

2006

Remedies: Public & Private, 4th ed

David I. Levine

David J. Jung

David Schoenbrod

Angus Macbeth

REMEDIES: PUBLIC AND PRIVATE

Fourth Edition

By

David I. Levine

*Professor of Law
University of California
Hastings College of the Law*

David J. Jung

*Professor of Law
University of California
Hastings College of the Law*

David Schoenbrod

*Professor of Law
New York Law School*

Angus Macbeth

*Sidley Austin
Washington, D.C.*

AMERICAN CASEBOOK SERIES®

THOMSON
—★—™
WEST

Table of Contents

| | Page |
|---|-----------|
| PREFACE TO THE FOURTH EDITION | v |
| PREFACE TO THE FIRST EDITION | vii |
| ACKNOWLEDGMENTS | xi |
| TABLE OF CASES | xxvii |
| Chapter 1. Introduction to the Law of Remedies | 1 |
| A. A General Approach to Crafting a Remedy | 2 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller Remedies in a Traditional</i> | |
| <i>Private Case</i> | 4 |
| B. Private Law and Public Law | 4 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Remedies in a</i> | |
| <i>Public Law Case</i> | 5 |
| Abram Chayes, the Role of the Judge in Public Law Litigation... | 5 |
| Notes | 8 |
| C. "Where There's a Right, There's a Remedy"? | 10 |
| <i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents of Federal Bureau of</i> | |
| <i>Narcotics</i> | 13 |
| Notes | 18 |
| <i>Schweiker v. Chilicky</i> | 20 |
| Notes | 26 |
| A Digression: Remedial Choice in the Statutory Context..... | 28 |
| Chapter 2. The Nature, Availability, and Scope of Injunctions | 33 |
| A. The Nature of an Injunction | 33 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Choice Between an Injunction and Damages</i> | 33 |
| B. The Plaintiff's Rightful Position as the Measure of an Injunction | 37 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Defining the Rightful Position</i> | 37 |
| <i>Mt. Healthy City School District Board of Education v. Doyle</i> | 37 |
| Notes | 41 |
| <i>Note on Rightful Position as Reconsideration or Remand in Administrative Law</i> | 43 |
| <i>Problem: The Racially Biased Election</i> | 45 |
| <i>Rizzo v. Goode</i> | 46 |
| Notes | 51 |
| <i>Newman v. Alabama</i> | 52 |
| Notes | 54 |

| | Page |
|---|------|
| C. The Prerequisites for Injunctive Relief | 57 |
| 1. Threat of Harm | 57 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Threat of Harm</i> | 57 |
| <i>Hecht Co. v. Bowles</i> | 58 |
| Notes | 62 |
| <i>Note on Mootness and Ripeness</i> | 62 |
| <i>City of Los Angeles v. Lyons</i> | 64 |
| Notes | 73 |
| <i>Note on Who is Protected by an Injunction</i> | 77 |
| <i>Note on the Relationship Between Threat of Harm and the Scope of an Injunction</i> | 78 |
| 2. Inadequate Remedy at Law | 80 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Choice Between Legal and Equitable Remedies</i> | 80 |
| <i>Note on the Maxims of Equity</i> | 81 |
| <i>Note on the Declining Importance of the Inadequate Remedy at Law Rule</i> | 83 |
| Douglas Laycock, <i>The Death of the Irreparable Injury Rule</i> .. | 84 |
| <i>Note on Whether to Abandon the Inadequacy Requirement</i> | 85 |
| Alan Schwartz, <i>The Case for Specific Performance</i> | 87 |
| Notes | 89 |
| <i>Note on Constitutional and Statutory Variations on the Inadequacy Requirement</i> | 91 |
| 3. Practicality of Enforcement | 93 |
| D. Granting Less or More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position | 95 |
| 1. Granting Less Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position: Balancing the Equities | 95 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Balancing the Equities</i> | 95 |
| <i>Note on When Injunctions are Efficient</i> | 97 |
| <i>Smith v. Staso Milling Co.</i> | 100 |
| Notes | 103 |
| <i>Brown v. Board of Education (Brown II)</i> | 107 |
| Notes | 109 |
| <i>Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill</i> | 112 |
| Notes | 119 |
| <i>Weinberger v. Romero-Barcelo</i> | 120 |
| Notes | 126 |
| David Schoenbrod, <i>The Measure of an Injunction: A Principle to Replace Balancing the Equities and Tailoring the Remedy</i> | 129 |
| <i>Note on Balancing in Administrative Enforcement</i> | 131 |
| 2. Granting More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position: Prophylaxis and Impossibility | 132 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Prophylactic Orders</i> | 132 |
| (a) The Abortion Protest Example | 135 |
| <i>Madsen v. Women's Health Center, Inc.</i> | 135 |
| Notes | 155 |
| (b) The School Desegregation Example | 158 |

| | Page |
|--|------------|
| D. Granting Less or More Than Plaintiff's Rightful Position— Continued | |
| <i>Swann v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education</i> | 159 |
| Notes | 164 |
| <i>Missouri v. Jenkins (Jenkins III)</i> | 167 |
| Notes | 181 |
| E. Specific Remedies Other Than Injunctions | 183 |
| Chapter 3. Procedures for Formulating, Administering, and Enforcing the Injunction | 187 |
| A. Obtaining Preliminary Injunctive Relief | 187 |
| 1. Types of Injunctions | 187 |
| <i>Problem: Unauthorized Merchants</i> | 190 |
| 2. Standards for Granting Preliminary Relief | 190 |
| <i>Schiavo ex rel. Schindler v. Schiavo (I)</i> | 191 |
| <i>Schiavo ex rel. Schindler v. Schiavo (II)</i> | 195 |
| Notes | 202 |
| <i>American Hospital Supply Corp. v. Hospital Products LTD.</i> .. | 205 |
| Notes | 207 |
| Problems | 210 |
| 3. The Security Requirement | 210 |
| (a) The Amount of Security | 211 |
| (b) Collecting on the Security | 212 |
| B. Formulating and Administering the Injunction | 213 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Drafting and Ad-</i> <i>ministering an Injunction</i> | 213 |
| 1. Drafting the Injunction | 213 |
| <i>Portland Feminist Women's Health Center v. Advocates for</i> <i>Life, Inc.</i> | 213 |
| Notes | 216 |
| 2. Administering the Injunction | 220 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Determining</i> <i>Compliance With an Injunction</i> | 220 |
| James A. Henderson, Jr. & Richard A. Pearson, Implement- ing Federal Environmental Policies: The Limits of Aspira- tional Commands | 221 |
| Notes | 224 |
| Special Project—The Remedial Process in Institutional Re- form Litigation | 225 |
| Notes | 228 |
| <i>Illinois v. Costle</i> | 230 |
| Notes | 232 |
| Murray Levine, Charles P. Ewing & David I. Levine, The Use of Law for Prevention in the Public Interest | 233 |
| Notes | 237 |
| Michael S. Lottman, Enforcing Judicial Decrees: Now Comes the Hard Part | 238 |
| Problems | 240 |
| 3. Accommodating Changing Circumstances: Interpretation and Modification of the Decree | 240 |

| | Page |
|--|------|
| B. Formulating and Administering the Injunction—Continued | |
| Timothy S. Jost, <i>From Swift to Stotts and Beyond: Modification of Injunctions in the Federal Courts</i> | 241 |
| <i>Note on Interpretation and Modification of a Decree</i> | 242 |
| <i>Problems</i> | 244 |
| <i>Firefighters Local Union No. 1784 v. Stotts</i> | 245 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 254 |
| <i>Rufo v. Inmates of Suffolk County Jail</i> | 254 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 267 |
| <i>Note on Binding Successors in Office with a Consent Decree</i> | 269 |
| 4. Retaining and Closing a Case | 271 |
| (a) Judicial Direction to Terminate Jurisdiction | 271 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Obtaining Release From an Injunction</i> | 271 |
| <i>Board of Education of Oklahoma City Public Schools v. Dowell</i> | 272 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 277 |
| (b) Legislative Direction to Terminate Jurisdiction | 281 |
| <i>Miller v. French</i> | 282 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 296 |
| C. Enforcement of the Decree | 299 |
| 1. The Contempt Power | 300 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Civil or Criminal Contempt</i> | 300 |
| <i>Hicks on Behalf of Feiock v. Feiock</i> | 301 |
| <i>Notes on In Personam Versus In Rem Enforcement</i> | 308 |
| <i>Notes on the Classification of Contempt Proceedings</i> | 309 |
| <i>United Mine Workers v. Bagwell</i> | 310 |
| <i>More Notes on the Classification of Contempt Proceedings</i> | 321 |
| <i>Notes on the Elements of Contempt</i> | 323 |
| <i>Notes on Sanctions</i> | 325 |
| <i>Notes on Procedures</i> | 327 |
| 2. When Are Parties Bound? | 329 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Violating an Anticipated Order</i> | 329 |
| <i>Griffin v. County School Board of Prince Edward County</i> | 329 |
| <i>Notes on Getting Tricky With a Court</i> | 334 |
| 3. The Collateral Bar Rule | 336 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Collateral Bar Rule</i> | 336 |
| <i>In re Providence Journal Co.</i> | 336 |
| <i>Notes on the Collateral Bar Rule</i> | 343 |
| 4. Who Is Bound? | 347 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Coerce Persons Who Are Not Parties</i> | 347 |
| <i>State University of New York v. Denton</i> | 347 |
| <i>United States v. Hall</i> | 350 |
| <i>Notes on Injunctions Against Nonparties</i> | 354 |
| <i>Note on Washington v. Washington State Commercial Passenger Fishing Vessel Association</i> | 358 |

| | Page |
|---|------------|
| C. Enforcement of the Decree—Continued | |
| <i>Note on Notice</i> | 359 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Harm Persons Who Are Not Proven Violators</i> | 360 |
| <i>Note on Non-Violators</i> | 360 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Harm Persons Who Are Not Proven Violators and Are Not Parties</i> | 362 |
| <i>Note on Martin v. Wilks</i> | 362 |
| 5. Enforcement Against the Government | 365 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Injunctions That Require the Cooperation of Public Officials</i> | 365 |
| <i>Note on How Politics Complicates Enforcement</i> | 367 |
| <i>Note on How Immunity Complicates Enforcement</i> | 371 |
| <i>Missouri v. Jenkins (Jenkins II)</i> | 377 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 385 |
| <i>United States v. City of Yonkers</i> | 387 |
| <i>Spallone v. United States</i> | 395 |
| <i>Notes on Tactics to Override Legislative Decisions</i> | 403 |
| <i>Alexander Bickel, The Least Dangerous Branch</i> | 410 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 414 |
| Chapter 4. Declaratory Judgment | 418 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Declaratory Judgment</i> | 420 |
| <i>Aetna Life Insurance Co. v. Haworth</i> | 421 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 424 |
| <i>Poe v. Ullman</i> | 425 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 429 |
| <i>Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc. v. Pfizer, Inc.</i> | 430 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 437 |
| <i>Morrison v. Parker</i> | 438 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 443 |
| <i>Note on Jurisdiction over Declaratory Judgment Actions in Federal Court</i> | 446 |
| <i>Note on Reformation</i> | 449 |
| Chapter 5. Criminal and Civil Sanctions | 451 |
| A. Distinguishing Criminal and Civil Sanctions | 451 |
| <i>Kennedy v. Mendoza-Martinez</i> | 452 |
| <i>United States v. Salerno</i> | 456 |
| <i>Hudson v. United States</i> | 462 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 467 |
| <i>Notes on Differences Between Civil and Criminal Proceedings</i> | 469 |
| B. Proportionality in Sentencing | 472 |
| <i>Ewing v. California</i> | 472 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 486 |
| C. Punitive Damages | 489 |
| <i>Grimshaw v. Ford Motor Co.</i> | 491 |
| <i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i> | 498 |
| <i>Notes</i> | 510 |

| | Page |
|--|------------|
| C. Punitive Damages—Continued | |
| <i>Dunn v. HOVIC</i> | 514 |
| Notes | 525 |
| D. Civil Economic Sanctions..... | 529 |
| William Drayton, Economic Law Enforcement..... | 529 |
| Notes | 536 |
| E. Forfeiture..... | 539 |
| <i>Austin v. United States</i> | 541 |
| <i>United States v. Bajakajian</i> | 548 |
| Notes | 556 |
| Chapter 6. Damages | 558 |
| A. Introduction | 558 |
| The Nature of the Subject..... | 558 |
| <i>Memphis Community School District v. Stachura</i> | 559 |
| Notes | 565 |
| <i>Note on Nominal Damages</i> | 568 |
| <i>Note on Monetary Relief in Law and Equity</i> | 570 |
| <i>Note on the Right to a Jury Trial</i> | 572 |
| B. The Basic Issues..... | 574 |
| 1. A Roadmap to Damages | 574 |
| Charles McCormick, Handbook on the Law of Damages..... | 574 |
| Notes..... | 575 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) The Damages</i> Option | 582 |
| <i>Note on Election of Remedies</i> | 582 |
| 2. Value | 585 |
| <i>Problems: Valuing the Plaintiff's Loss</i> | 585 |
| <i>State v. Bishop</i> | 586 |
| Notes..... | 588 |
| <i>Ohio v. Department of the Interior</i> | 590 |
| Notes..... | 599 |
| C. An Overview of Tort Damages..... | 602 |
| <i>Ayers v. Jackson Township</i> | 604 |
| Notes | 616 |
| 1. Elements of the Award | 625 |
| <i>Bell v. City of Milwaukee</i> | 625 |
| Notes..... | 630 |
| <i>Note on Loss of Consortium</i> | 634 |
| 2. Measuring the Damages..... | 635 |
| <i>Tullis v. Townley Engineering & Manufacturing Co.</i> | 635 |
| Notes..... | 638 |
| <i>Walker v. Ritchie</i> | 643 |
| Notes..... | 646 |
| 3. Limits on Recovery: Foreseeable, Certain and Unavoidable ... | 649 |
| <i>Steinhauser v. Hertz Corp.</i> | 649 |
| <i>Dillon v. Evanston Hospital</i> | 651 |
| Notes | 654 |
| <i>Munn v. Southern Health Plan, Inc.</i> | 656 |
| Notes..... | 661 |

| | Page |
|---|------------|
| C. An Overview of Tort Damages—Continued | |
| 4. Managing Damages Actions: The New Public Law Litigation? | 665 |
| Peter H. Schuck, The Role of Judges in Settling Complex Cases: The Agent Orange Example | 665 |
| Notes | 670 |
| Abram Chayes, The Role of the Judge in Public Law Litigation | 670 |
| Richard L. Marcus, Public Law Litigation and Legal Scholarship | 670 |
| Notes | 674 |
| D. An Overview of Contract Damages | 677 |
| 1. The Basic Rules | 677 |
| <i>Great American Music Machine, Inc. v. Mid-South Record Pressing Co.</i> | 677 |
| Notes | 684 |
| Charles J. Goetz & Robert E. Scott, Measuring Sellers' Damages: The Lost Profits Puzzle | 693 |
| Justin Sweet, Liquidated Damages in California | 694 |
| Notes | 697 |
| 2. Contract or Tort? The Uncertain Boundary | 698 |
| <i>Freeman & Mills, Inc. v. Belcher Oil Co.</i> | 698 |
| Notes | 708 |
| <i>Eura Corp. v. Swiss Bank Corp.</i> | 712 |
| Notes | 719 |
| E. Adjustments to the Damage Award | 722 |
| 1. Time and Value: Prejudgment Interest | 722 |
| Problem: <i>Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Prejudgment Interest</i> | 722 |
| <i>Kansas v. Colorado</i> | 722 |
| Notes | 728 |
| 2. Time and Money: Discounting to Present Value | 732 |
| <i>Jones & Laughlin Steel Corporation v. Pfeifer</i> | 732 |
| Notes | 739 |
| <i>Energy Capital Corp. v. United States</i> | 740 |
| Notes | 743 |
| 3. Taxation of Damage Awards | 743 |
| <i>Commissioner of Internal Revenue v. Banks</i> | 743 |
| Notes | 748 |
| Chapter 7. Restitution and Restitutionary Remedies | 752 |
| A. Introduction | 752 |
| Restatement of Restitution | 752 |
| Douglas Laycock, The Scope and Significance of Restitution | 752 |
| <i>Note on Approaching Restitution Cases</i> | 754 |
| B. Restitution and Unsolicited Benefits | 758 |
| Problem: <i>Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Restitution for Benefits Conferred</i> | 758 |
| <i>Kossian v. American National Insurance Co.</i> | 758 |
| Notes | 761 |

| | Page |
|--|------------|
| C. Restitution and Wrongfully Acquired Benefits | 766 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) A Restitution Op-</i> <i>tion?</i> | 766 |
| <i>Ollwell v. Nye & Nissen</i> | 767 |
| Notes | 769 |
| D. Restitution and Solicited Benefits | 776 |
| <i>Hutchison v. Pyburn</i> | 776 |
| Notes | 778 |
| <i>EarthInfo, Inc. v. Hydrosphere Resource Consultants, Inc.</i> | 783 |
| Notes | 789 |
| E. Equitable Restitutionary Remedies | 794 |
| <i>Problem: Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i> | 794 |
| <i>Latham v. Father Divine</i> | 795 |
| <i>Snepp v. United States</i> | 795 |
| Notes | 801 |
| <i>Torres v. Eastlick (In Re North American Coin & Currency,</i> <i>Ltd.)</i> | 805 |
| Notes | 807 |
| <i>The Corporation of the President of the Church of Jesus Christ</i> <i>of Latter-Day Saints v. Jolley</i> | 809 |
| Notes | 811 |
| <i>In re Mushroom Transportation Company, Inc.</i> | 815 |
| Notes | 820 |
| <i>A Tracing Problem</i> | 822 |
| Chapter 8. Collection of Monetary Judgments | 823 |
| A. Provisional Relief | 823 |
| <i>Connecticut v. Doebr</i> | 824 |
| Notes | 835 |
| <i>United States v. James Daniel Good Real Property</i> | 839 |
| Notes | 852 |
| B. Post-Judgment Relief | 854 |
| 1. Basic Collection Strategy | 854 |
| James J. Brown, Collecting a Judgment | 854 |
| Notes | 857 |
| <i>Kahn v. Berman</i> | 859 |
| Notes | 864 |
| 2. Exempt Property | 865 |
| <i>Gutterman v. First National Bank of Anchorage</i> | 865 |
| Notes | 870 |
| <i>Laws v. Laws</i> | 872 |
| Notes | 875 |
| 3. Foreclosure Sales | 877 |
| <i>Griggs v. Miller</i> | 877 |
| Notes | 879 |
| 4. Body Execution | 881 |
| <i>Landrigan v. McElroy</i> | 881 |
| Notes | 884 |
| Chapter 9. Conduct of the Plaintiff: Bars to Obtaining Relief | 886 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Plaintiff's Conduct</i> | 887 |

| | Page |
|---|------------|
| A. Unclean Hands and in Pari Delicto | 888 |
| <i>Keystone Driller Co. v. General Excavator Co.</i> | 889 |
| Notes | 892 |
| <i>Clinton E. Worden & Co. v. California Fig Syrup Co.</i> | 894 |
| Notes | 896 |
| <i>Bateman Eichler, Hill Richards, Inc. v. Berner</i> | 898 |
| Notes | 904 |
| B. Estoppel | 906 |
| <i>Johnson v. Williford</i> | 906 |
| Notes | 910 |
| <i>Note on the Government as Plaintiff</i> | 914 |
| C. Laches and Statutes of Limitations | 916 |
| <i>TRW Inc. v. Andrews</i> | 917 |
| Notes | 924 |
| <i>Pro-Football, Inc. v. Harjo</i> | 928 |
| Notes | 932 |
| Chapter 10. Attorney's Fees | 935 |
| A. The Power of the Court to Award Attorney's Fees | 936 |
| <i>Problem: Country Lodge v. Miller (Reprised) Paying the Attorneys</i> | 936 |
| <i>Bernhard v. Farmers Insurance Exchange</i> | 939 |
| Notes | 946 |
| B. The Parties That Congress Has Made Eligible for Attorney's Fees | 948 |
| <i>Buckhannon Board and Care Home, Inc. v. West Virginia Department of Health and Human Resources</i> | 949 |
| Notes | 963 |
| C. The Measure of the Fees | 967 |
| 1. What Work Is Compensable? | 968 |
| <i>Sullivan v. Hudson</i> | 968 |
| Notes | 975 |
| 2. The Rate of Compensation | 978 |
| (a) Superior Performance | 979 |
| (b) Risk of Loss Contingency | 980 |
| (c) Contingency Fee Contract | 981 |
| Notes | 983 |
| 3. Applying the Lodestar Method | 985 |
| <i>Gratz v. Bollinger</i> | 985 |
| Notes | 1000 |
| D. Conflicts of Interest | 1002 |
| <i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i> | 1003 |
| Notes | 1009 |
| APPENDIX: SELECTED FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE | 1012 |
| INDEX | 1027 |