

2016

**The U.S.-Taiwan-China Relationship in International Law and
Policy**

Lung-chu Chen

The U.S.-Taiwan-China Relationship in International Law and Policy

Lung-chu Chen

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide.

Oxford New York
Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid
Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in
Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary
Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand
Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by
Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

© Oxford University Press 2016

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Chen, Lung-chu, author.
Title: The U.S.-Taiwan-China relationship in international law and policy / Lung-chu Chen.
Description: New York : Oxford University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2015039361 | ISBN 9780190601126 ((hardback) : alk. paper)
Subjects: LCSH: Taiwan—International status. | Taiwan—Relations—China. | Taiwan—Foreign relations—United States. | Taiwan—Politics and government—1945-
Classification: LCC KZ4372 .C439 2016 | DDC 327.512.49073—de23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015039361>

9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper

Note to Readers

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is based upon sources believed to be accurate and reliable and is intended to be current as of the time it was written. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional person should be sought. Also, to confirm that the information has not been affected or changed by recent developments, traditional legal research techniques should be used, including checking primary sources where appropriate.

(Based on the Declaration of Principles jointly adopted by a Committee of the American Bar Association and a Committee of Publishers and Associations.)

**You may order this or any other Oxford University Press publication
by visiting the Oxford University Press website at www.oup.com**

Contents

About the Author xv

Preface xix

Introduction xxv

PART ONE | HISTORICAL AND CONTEMPORARY FACTS

1. *Historical Background* 3

- I. Taiwan's Geographic Importance 3
- II. From Ancient Settlers to World War II 5
 - A. Taiwan's First Inhabitants 6
 - B. Historical Connections between Taiwan and China 7
 - C. Western Colonization 8
 - D. Qing Rule of Taiwan (1683 to 1895) 9
 - E. The Mudan Incident of 1871 10
 - F. Japanese Colonization (1895 to 1945) 11
- III. Taiwan after World War II 13
 - A. The Nationalist Chinese Military Occupation (1945 to 1949) 13
 - B. The Nationalist Chinese in Exile (1949 to 1987) 15
 - C. U.S. Policy toward Taiwan after World War II 16
 - D. The Taiwan Relations Act (1979) 18

Notes 20

2. *Taiwan's Contemporary Landscape* 23

- I. From Authoritarian Rule to Democracy 24
 - A. Lee Teng-hui, "Mr. Democracy" 27
- II. Contemporary Politics in Taiwan 29
 - A. Chen Shui-bian 30
 - B. Ma Ying-jeou 32

- III. Taiwan's Economic Landscape 35
- IV. Taiwan's Social and Cultural Landscape 38
- V. Taiwan's Diplomatic and Defense Landscape 41
 - A. Taiwan's Diplomatic Landscape 41
 - B. Taiwan's Defense Landscape 43
- Notes 48

PART TWO | ARTICULATION OF GOALS AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS

3. *Clarification of Common Interests* 53

- I. A Policy-Oriented Approach to International Law and World Affairs 53
 - A. Peace and Security 55
 - B. Universal Values of Freedom, Democracy, and Other Human Rights 57
 - C. Rule of Law 61
 - D. Economic Development 62
 - E. International Cooperation toward Minimum and Optimum World Order 63
- II. Taiwan's International Legal Status Is a Matter of International Concern 64
- III. Why Taiwan Matters 66
- Notes 69

4. *The Evolution of Taiwan Statehood* 71

- I. Differing Viewpoints 72
 - A. Taiwan as a Part of China 73
 - B. Taiwan's Status Remains Undetermined since the San Francisco Peace Treaty of 1951 80
 - C. Taiwan Has *De Facto* But Not *De Jure* Independence 83
- II. From Undetermined to Determined: The Theory of Taiwan's Evolution from a Militarily Occupied Territory to a State 83
 - A. Contemporary International Law on Territorial Changes 84
 - B. Taiwan's Evolution to Statehood under International Law: Four Distinctive Stages 87
 - 1. From 1895 to 1945: Taiwan Was a Territory and Colony of Japan 87
 - 2. From 1945 to 1952: The ROC Undertook a Military Occupation on Behalf of the Allied Powers 88
 - 3. From 1952 to 1987: The ROC Was a Regime in Exile that Engaged in an Illegal Military Occupation of Taiwan 88
 - 4. From 1988 to the Present: Taiwan Achieved Effective Self-Determination of the People and Evolved into a Sovereign and Independent State 90
 - C. Effective Self-Determination 91
- Notes 92

5. *U.S. Constitutional Issues Concerning the Taiwan Relations Act* 95
- I. President Carter's Announcement 95
 - A. History of the Negotiations over U.S.-PRC Diplomatic Relations 100
 - II. Enactment of the Taiwan Relations Act 103
 - III. Congressional and Executive Powers in Foreign Affairs 111
 - A. Treaty Making under the U.S. Constitution 113
 - B. The TRA and the Three Communiqués 115
 - C. Conclusion: The TRA Is the Law of the Land 120
- Notes 121

PART THREE | TRENDS IN DEVELOPMENT AND CONDITIONING FACTORS

6. *U.S.-Taiwan Relations* 127
- I. U.S.-Taiwan Relations before the Taiwan Relations Act 128
 - A. U.S.-Taiwan Relations in the 1940s and 1950s 128
 - B. U.S.-Taiwan Relations in the 1960s and 1970s 130
 - II. Application of the TRA Since 1979 131
 - A. Jimmy Carter (1979 to 1981) 132
 - B. Ronald Reagan (1981 to 1989) 134
 - C. George H. W. Bush (1989 to 1993) 138
 - D. Bill Clinton (1993 to 2001) 139
 - E. George W. Bush (2001 to 2009) 145
 - F. Barack Obama (2009 to the Present) 148
 - III. Interim Appraisal of Past Successes and Failures 150
 - A. Unofficial Relations 152
 - B. Preserving Taiwan's Distinctive Status 155
 - C. Taiwan's Democratic Development 157
 - D. Fostering Taiwan's Participation in International Organizations 158
- Notes 160

7. *U.S.-China Relations* 163
- I. U.S.-China Relations from 1945 to 1971 164
 - A. The Chinese Civil War 164
 - B. The Two Chinas and the United Nations 165
 - II. Building the U.S.-China Relationship (1972) 168
 - A. President Nixon's Visit to China (1972) 168
 - B. Establishment of Liaison Offices (1973) 169
 - C. The Second Communiqué and Formal Recognition of the PRC (1978) 171
 - D. The Taiwan Relations Act (1979) and the Third Communiqué (1982) 172
 - E. China Joins Multilateral Economic Institutions (1980 to 1991) 173

- F. The Tiananmen Square Massacre of June 4, 1989 174
- G. The Third Taiwan Strait Crisis (1995 to 1996) 175
- H. Jiang Zemin's Visit to the United States (1997) 176
 - I. The Belgrade Embassy Bombing (1999) 178
 - J. China Joins the World Trade Organization (2001) 179
- III. Recent Trends in U.S.-China Relations 181
 - A. The EP-3 Reconnaissance Plane Incident (2001) 182
 - B. U.S.-China Relations after September 11, 2001 183
 - C. China and North Korea (2002 to the Present) 184
 - D. The Global Financial Crisis (2008 to 2009) 185
 - E. The United States' and China's "Core Interests" (2009 to the Present) 185
- Notes 187

8. Taiwan-China Relations 189

- I. Taiwan-China Relations before 1949 191
 - A. Taiwan and China before 1895 191
 - B. Taiwan under Japanese Colonial Rule (1895 to 1945) 192
 - C. The Chinese Civil War and the Birth of the PRC (1927 to 1949) 193
- II. Taiwan-China Relations from 1945 to 1987 194
 - A. Military Occupation of Taiwan by the KMT 194
 - B. KMT-CCP Hostilities (1949 to 1987) 196
- III. The Era of Taiwanese Presidents (1988 to 2008) 199
 - A. Lee Teng-hui (1988 to 2000) 199
 - B. Chen Shui-bian (2000 to 2008) 202
- IV. The Era of Ma Ying-jeou (2008 to the Present) 203
 - A. Ma's "Three Noes" 203
 - B. Cross-Strait Economic Integration and Dependency 205
- V. Conclusion: Security and Dignity for Taiwan 207
- Notes 209

PART FOUR | PROJECTIONS OF PROBABLE FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS

9. A Developing U.S.-China Rivalry? 213

- I. Evolving Chinese Perspectives 214
 - A. From Peaceful Coexistence to Core Interests 214
- II. U.S.-China Economic Rivalry 218
 - A. China's Economic Expansion 219
 - B. Expanding Regional Influence 221
 - C. The Beijing Consensus 224

- III. U.S.-China Strategic Rivalry 226
 - A. China's Military Modernization 226
 - B. Regional Security Issues 228
 - C. U.S. "Pivot" to the Asia Pacific 230
- IV. The Future of U.S.-China Relations 232
 - A. International Cooperation 232
 - B. Soft and Smart Power 234
 - C. China as a Responsible Stakeholder 236
 - D. China's Long-Term Intentions 237
- Notes 241

10. *Possible Future Developments for Taiwan* 245

- I. The Context of Conditions 246
 - A. External Conditions 246
 - B. Taiwan's Internal Politics 248
 - C. The Predispositions of the People of Taiwan 250
- II. Future Projections 253
 - A. Taiwan as a Part of China 254
 - B. The Finlandization of Taiwan 257
 - C. Taiwan as Asia's Switzerland 259
 - D. Taiwan as a Part of the United States 261
 - E. Maintaining the Status Quo 262
- III. Taiwan as a Normalized State 264
- Notes 268

PART FIVE | RECOMMENDATIONS OF POLICY ALTERNATIVES

11. *Recommendations of Policy Alternatives* 273

- I. Enhance Taiwan-U.S. Trade through Bilateral Agreements and Taiwan's Participation and Membership in the Trans-Pacific Partnership 274
 - A. Bilateral Trade 275
 - B. Multilateral Trade 278
- II. Enhance Official and Nonofficial Contacts to Increase Mutual Understanding at All Levels 280
- III. Support Taiwan's Membership or Meaningful Participation in International Organizations, Both Governmental and Nongovernmental 283
- IV. Support and Encourage Taiwan's Ongoing Efforts to Enhance the Actualization of the Universal Values of Democracy, Freedom, and Other Human Rights 285

- V. Fortify Taiwan's Defense Capabilities through Arms Sales and Related Measures 287
 - A. Regional Military Imbalance 288
 - B. Arms Sales under the Taiwan Relations Act (TRA) 289
 - VI. Reaffirm the Taiwan Relations Act 292
 - VII. Reappraise the U.S. One China Policy 294
 - VIII. Normalize Diplomatic Relations with Taiwan 297
 - IX. Support an Internationally Supervised Plebiscite in Taiwan to Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future 298
- Notes 300

12. *Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future* 303

- I. Plebiscites under International Law 305
 - A. Historical Development 305
 - B. Recent Examples 307
 - 1. Québec, Canada 307
 - 2. Kosovo 309
 - 3. East Timor (Timor-Leste) 311
 - 4. South Sudan 312
 - 5. The Falkland Islands 312
 - 6. Scotland, United Kingdom 313
 - 7. Crimea and Sevastopol, Ukraine 314
 - II. Blueprint for a Taiwan Plebiscite 315
 - A. Initiating the Plebiscite 317
 - B. Establishing a Plebiscite Commission 320
 - 1. Formulating the Questions 321
 - 2. Eligibility for Voting 322
 - 3. Public Information 323
 - 4. Adopting the Outcomes 324
 - III. International Support for a Taiwan Plebiscite 325
 - IV. Conclusion: Let the People of Taiwan Decide Taiwan's Future 327
- Notes 330

SUGGESTED READINGS IN ENGLISH 331

SUGGESTED READINGS IN CHINESE 341

- I. Taiwan's International Legal Status in General 341
- II. Differing Viewpoints Regarding Taiwan's International Legal Status 343
 - A. Taiwan's International Legal Status Was Determined a Long Time Ago; Taiwan Belongs to China 343

1. KMT's Viewpoint 343
2. CCP's Viewpoint 343
3. Taiwan Is a Renegade Province of China, Pending a Declaration of Independence 343
- B. Taiwan's International Legal Status Was Undetermined in the Past; It Remains Undetermined 343
 1. Taiwan's Sovereignty Belongs to the People of Taiwan 343
 2. Taiwan's Sovereignty Belongs to the United States 344
 3. Other 344
- C. Taiwan's International Legal Status Was Undetermined in the Past, But Now Is Determined: Taiwan Is a Sovereign Independent State 344
 1. The Theory of Taiwan's Evolution as a State 344
 2. Taiwan as a Newborn State 345
 3. Taiwan Is a *De Facto* State, But Not Yet a *De Jure* State 345
- III. Probable Future Developments for Taiwan 345
 - A. Normalized Statehood 345
 - B. Neutrality of Taiwan 346
 - C. Finlandization of Taiwan 346
 - D. Taiwan as a Part of the United States 347
 - E. Unification with China 347
 1. Armed Liberation of Taiwan 347
 2. Peaceful Liberation of Taiwan 347
 3. One Country, Two Systems (Hong Kong Model) 348
 4. A Great China Structure 348
 5. KMT-CCP Peace Agreement; Political Transaction; Buy Taiwan with Money 349
 - F. Perpetuation of the Status Quo 349

TEXT OF SELECTED DOCUMENTS 351

- Taiwan Relations Act (H.R. 2479; Public Law 96-8 98th Congress) (Excerpt),
January 1, 1979 351
- Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People's Republic of
China (The Shanghai Communiqué), February 27, 1972 358
- Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People's Republic of
China on the Establishment of Diplomatic Relations (The Second Communiqué),
January 1, 1979 361
- Joint Communiqué of the United States of America and the People's Republic of
China (The Third Communiqué), August 17, 1982 362
- President Reagan's "Six Assurances" to Taiwan, July 14, 1982 364

- President Reagan's Secret Memorandum on the 1982 Communiqué, August 17,
1982 364
- Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) 1999 Resolution Regarding Taiwan's Future
(Excerpt), December 2, 1999 365
- National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China Anti-Secession Law,
March 14, 2005 366
- Peace Treaty between Japan and China (The Treaty of Shimonoseki) (Excerpt),
April 17, 1895 368
- The Cairo Declaration, November 27, 1943 370
- Proclamation Defining Terms for Japanese Surrender (The Potsdam Declaration),
July 26, 1945 371
- Treaty of Peace with Japan (The San Francisco Peace Treaty) (Excerpt), September 8,
1951 373
- Treaty of Peace between Japan and the Republic of China (The Treaty of Taipei)
(Excerpt), April 28, 1952 377
- Mutual Defense Treaty Between the United States and the Republic of China
(Excerpt), December 2, 1954 380
- United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2758 (XXVI), October 25, 1971 382
Notes 382