

2012

# Problems and Cases on Secured Transactions, 2nd ed (2012)

James Brook

*New York Law School*, [james.brook@nyls.edu](mailto:james.brook@nyls.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac\\_books](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books)

---

## Recommended Citation

Brook, James, "Problems and Cases on Secured Transactions, 2nd ed (2012)" (2012). *Books*. 64.  
[https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac\\_books/64](https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/64)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS.

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

# PROBLEMS AND CASES ON SECURED TRANSACTIONS

**Second Edition**

**James Brook**

*Professor of Law*  
*New York Law School*



**Wolters Kluwer**

Law & Business

RES.  
KP  
1050  
B76  
2012  
C.1

Copyright © 2012 CCH Incorporated.

Published by Wolters Kluwer Law & Business in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. ([www.wolterskluwerlb.com](http://www.wolterskluwerlb.com))

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at [www.wolterskluwerlb.com](http://www.wolterskluwerlb.com), or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail [customer.service@wolterskluwer.com](mailto:customer.service@wolterskluwer.com), call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business  
Attn: Order Department  
PO Box 990  
Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-1359-0

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Brook, James, 1946-

Problems and cases on secured transactions / James Brook. — 2nd ed.

p. cm. — (Aspen casebook series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4548-1359-0 (casebound : alk. paper)

1. Security (Law) — United States — Problems, exercises, etc. 2. Security (Law) — United States — Cases. I. Title.

KF1050.B76 2012

346.7307'4 — dc23

2012022016



SUSTAINABLE  
FORESTRY  
INITIATIVE

Certified Sourcing

[www.sfipprogram.org](http://www.sfipprogram.org)

SFI-01234

SFI label applies to the text stock



# SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<i>Contents</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xxiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>A Special Message on Article 1</i>	xxvii
<i>A Special Message on the 2010 Amendments to Article 9</i>	xxix
Introduction	1

## PART I

### INTRODUCTION TO ARTICLE 9 AND CLASSIFICATION OF COLLATERAL

Chapter 1	The Typical Secured Transaction	11
Chapter 2	Types of Goods	27
Chapter 3	The “Intangibles” and “Quasi-Intangibles”	41
Chapter 4	Types of Investment Property	49

## PART II

### CREATION OF THE ARTICLE 9 INTEREST — ATTACHMENT

Chapter 5	The Security Agreement	61
Chapter 6	“Value” Given and the Debtor’s “Rights In” the Collateral	79
Chapter 7	Introduction to the Purchase-Money Security Interest	97
Chapter 8	Further Issues Regarding the PMSI	113

## PART III

### PROTECTION OF THE ARTICLE 9 INTEREST — PERFECTION

Chapter 9	Introduction to Perfection, Perfection by Filing, and Where to File	129
Chapter 10	The Initial Financing Statement	135
Chapter 11	The Process of Filing	155
Chapter 12	Later Filings and Changes in the Situation	163
Chapter 13	Perfection by Possession	175
Chapter 14	Automatic Perfection — The PMSI in Consumer Goods	187
Chapter 15	Perfection on and Through Instruments and Documents	191
Chapter 16	Perfection by Control	199
Chapter 17	Goods Covered by Certificates of Title	203

## PART IV PRIORITY ISSUES 211

---

Chapter 18	Introduction to Priority and the Basic Rules of Priority	213
Chapter 19	Special Priority for the PMSI	225
Chapter 20	Priority in Investment Property and Deposit Accounts	237
Chapter 21	Fixtures	241
Chapter 22	Claims Arising Under Article 2	267
Chapter 23	Special Issues in Bankruptcy	277

## PART V SALES AND OTHER DISPOSITIONS OF COLLATERAL 295

---

Chapter 24	Does the Interest Survive the Disposition?	297
Chapter 25	What are Proceeds?	325
Chapter 26	Attachment, Perfection, and Priority in Proceeds	333
Chapter 27	Chattel Paper and Account Financing	345

## PART VI FURTHER ON THE SCOPE OF ARTICLE 9 357

---

Chapter 28	Leases of Goods and Article 9	359
Chapter 29	Other Transactions Governed by Article 9	375
Chapter 30	Interests Not Covered by Article 9	389

## PART VII DEFAULT AND ENFORCEMENT 409

---

Chapter 31	Default	411
Chapter 32	Repossession	437
Chapter 33	The Foreclosure Sale	455
Chapter 34	Strict Foreclosure and the Right of Redemption	483

<i>Appendix of Sample Forms</i>	495
<i>Table of Cases</i>	503
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	505
<i>Index</i>	509



# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xxiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>A Special Message on Article 1</i>	xxvii
<i>A Special Message on the 2010 Amendments to Article 9</i>	xxix

<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
A. The Unsecured Creditor	1
B. Bankruptcy Process	4

## PART I

<b>INTRODUCTION TO ARTICLE 9 AND CLASSIFICATION OF COLLATERAL</b>	<b>9</b>
---	----------

<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	
<b>THE TYPICAL SECURED TRANSACTION</b>	<b>11</b>

A. Introduction	11
1. The Problem Presented	11
2. The Concept of Secured Credit	13
3. Necessity as the Mother of Invention	15
4. Enter the Uniform Commercial Code	16
5. The "New" Article 9	18
B. Preparation	20
C. Problems and Cases	20
Problems	20
<i>Brown v. Indiana National Bank</i>	22
Questions on <i>Brown</i>	25
Problem	25

<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	
<b>TYPES OF GOODS</b>	<b>27</b>

A. Introduction	27
B. Preparation	29
C. Problems and Cases	29
Problem	29
Note	30
<i>In re Estate of Joseph M. Silver</i>	30
Question on <i>Silver</i>	32
Problems	32
<i>The Cooperative Finance Association, Inc. v.     B&amp;J Cattle Co.</i>	33

Question on <i>B&amp;J Cattle</i>	35
Problem	35
<i>In Re Palmer</i>	36

### CHAPTER 3 THE "INTANGIBLES" AND "QUASI-INTANGIBLES" 41

A. Introduction	41
B. Preparation	41
C. Problems and Cases	42
Problems	42
<i>Lake Region Credit Union v. Crystal Pure Water, Inc.</i>	45
Problem	47

### CHAPTER 4 TYPES OF INVESTMENT PROPERTY 49

A. Introduction	49
B. Preparation	50
C. Problems and Cases	51
Problem	51
<i>In re Estate of Washburn</i>	52
Problem	53
<i>Securities Investor Protection Corp. v. First Entertainment</i>	
<i>Holding Corp.</i>	54
Problems	57

## PART II

### CREATION OF THE ARTICLE 9 INTEREST—ATTACHMENT 59

### CHAPTER 5 THE SECURITY AGREEMENT 61

A. Introduction	61
B. Preparation	61
C. Problems and Cases	62
Problem	62
<i>In re Yantz</i>	62
Problems	66
<i>Shelby County State Bank v. Van Diest Supply</i>	
<i>Company</i>	67
Problem	72
<i>In re Southern Illinois Rail Car Co.</i>	73
<i>Rice v. Miller</i>	75



**CHAPTER 6****"VALUE" GIVEN AND THE DEBTOR'S "RIGHTS IN" THE COLLATERAL****79**

A. Introduction	79
B. Preparation	79
C. Problems and Cases	80
Problems	80
<i>National Pawn Brokers Unlimited v. Osterman, Inc.</i>	81
Questions on <i>National Pawn Brokers</i>	83
<i>Jerke Construction, Inc. v. Home Federal Savings Bank</i>	84
Question on <i>Jerke Construction</i>	88
A Brief Except on the "Rights In" Requirement	88
<i>Zurita v. SVH-1 Partners, Ltd.</i>	88
<i>Miko Enterprises Inc v. Allegan Nursing Home, LLC</i>	89
Problems	94
Question on § 9-204(b)	95

**CHAPTER 7****INTRODUCTION TO THE PURCHASE-MONEY SECURITY INTEREST****97**

A. Introduction	97
B. Preparation	97
C. Problems and Cases	98
Problems	98
A Brief Note on the Following Two Cases	99
<i>North Platte State Bank v. Production Credit Ass'n</i>	100
<i>General Electric Capital Commercial Automotive Finance, Inc. v. Spartan Motors, Ltd.</i>	104

**CHAPTER 8****FURTHER ISSUES REGARDING THE PMSI****113**

A. Introduction	113
B. Preparation	114
C. Problems and Cases	114
<i>First National Bank of Steeleville, N.A. v. ERB Equipment Co., Inc.</i>	114
Question on <i>First National Bank of Steeleville</i>	118
Problem	118
<i>Lewiston State Bank v. Greenline Equipment, LLC</i>	119
<i>In re Huddle</i>	123



## PART III

## PROTECTION OF THE ARTICLE 9 INTEREST—PERFECTION 127

## CHAPTER 9

## INTRODUCTION TO PERFECTION, PERFECTION BY FILING, AND WHERE TO FILE 129

A. Introduction	129
1. The Nature of “Perfection”	129
2. The Means of Perfection	130
3. Perfection by Filing	130
4. Where to file	131
B. Preparation	132
C. Problems	132
Problems	132

## CHAPTER 10

## THE INITIAL FINANCING STATEMENT 135

A. Introduction	135
B. Preparation	136
C. Problems and Cases	137
Problems	137
<i>In re Miller</i>	138
Question on the <i>Miller</i> case	141
Problems	142
<i>In re C. W. Mining Company</i>	143
Question on the <i>C. W. Mining Case</i>	145
Problem	146
<i>In re Pickle Logging, Inc.</i>	146
<i>Maxus Leasing Group, Inc. v. Kobelco America, Inc.</i>	149
Questions on <i>Pickle Logging and Maxus Leasing Group</i>	152
Problems	152

## CHAPTER 11

## THE PROCESS OF FILING 155

A. Introduction	155
B. Preparation	155
C. Problems and Cases	156
Problems	156
<i>United States of America v. Orrego</i>	157
Questions on <i>Orrego</i>	160
Problems	161

## CHAPTER 12 LATER FILINGS AND CHANGES IN THE SITUATION 163

A. Introduction	163
B. Preparation	165
C. Problems and Cases	166
Problem	166
<i>Barnes v. Turner</i>	167
Problems	170
Note	171
Problems	171

## CHAPTER 13 PERFECTION BY POSSESSION 175

A. Introduction	175
B. Preparation	175
C. Problems and Cases	176
Problem	176
<i>National Pawn Brokers Unlimited v. Osterman, Inc.</i>	177
Problem	179
<i>In re Equitable Financial Management, Inc.</i>	179
Problem	183
Note on the Duties of a Secured Party	
Having Possession	184
Problems	184

## CHAPTER 14 AUTOMATIC PERFECTION — THE PMSI IN CONSUMER GOODS 187

A. Introduction	187
B. Preparation	187
C. Problems	188
Problems	188
Considering the Rule of § 9-309(1)	189
Problems	189

## CHAPTER 15 PERFECTION ON AND THROUGH INSTRUMENTS AND DOCUMENTS 191

A. Introduction	191
B. Preparation	192
C. Problems	192
Problems	192



## **CHAPTER 16**

### **PERFECTION BY CONTROL**

#### **199**

A. Introduction	199
B. Preparation	200
C. Problems	200
Problems	200

## **CHAPTER 17**

### **GOODS COVERED BY CERTIFICATES OF TITLE**

#### **203**

A. Introduction	203
B. Preparation	205
C. Problems and Cases	205
Problems	205
<i>Kevin R. McCarthy, Trustee v. BMW Bank of North America</i>	206
Problem	208
<i>Union Planters Bank, N.A. v. Peninsula Bank</i>	209

## **PART IV**

### **PRIORITY ISSUES**

#### **211**

## **CHAPTER 18**

### **INTRODUCTION TO PRIORITY AND THE BASIC RULES OF PRIORITY**

#### **213**

A. Introduction	213
1. Matters of Priority	213
2. The Secured Party vs. the Lien Creditor	214
3. The Secured Party vs. the Trustee in Bankruptcy	214
4. Secured Party vs. Secured Party	215
5. Where Are the Cases?	216
B. Preparation	216
C. Problems and Cases	216
Problems	216
Revisiting Some Earlier Cases	218
Problems	218
<i>U.S. Claims, Inc. v. Flomenhaft</i>	219
Problems	222
Revisiting an Earlier Case	223
Problem	223

**CHAPTER 19****SPECIAL PRIORITY FOR THE PMSI****225**

A. Introduction	225
B. Preparation	226
C. Problems and Cases	226
Problem	226
Questions on § 9-317(e) and § 9-324(a)	227
<i>Brodie Hotel Supply, Inc. v. United States</i>	227
Questions on <i>Brodie</i>	230
Problems	230
Revisiting Some Earlier Cases	231
Question on § 9-324(b) and (c)	231
<i>In re Leading Edge Pork, LLC</i>	232
Problem	236

**CHAPTER 20****PRIORITY IN INVESTMENT PROPERTY  
AND DEPOSIT ACCOUNTS****237**

A. Introduction	237
B. Preparation	238
C. Problems	238
Problems	238

**CHAPTER 21****FIXTURES****241**

A. Introduction	241
1. As Goods Become "Fixtures"	241
2. Goods Brought onto Land	242
3. The Test(s) for What Constitutes a Fixture	244
4. Taking Interest in Fixtures	245
5. Perfecting on and Priority in Fixtures	246
B. Preparation	247
C. Problems and Cases	247
Problem	247
<i>In re Adkins</i>	248
An Expect from <i>In re Ryan</i> Discussed by the <i>Atkins</i>	
Court	251
<i>In re Ryan</i>	251
Problems	252
<i>In the Matter of Bennett</i>	254
Note on Trailers, Mobile Homes, and Manufactured Homes	257



Problem	258
<i>Tustian v. Schriever</i>	259
Note on <i>Tustian</i>	264
Note on Accessions and Commingled Goods	264
Problems	265
A Look Ahead to <i>Farmers Cooperative Elevator</i>	266

## CHAPTER 22

### CLAIMS ARISING UNDER ARTICLE 2 267

A. Introduction	267
B. Preparation	268
C. Problems and Cases	269
Problems	269
<i>In re Tucker</i>	271
Note on the Seller's Right of Reclamation Under the Bankruptcy Code	275

## CHAPTER 23

### SPECIAL ISSUES IN BANKRUPTCY 277

A. Introduction	277
1. The Bankruptcy Trustee's Avoidance Powers	277
2. Preferential Transfers	278
3. Fraudulent Transfers	282
B. Preparation	284
Problems	284
<i>In re Qualia Clinical Service, Inc.</i>	285
Problem	289
Note on the Automatic Stay	289
Problem	291
<i>In the Matter of Clark Pipe &amp; Supply Co., Inc.</i>	291
Problem	294

## PART V

### SALES AND OTHER DISPOSITIONS OF COLLATERAL 295

## CHAPTER 24

### DOES THE INTEREST SURVIVE THE DISPOSITION? 297

A. Introduction	297
B. Preparation	298

C. Problems and Cases	299
Problems	299
<i>Snow Machines, Inc. v. South Slope</i>	
<i>Development Corporation</i>	299
Problem	302
<i>Indianapolis Car Exchange, Inc. v. Alderson</i>	302
<i>International Harvester Co. v. Glendenning</i>	303
Question on <i>International Harvester</i>	308
Problems	309
<i>In re Western Iowa Limestone, Inc.</i>	310
Problems	314
<i>Fin Ag, Inc. v. Hufnagle, Inc.</i>	315
Note on The Food Security Act of 1985	321

## CHAPTER 25

### WHAT ARE PROCEEDS? 325

A. Introduction	325
B. Preparation	326
C. Problems and Cases	326
Problems	326
<i>Farmers Cooperative Elevator Co. v.</i>	
<i>Union State Bank</i>	327
Question on <i>Farmers Cooperative Elevator</i>	329
Problem	329
<i>Helms v. Certified Packaging Corporation</i>	329

## CHAPTER 26

### ATTACHMENT, PERFECTION, AND PRIORITY IN PROCEEDS 333

A. Introduction	333
B. Preparation	334
C. Problems and Cases	334
Revisiting an Earlier Case	334
Problems	335
<i>Van Diest Supply Co. v. Shelby County State Bank</i>	336
Question on <i>Van Diest</i>	341
Problem	342
<i>Metropolitan National Bank v. La Sher Oil Company</i>	342
Problems	343



<b>CHAPTER 27</b>	
<b>CHattel Paper and Account Financing</b>	<b>345</b>
A. Introduction	345
B. Preparation	347
C. Problems and Cases	348
Problems	348
<i>Aetna Finance Co. v. Henderickson</i>	349
Problem	354

## PART VI

<b>FURTHER ON THE SCOPE OF ARTICLE 9</b>	<b>357</b>
--	------------

<b>CHAPTER 28</b>	
<b>LEASES OF GOODS AND ARTICLE 9</b>	<b>359</b>
A. Introduction	359
B. Preparation	361
C. Problems and Cases	362
Problem	362
<i>In re Grubbs Construction Company</i>	362
Problem	372

<b>CHAPTER 29</b>	
<b>OTHER TRANSACTIONS GOVERNED BY ARTICLE 9</b>	<b>375</b>
A. Introduction	375
B. Preparation	375
C. Problems and Cases	376
Problem	376
On the Agricultural Lien	376
Problems	377
On the Sale of Receivables	378
Problems	378
On Those Consignments Governed by Article 9	380
Problem	380
<i>Rayfield Investment Co. v. KREPS</i>	381
<i>In Re Music City RV, LLC</i>	384

<b>CHAPTER 30</b>	
<b>INTERESTS NOT COVERED BY ARTICLE 9</b>	<b>389</b>
A. Introduction	389
1. Certain Interests Not Covered	389

2. When Federal Law Preempts	389
3. The Federal Tax Lien Act	390
4. Miscellaneous Other Liens or Interests	390
B. Preparation	390
C. Problems and Cases	391
Problems	391
<i>In re Coldwave Systems, LLC</i>	391
Perfecting on Intellectual Property	394
The Federal Tax Lien	395
<i>In re Spearing Tool and Manufacturing Co., Inc.</i>	398
On the <i>Spearing Tool</i> Decision	402
<i>North Valley Bank v. McGloin, Davenport, Severson &amp;</i>	
<i>Snow, P.C.</i>	402
Problem	408

## PART VII

### DEFAULT AND ENFORCEMENT 409

## CHAPTER 31 DEFAULT 411

A. Introduction	411
1. "Events of Default"	411
2. General Insecurity and Acceleration Clauses	412
B. Preparation	413
C. Problems and Cases	413
Problem	413
<i>In re Bolin &amp; Company, LLC</i>	414
Problem	429
<i>Minor v. Chase Auto Finance Corporation</i>	430

## CHAPTER 32 REPOSSESSION 437

A. Introduction	437
1. The Secured Party's Options upon Default	437
2. Collecting on Receivables	438
3. Self-Help Repossession	439
B. Preparation	440
C. Problems and Cases	440
<i>Callaway v. Whittenton</i>	440
Excerpts from Two Cases Cited by the Court	
in <i>Callaway</i>	444
<i>Chrysler Credit Corporation v. Koontz</i>	444



<i>James v. Ford Motor Credit Company</i>	445
Revisiting an Earlier Case	446
<i>In re Bolin &amp; Company, LLC</i>	446
Problems	447
<i>Eley v. Mid/East Acceptance Corp. of N.C., Inc.</i>	449
Note on the Duties of the Secured Party with Respect to Repossessed Collateral	453
<b>CHAPTER 33</b>	
<b>THE FORECLOSURE SALE</b>	<b>455</b>
A. Introduction	455
1. The Secured Party's Right to Dispose of the Collateral	455
2. Dividing Up the Proceeds of Disposition	456
3. Protections for the Debtor	457
4. Debtor's Remedies for the Secured Party's Noncompliance	458
B. Preparation	460
C. Problems and Cases	460
Problem	460
<i>Auto Credit of Nashville v. Wimmer</i>	461
<i>Brunswick Acceptance Company, LLC v. MEJ, LLC</i>	464
Problem	469
<i>Center Capital Corp. v. PRA Aviation, LLC</i>	469
<i>Commerical Credit Group, Inc. v. Barber</i>	472
Problems	475
<i>Coxall v. Clover Commercial Corp.</i>	476
Note on <i>Coxall</i>	481
<b>CHAPTER 34</b>	
<b>STRICT FORECLOSURE AND THE RIGHT OF REDEMPTION</b>	<b>483</b>
A. Introduction	483
B. Preparation	483
C. Problems and Cases	483
Problem	483
<i>In re CBGB Holding</i>	484
<i>CIT Group/Equipment Financing, Inc. v. Landreth</i>	488
<i>Automotive Finance Corp. v. Smart Auto Center, Inc.</i>	491
Problem	494
<i>Appendix of Sample Forms</i>	495
<i>Table of Cases</i>	503
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	505
<i>Index</i>	509