The U.S.-Taiwan-China Relationship in International Law and Policy (2016)

Lung-chu Chen

New York Law School

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books

**Recommended Citation**


https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/110

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS.
The U.S.-Taiwan-China Relationship
in International Law and Policy

Lung-chu Chen
Contents

About the Author xv
Preface xix
Introduction xxv

PART ONE | HISTORICAL AND CONTEMPORARY FACTS

1. Historical Background 3
   I. Taiwan’s Geographic Importance 3
   II. From Ancient Settlers to World War II 5
      A. Taiwan’s First Inhabitants 6
      B. Historical Connections between Taiwan and China 7
      C. Western Colonization 8
      D. Qing Rule of Taiwan (1683 to 1895) 9
      E. The Mudan Incident of 1871 10
      F. Japanese Colonization (1895 to 1945) 11
   III. Taiwan after World War II 13
      A. The Nationalist Chinese Military Occupation (1945 to 1949) 13
      B. The Nationalist Chinese in Exile (1949 to 1987) 15
      C. U.S. Policy toward Taiwan after World War II 16
      D. The Taiwan Relations Act (1979) 18
   Notes 20

2. Taiwan’s Contemporary Landscape 23
   I. From Authoritarian Rule to Democracy 24
      A. Lee Teng-hui, “Mr. Democracy” 27
   II. Contemporary Politics in Taiwan 29
      A. Chen Shui-bian 30
      B. Ma Ying-jeou 32
III. Taiwan's Economic Landscape 35
IV. Taiwan's Social and Cultural Landscape 38
V. Taiwan's Diplomatic and Defense Landscape 41
   A. Taiwan's Diplomatic Landscape 41
   B. Taiwan's Defense Landscape 43
Notes 48

PART TWO | ARTICULATION OF GOALS AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS
3. Clarification of Common Interests 53
   I. A Policy-Oriented Approach to International Law and World Affairs 53
      A. Peace and Security 55
      B. Universal Values of Freedom, Democracy, and Other Human Rights 57
      C. Rule of Law 61
      D. Economic Development 62
      E. International Cooperation toward Minimum and Optimum World Order 63
   II. Taiwan's International Legal Status Is a Matter of International Concern 64
   III. Why Taiwan Matters 66
       Notes 69

4. The Evolution of Taiwan Statehood 71
   I. Differing Viewpoints 72
      A. Taiwan as a Part of China 73
      B. Taiwan's Status Remains Undetermined since the San Francisco Peace Treaty of 1951 80
      C. Taiwan Has De Facto But Not De Jure Independence 83
   II. From Undetermined to Determined: The Theory of Taiwan's Evolution from a Militarily Occupied Territory to a State 83
      A. Contemporary International Law on Territorial Changes 84
      B. Taiwan's Evolution to Statehood under International Law: Four Distinctive Stages 87
         1. From 1895 to 1945: Taiwan Was a Territory and Colony of Japan 87
         2. From 1945 to 1952: The ROC Undertook a Military Occupation on Behalf of the Allied Powers 88
         3. From 1952 to 1987: The ROC Was a Regime in Exile that Engaged in an Illegal Military Occupation of Taiwan 88
         4. From 1988 to the Present: Taiwan Achieved Effective Self-Determination of the People and Evolved into a Sovereign and Independent State 90
      C. Effective Self-Determination 91
       Notes 92
5. U.S. Constitutional Issues Concerning the Taiwan Relations Act 95
   I. President Carter’s Announcement 95
      A. History of the Negotiations over U.S.-PRC Diplomatic Relations 100
   II. Enactment of the Taiwan Relations Act 103
   III. Congressional and Executive Powers in Foreign Affairs 111
      A. Treaty Making under the U.S. Constitution 113
      B. The TRA and the Three Communiques 115
      C. Conclusion: The TRA Is the Law of the Land 120
   Notes 121

PART THREE | TRENDS IN DEVELOPMENT AND CONDITIONING FACTORS
6. U.S.-Taiwan Relations 127
   I. U.S.-Taiwan Relations before the Taiwan Relations Act 128
      A. U.S.-Taiwan Relations in the 1940s and 1950s 128
      B. U.S.-Taiwan Relations in the 1960s and 1970s 130
   II. Application of the TRA Since 1979 131
      A. Jimmy Carter (1979 to 1981) 132
      D. Bill Clinton (1993 to 2001) 139
      E. George W. Bush (2001 to 2009) 145
      F. Barack Obama (2009 to the Present) 148
   III. Interim Appraisal of Past Successes and Failures 150
      A. Unofficial Relations 152
      B. Preserving Taiwan’s Distinctive Status 155
      C. Taiwan’s Democratic Development 157
      D. Fostering Taiwan’s Participation in International Organizations 158
   Notes 160

7. U.S.-China Relations 163
   I. U.S.-China Relations from 1945 to 1971 164
      A. The Chinese Civil War 164
      B. The Two Chinas and the United Nations 165
   II. Building the U.S.-China Relationship (1972) 168
      A. President Nixon’s Visit to China (1972) 168
      B. Establishment of Liaison Offices (1971) 169
      C. The Second Communique and Formal Recognition of the PRC (1978) 171
      D. The Taiwan Relations Act (1979) and the Third Communique (1982) 172
      E. China Joins Multilateral Economic Institutions (1980 to 1991) 173
F. The Tiananmen Square Massacre of June 4, 1989 174
G. The Third Taiwan Strait Crisis (1995 to 1996) 175
H. Jiang Zemin's Visit to the United States (1997) 176
I. The Belgrade Embassy Bombing (1999) 178

III. Recent Trends in U.S.-China Relations 181
A. The EP-3 Reconnaissance Plane Incident (2001) 182
B. U.S.-China Relations after September 11, 2001 183
C. China and North Korea (2002 to the Present) 184
D. The Global Financial Crisis (2008 to 2009) 185
E. The United States' and China's "Core Interests" (2009 to the Present) 185

Notes 187

8. Taiwan-China Relations 189
I. Taiwan-China Relations before 1949 191
A. Taiwan and China before 1895 191
B. Taiwan under Japanese Colonial Rule (1895 to 1945) 192
C. The Chinese Civil War and the Birth of the PRC (1927 to 1949) 193

II. Taiwan-China Relations from 1945 to 1987 194
A. Military Occupation of Taiwan by the KMT 194
B. KMT-CCP Hostilities (1949 to 1987) 196

III. The Era of Taiwanese Presidents (1988 to 2008) 199
A. Lee Teng-hui (1988 to 2000) 199
B. Chen Shui-bian (2000 to 2008) 202

IV. The Era of Ma Ying-jeou (2008 to the Present) 203
A. Ma's "Three Noes" 203
B. Cross-Strait Economic Integration and Dependency 205

V. Conclusion: Security and Dignity for Taiwan 207
Notes 209

PART FOUR| PROJECTIONS OF PROBABLE FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS

I. Evolving Chinese Perspectives 214
A. From Peaceful Coexistence to Core Interests 214

II. U.S.-China Economic Rivalry 218
A. China's Economic Expansion 219
B. Expanding Regional Influence 221
C. The Beijing Consensus 224
III. U.S.-China Strategic Rivalry 226
   A. China's Military Modernization 226
   B. Regional Security Issues 228
   C. U.S. “Pivot” to the Asia Pacific 230

IV. The Future of U.S.-China Relations 232
   A. International Cooperation 232
   B. Soft and Smart Power 234
   C. China as a Responsible Stakeholder 236
   D. China’s Long-Term Intentions 237

Notes 241

10. Possible Future Developments for Taiwan 245
    I. The Context of Conditions 246
       A. External Conditions 246
       B. Taiwan's Internal Politics 248
       C. The Predispositions of the People of Taiwan 250
    II. Future Projections 253
       A. Taiwan as a Part of China 254
       B. The Finlandization of Taiwan 257
       C. Taiwan as Asia’s Switzerland 259
       D. Taiwan as a Part of the United States 261
       E. Maintaining the Status Quo 262
    III. Taiwan as a Normalized State 264
         Notes 268

PART FIVE | RECOMMENDATIONS OF POLICY ALTERNATIVES

II. Recommendations of Policy Alternatives 273
    I. Enhance Taiwan-U.S. Trade through Bilateral Agreements and Taiwan's
       Participation and Membership in the Trans-Pacific Partnership 274
       A. Bilateral Trade 275
       B. Multilateral Trade 278
    II. Enhance Official and Nonofficial Contacts to Increase Mutual Understanding
        at All Levels 280
    III. Support Taiwan’s Membership or Meaningful Participation in International
         Organizations, Both Governmental and Nongovernmental 283
    IV. Support and Encourage Taiwan’s Ongoing Efforts to Enhance the
         Actualization of the Universal Values of Democracy, Freedom, and Other
         Human Rights 285
V. Fortify Taiwan's Defense Capabilities through Arms Sales and Related Measures 287
   A. Regional Military Imbalance 288
   B. Arms Sales under the Taiwan Relations Act (TRA) 289
VI. Reaffirm the Taiwan Relations Act 292
VII. Reappraise the U.S. One China Policy 294
VIII. Normalize Diplomatic Relations with Taiwan 297
IX. Support an Internationally Supervised Plebiscite in Taiwan to Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future 298
Notes 300

12. Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future 303
   I. Plebiscites under International Law 305
      A. Historical Development 305
      B. Recent Examples 307
         1. Quebec, Canada 307
         2. Kosovo 309
         3. East Timor (Timor-Leste) 311
         4. South Sudan 312
         5. The Falkland Islands 312
         6. Scotland, United Kingdom 313
         7. Crimea and Sevastopol, Ukraine 314
   II. Blueprint for a Taiwan Plebiscite 315
      A. Initiating the Plebiscite 317
      B. Establishing a Plebiscite Commission 320
         1. Formulating the Questions 321
         2. Eligibility for Voting 322
         3. Public Information 323
         4. Adopting the Outcomes 324
   III. International Support for a Taiwan Plebiscite 325
   IV. Conclusion: Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future 327
Notes 330

SUGGESTED READINGS IN ENGLISH 331
SUGGESTED READINGS IN CHINESE 341

I. Taiwan's International Legal Status in General 341
   II. Differing Viewpoints Regarding Taiwan's International Legal Status 343
      A. Taiwan's International Legal Status Was Determined a Long Time Ago; Taiwan Belongs to China 343
1. KMT’s Viewpoint 343
2. CCP’s Viewpoint 343
3. Taiwan Is a Renegade Province of China. Pending a Declaration of Independence 343

B. Taiwan’s International Legal Status Was Undetermined in the Past; It Remains Undetermined 343
1. Taiwan’s Sovereignty Belongs to the People of Taiwan 343
2. Taiwan’s Sovereignty Belongs to the United States 344
3. Other 344

C. Taiwan’s International Legal Status Was Undetermined in the Past, But Now Is Determined: Taiwan Is a Sovereign Independent State 344
1. The Theory of Taiwan’s Evolution as a State 344
2. Taiwan as a Newborn State 345
3. Taiwan Is a De Facto State, But Not Yet a De Jure State 345

III. Probable Future Developments for Taiwan 345
A. Normalized Statehood 345
B. Neutrality of Taiwan 346
C. Finlandization of Taiwan 346
D. Taiwan as a Part of the United States 347
E. Unification with China 347
1. Armed Liberation of Taiwan 347
2. Peaceful Liberation of Taiwan 347
3. One Country, Two Systems (Hong Kong Model) 348
4. A Great China Structure 348
5. KMT-CCP Peace Agreement; Political Transaction; Buy Taiwan with Money 349
6. Perpetuation of the Status Quo 349

TEXT OF SELECTED DOCUMENTS 351
Taiwan Relations Act (H.R. 2479; Public Law 96-8 98th Congress) (Excerpt), January 1, 1979 351
Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People’s Republic of China (The Shanghai Communiqué), February 27, 1972 358
Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People’s Republic of China on the Establishment of Diplomatic Relations (The Second Communiqué), January 1, 1979 361
Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People’s Republic of China (The Third Communiqué), August 17, 1982 362
President Reagan’s “Six Assurances” to Taiwan, July 14, 1982 364
Contents

President Reagan’s Secret Memorandum on the 1982 Communiqué, August 17, 1982 364
Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) 1999 Resolution Regarding Taiwan’s Future (Excerpt), December 2, 1999 365
National People’s Congress of the People’s Republic of China Anti-Secession Law, March 14, 2005 366
Peace Treaty between Japan and China (The Treaty of Shimonoseki) (Excerpt), April 17, 1895 368
The Cairo Declaration, November 27, 1943 370
Proclamation Defining Terms for Japanese Surrender (The Potsdam Declaration), July 26, 1945 371
Treaty of Peace with Japan (The San Francisco Peace Treaty) (Excerpt), September 8, 1951 373
Treaty of Peace between Japan and the Republic of China (The Treaty of Taipei) (Excerpt), April 28, 1952 377
Mutual Defense Treaty Between the United States and the Republic of China (Excerpt), December 2, 1954 380
United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2758 (XXVI), October 25, 1971 382
Notes 382

INDEX 383