................................................................. 711
[3] Crimes of Domestic Violence .................................................. 711
[4] Trafficking ........................................................................... 711

§ 6.03 CONVICTIONS AND RELIEF ............................................. 712
Problem 6-5 Revisited: After Conviction ........................................ 712
A. What Is a Conviction? ............................................................. 712
[1] Is Post-conviction Relief Available to Mitigate the Immigration ......... 712
Consequences? ......................................................................... 712
[2] Ineffective Assistance of Counsel in the Immigration Courts ........... 713
In re Lozada .............................................................................. 713
[3] Ineffective Assistance of Counsel in Criminal Courts ...................... 715
Padilla v. Kentucky ..................................................................... 715
Notes and Questions ................................................................ 733
# Table of Contents

§ 6.04 IMMIGRATION PROCEEDINGS ........................................ 734  
A. The Many Forms of Removal Proceedings ...................... 734  
B. The Basics of Section 240 Removal Procedures ............ 737  
[1] The Executive Office for Immigration Review ............ 737  
[3] The Right to Counsel ........................................... 739  
[4] Informal Rules of Evidence and No Formal Discovery .... 739  
[5] The Move to Video Hearings .................................. 741  
§ 6.05 DETENTION RELATING TO REMOVAL PROCEEDINGS ......... 741  
A. Detention and Bond .............................................. 741  
   In re Patel ....................................................... 743  
B. Parole .............................................................. 744  
   Problem 6-6 ....................................................... 744  
C. Detention and the Constitution ................................ 744  
   Demore v. Hyung Joon Kim .................................... 745  
[1] Detention Issues ............................................... 762  
§ 6.06 EXECUTING AN ORDER OF REMOVAL ......................... 765  
A. Final Steps in the Removal Process ......................... 765  
B. Stays of Removal ............................................... 765  
C. Basics of Judicial Review of Removal ...................... 766  

## Chapter 7 RELIEF FROM REMOVAL .................................. 767  

§ 7.01 RELIEF FROM REMOVAL ...................................... 767  
   Problem 7-1: Exploring Various Forms of Relief from Removal ........................................... 768  
   Problem 7-1: Essential Materials ............................ 769  
   Akinsade v. Holder ............................................... 771  
   Notes and Questions ............................................ 779  
A. Derivative Citizenship, INA §§ 320, 322; 8 U.S.C. §§ 1431, 1433 ........................................... 779  
B. Naturalization, INA § 316; 8 U.S.C. § 1427 ................ 780  
C. Limited Relief When Individuals Are Subject to Some Criminal Grounds of Removability ............ 780  
   Notes and Questions ............................................ 780  
D. Waivers as a Remedy To Removal ............................ 781  
   In re Emeka Kenneth Abosi .................................... 781  
   Notes and Questions ............................................ 783  
E. Adjustment of Status as a Form of Relief .................. 783  
   Notes and Questions ............................................ 784  
F. Nonimmigrant Visa and a Waiver ............................ 785  
G. Asylum, Withholding, and Convention Against Torture Relief ........................................... 785
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Section 212(c): An Old Waiver with a Long Life and the Exercise of Discretion</td>
<td>790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Using a Waiver to Obtain Relief in Removal</td>
<td>790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INS v. St. Cyr</td>
<td>791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Expanding the 212(c) Waiver to Removal Cases</td>
<td>801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jutilang v. Holder</td>
<td>802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>813</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In re Marin</td>
<td>813</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Convention Against Torture and Deferral of Removal</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 7-3</td>
<td>819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 7-3: Essential Materials</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Cancellation of Removal Part B</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Hardship</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In re Monreal-Aguinaga</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In re Recinas</td>
<td>830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Children as Qualifying Relatives for Cancellation of Removal</td>
<td>835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In re Isidro-Zamorano</td>
<td>836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.</td>
<td>Relief for Victims of Domestic Violence</td>
<td>839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.</td>
<td>Voluntary Departure</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.</td>
<td>Special Immigrant Juvenile Status</td>
<td>841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 7-4: Carmen's Journey</td>
<td>842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 7-4: Essential Materials</td>
<td>843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In re: Petitioner: Jose A. Menjivar</td>
<td>844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.02</td>
<td>DEFERRED ACTION AND PROSECUTORIAL DISCRETION</td>
<td>847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Prosecutorial Discretion</td>
<td>847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals</td>
<td>848</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 7.03</td>
<td>ADDITIONAL FORMS OF RELIEF</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Special Situations or Limited Forms of Relief</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>U and T Nonimmigrant Visas</td>
<td>849</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Private Bills ........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3]</td>
<td>Registry ..............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4]</td>
<td>Temporary Protected Status .........................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[6]</td>
<td>Nicaraguan Adjustment and Central American Relief Act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## B. What Is Missing? .................................. 853

## Chapter 8 ASYLUM AND RELIEF FOR PEOPLE SEEKING REFUGE ............ 855

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 8.01</th>
<th>INTRODUCTION: REFUGEES AND ASYLEES .................. 855</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 8-1: Applying for Refugee Status at Home ... 856</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Trends in Refugee Admissions ........................ 858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Congressional Research Service: Refugee Admissions and Resettlement Policy ... 858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>Different President, Different Refugee Admission Numbers? ... 861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Presidential Memorandum — Fiscal Year 2012 Refugee Admissions Numbers and Authorizations of In-Country Refugee Status</em> ... 861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Refugee Processing Priorities, from U.S. Dep’t of State, <em>Proposed Refugee Admissions for Fiscal Year 2012: Report to the Congress</em> ... 863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions .................................... 868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>In Country Processing ................................ 869</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1]</td>
<td>Special Circumstances — Special Procedures .......... 869</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2]</td>
<td>How Do You Help a Political Dissident Within the Dissident’s Home Country? ... 872</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>§ 8.02</th>
<th>COMPARING ASYLUM AND WITHHOLDING OF REMOVAL .......... 873</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Standards of Proof: Asylum Versus Withholding of Removal ... 874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>INS v. Cardoza-Fonseca</em> ................................ 875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions ...................................... 878</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>INS v. Elias-Zacarias</em> ................................ 879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions ...................................... 884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 8-2: Testing Nexus ................................ 885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 8-3: The Continued Journey of Marta Hapta-Selassie and her Daughters ... 887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 8-3: Notes and Questions ....................... 889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem 8-3: Essential Materials ....................... 890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>In re Kasinga</em> ........................................ 891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions ...................................... 899</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

## B. Understanding Social Group and Eligibility for Asylum
- [2] The DHS Position May Be Evolving Toward Recognition .................................................. 902
- [3] Gender Based Violence and Membership in a Particular Social Group .................................. 903
- [5] Sexual Minorities and the Theory of Particular Social Group ............................................. 904

## C. What is Persecution?
- [1] Persecution Definition Developed Through Caselaw ....................................................... 906
  - In re Chang ............................................................................................................................ 907
  - Notes and Questions ............................................................................................................. 912
  - Problem 8-4: The Role of the Government Trial Attorney .................................................. 913
  - Problem 8-4: Essential Materials ......................................................................................... 914
  - In re A-T (I) .......................................................................................................................... 914
  - In re A-T (II) .......................................................................................................................... 919
  - Benyamin v. Holder .............................................................................................................. 922
  - Notes and Questions ............................................................................................................. 928
- [2] Persecution and Statutory Definitions .................................................................................... 929
- [3] Humanitarian Asylum ......................................................................................................... 930

## D. Credibility
- In re J-Y-C ............................................................................................................................ 931
- Problem 8-5: Credibility and the Role of the Government Attorney ......................................... 932
- Problem 8-5: Notes and Questions ......................................................................................... 936

### § 8.03 CONSTRAINTS, LIMITS, CESSATION
- Problem 8-6: Can we Help Former Child Soldiers? ................................................................. 940
- Problem 8-6: Essential Materials ......................................................................................... 941

## A. Persecution of Others
- Negusie v. Holder .................................................................................................................... 942
- Notes and Questions ............................................................................................................. 949

## B. Other Constraints on Asylum Eligibility—Crimes and National Security

## C. Safe Third Country and Resettlement

## D. Prior Denial

## E. Applications Made More Than One-Year After the Applicant’s Entry in the United States

### § 8.04 CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE AND OTHER CRUEL, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT

## A. Torture

## B. Burden of Proof

## C. Withholding Versus Deferral
- Problem 8-7: Convention Against Torture or Other Relief ................................................. 956
Table of Contents

§ 8.05 PROCEDURAL ISSUES
A. Preserving Judicial Review ................................. 971
B. Motions to Reopen ........................................ 971
C. Stays of Removal ........................................... 972

Chapter 9 U.S. CITIZENSHIP AND NATURALIZATION .......... 975

§ 9.01 INTRODUCTION TO U.S. CITIZENSHIP .................. 975
A. What Does it Mean to Be a Citizen of a Country? ............ 975
B. Why Become a U.S. Citizen: “Pros and Cons” of Citizenship . 976
[1] Sponsor Relatives for Permanent Residence ................ 976
[2] Ideological and Cultural Reasons ................................ 976
[3] Practical Reasons ........................................... 977
[4] Legal Rights and Protections ................................ 977
[8] Miscellaneous .............................................. 978

§ 9.02 APPLYING FOR U.S. CITIZENSHIP (NATURALIZATION) .......... 979
A. Anthony Nimba and Celia Gutierrez-Nimba: Citizenship Based On Birth . 979
B. Anthony Nimba: General Naturalization Requirements ...... 980
C. Maria Lopez, the Frequent Flier ................................ 980
D. Maria Lopez: Drunk Driving Conviction ...................... 980
E. Samuel and Lily Moore and Their Baby Boy John ............ 980
F. Notes and Questions ........................................ 980

§ 9.03 OTHER WAYS TO ACQUIRE U.S. CITIZENSHIP .......... 988
A. History of U.S. Citizenship ................................... 988
B. Derivative Citizenship ....................................... 988
# Table of Contents

*United States v. Flores-Villar* .................................................. 989
Notes and Questions .............................................................. 992

Problems 9-6 Through 9-12: Essential Materials ......................... 997
Problem 9-7: Brian the Canadian .............................................. 998
Problem 9-8: Pieter Van Zant .................................................. 999
Problem 9-9: Pieter Van Zant, Redux ........................................ 999
Problem 9-10: Pieter Van Zant’s Father George ............................ 1000
Problem 9-11: Pieter Van Zant’s Mother ................................... 1000
Problem 9-12: Madison Martinez .............................................. 1000
Problem 9-13: Guam and U.S. Citizenship .................................. 1001

Problem 9-14: Joe From Peru .................................................. 1002
Problem 9-15: Joe From Peru, Redux ........................................ 1003
Problem 9-16: Lily Maxwell’s U.S. Citizenship ............................ 1003
Problem 9-17: Mary and James’s Adoption of Frannie .................. 1003
Problems 9-14 Through 9-17: Essential Materials ....................... 1004
Problems 9-14 Through 9-17: Notes and Questions ...................... 1004
*In re Guzman-Gomez* .......................................................... 1004
Notes and Questions ............................................................... 1008

§ 9.04 LOSING CITIZENSHIP STATUS ........................................ 1008
A. Expatriation ................................................................. 1008

[1] Voluntary Renunciation ..................................................... 1008
*Soto v. Rodham-Clinton* ...................................................... 1008
Notes and Questions ............................................................. 1012
Problem 9-18: Catherine Scott, Death and Taxes ......................... 1013
Problem 9-18: Essential Materials .......................................... 1013
Problem 9-18: Notes and Questions ......................................... 1013

[2] Denaturalization ............................................................... 1014
*Kungys v. United States* ...................................................... 1014

§ 9.05 NATURALIZATION AS THE LAST STEP IN THE IMMIGRATION PROCESS ................................................................. 1018
Problem 9-19: Mr. Swanson’s Naturalization Interview .................. 1018
Problem 9-19: Notes and Questions .......................................... 1018

Table of Cases ................................................................. TC-1

Index ................................................................. I-1