

2019

Sexuality Law (Third Edition) (2019)

Arthur S. Leonard

New York Law School, arthur.leonard@nyls.edu

Patricia A. Cain

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books



Part of the [Sexuality and the Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Leonard, Arthur S. and Cain, Patricia A., "Sexuality Law (Third Edition) (2019)" (2019). *Books*. 118.
https://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books/118

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at DigitalCommons@NYLS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Books by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@NYLS.

Sexuality Law

Arthur S. Leonard

PROFESSOR OF LAW, NEW YORK LAW SCHOOL

Patricia A. Cain

VICE PROVOST AND ALIBER FAMILY CHAIR IN LAW, UNIVERSITY OF IOWA

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

KC
KF
4754
.5
A7
L465
2005
c.1

Copyright © 2005
Arthur S. Leonard, Patricia A. Cain
All Rights Reserved

ISBN 0-89089-624-0
LCCN 2005932332

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.cap-press.com

Printed in the United States of America

Contents

Table of Cases	xv
Preface	xxiii
Chapter One An Introduction	
A. General Introduction: What is Sexuality?	3
B. A Brief History of Sexual Minorities and the Law	3
Influence of Darwin	5
Social Construction Thesis	6
Freud and the Early Sexologists	7
The Kinsey Reports	7
The Illness Model of Sexual Variation	8
Birth of the Homophile Movement	9
Gay Liberation Movement	10
The Debate over Cause: Nature or Nurture	10
Legal Consideration of Sexuality	12
How has United States law dealt with human sexuality?	15
C. Sexual Minorities in the Courts	15
<i>Bowers v. Hardwick</i>	17
<i>Romer v. Evans</i>	29
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	43
<i>In re Heilig</i>	61
Notes and Questions	70
Further Reading	71
Chapter Two What Is the Meaning of Lawrence & Romer?	73
<i>Lofton v. Secretary, Department of Children and Family Services</i>	75
Notes and Questions	114
Chapter Three Government Regulation of Sexual Conduct	117
A. Public vs. Private	119
<i>Lovisi v. Slayton</i>	119
Notes and Questions	123
<i>State of Idaho v. Limberhand</i>	123
Questions	127
<i>People v. Ramsden</i>	128
Questions	132
B. Solicitation	132
<i>Pryor v. Municipal Court</i>	132

<i>Harden v. Zinnemann</i>	138
Notes and Questions	141
C. Non-Marital Sex	142
<i>State v. Saunders</i>	143
<i>Martin v. Zihler</i>	147
Notes and Questions	150
D. Commercial Prostitution	151
<i>Roe v. Butterworth</i>	151
Notes and Questions	159
E. Minors	160
<i>State v. Limon</i>	160
Notes and Questions	172
F. Consensual Painful Sex	173
<i>Regina v. Brown</i>	174
Notes and Questions	193
G. Adultery	194
<i>Oliverson v. West Valley City</i>	195
Notes and Questions	202
H. Cross-Dressing in Public	202
<i>City of Chicago v. Wilson</i>	203
Notes and Questions	206
Chapter Four Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships	209
A. Marriage	209
1. Access to Marriage as a Fundamental Right	210
<i>Loving v. Virginia</i>	210
Notes and Questions	212
<i>Baker v. Nelson</i>	213
Notes and Questions	215
2. Is Same-sex Marriage a Crime?	216
The Woman Who Married The Woman	216
3. Litigating for the Right to Same-sex Marriage in the United States	217
Note: Litigating for the Right to Marry: Baehr to Baker	217
Question for Discussion	222
<i>Goodridge v. Department of Public Health</i>	222
Notes and Questions	232
4. Marriage Developments in Other Countries	237
a. The Netherlands	237
b. Belgium	238
c. Canada	238
5. Extra-territorial Recognition of Same-sex Marriages	239
<i>State v. Ross</i>	241
Notes and Questions	244
<i>Wilson v. Ake</i>	245
Notes and Questions	251
<i>Hennefeld v. Township of Montclair</i>	251
6. One Man and One Woman	255
<i>Littleton v. Prange</i>	255
Notes and Questions	262

Case of <i>Christine Goodwin v. the United Kingdom</i>	264
Notes and Questions	267
Further Reading on the Pros and Cons of Same-Sex Marriage	268
Further Reading on the Extra-Territorial Recognition of Same-Sex Marriage	269
Further Reading on the Rights of Transsexual Persons to Marry	269
B. Litigating for Spousal Status in the Absence of a Valid Marriage	269
1. The Putative Spouse Doctrine	269
Estate of Hall	270
Notes and Questions	273
2. Spousal Rights to Death Benefits	274
<i>Smith v. Knoller</i>	274
Notes on Wrongful Death Benefits and Similar Causes of Action	276
C. Statutory Alternatives to Marriage.	280
1. Civil Unions	280
Vermont Statutes Annotated	280
Notes and Questions	282
Note: Full Faith and Credit?	282
<i>Burns v. Burns</i>	284
<i>Langan v. St. Vincent's Hospital of N.Y.</i>	286
<i>Hennefeld v. Township of Montclair</i>	292
Notes and Questions	293
Note	294
2. Domestic Partnerships	294
a. In general	294
b. Domestic Partnerships at the city and county level	295
Iowa City Code	296
Notes and Questions	298
<i>Tyma v. Montgomery County</i>	299
Notes and Questions	303
c. Domestic Partnerships at the state level	304
<i>Knight v. Superior Court</i>	308
Notes and Questions	316
3. Adult Adoption	317
<i>In re Adoption of Robert Paul P.</i>	317
<i>In re Adoption of James A. Swanson</i>	321
Notes and Questions	323
4. Legal Guardianship	324
<i>In re Guardianship of Sharon Kowalski</i>	324
Notes and Questions	330
D. Litigating for Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships, But Not Claiming Spousal Status	331
1. Same-sex Partners as "Family"	331
<i>Braschi v. Stahl Assoc. Co.</i>	331
Notes and Questions	335
2. Quasi-marriage	337
<i>Vasquez v. Hawthorne</i>	337
Notes and Questions	341
<i>Gormley v. Robertson</i>	341
3. Creating a Family Name	344

<i>In re Bicknell</i>	344
Note	347
E. Relationship by Contract	347
<i>Marvin v. Marvin</i>	348
Note	349
<i>Hewitt v. Hewitt</i>	349
Notes and Questions	353
<i>Posik v. Layton</i>	353
Notes and Questions	356
F. Equitable Property Rights of Same-Sex Partners	357
1. Constructive Trust	357
<i>Bramlett v. Selman</i>	357
Note	359
2. Resulting Trust	360
<i>Scott v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue</i>	360
Notes and Questions	363
3. Unjust Enrichment	365
<i>Mitchell v. Moore</i>	365
Note	369
G. Federal Tax Considerations	369
1. Income Tax Issues	370
a. Filing status	370
b. Payment of support	370
c. Dependency exemptions and tax credits	371
Notes and Questions	373
d. Taxation of domestic partner benefits	373
e. Income from community property	374
f. Property divisions at divorce	374
2. Gift and Estate Tax	375
a. Gift tax issues	375
b. Estate tax issues	377
Notes and Questions	378
Further Reading on Tax Issues of Same-Sex Partners	379
Chapter Five Recognition of the Parent-Child Relationship	381
A. Constitutional Foundations	381
1. Who is a Parent?	382
<i>Stanley v. Illinois</i>	382
Notes and Questions	383
<i>Michael H. v. Gerald D.</i>	384
Notes and Questions	388
2. The Competing Interests of Parents and Nonparents	389
<i>Troxel v. Granville</i>	389
Notes and Questions	393
3. Equal Protection and Child Custody	393
<i>Palmore v. Sidoti</i>	393
B. State Regulation of the Parent-Child Relationship	394
1. Child Custody Decisions at Divorce	395
<i>Christian v. Randall</i>	396

<i>Schuster v. Schuster</i>	398
Notes and Questions	403
<i>Jarrett v. Jarrett</i>	403
Notes and Questions	406
<i>In re Marriage of R.S.</i>	407
Notes and Questions	410
2. Restrictions on Retaining Custody and Visitation Rights	412
<i>Taylor v. Taylor</i>	412
Notes and Questions	414
<i>In re Marriage of Dorworth</i>	415
Notes and Questions	417
C. Who Can Become a Parent?	417
1. Adoption by Gay and Lesbian People	417
Notes and Questions	418
Note	419
2. Second Parent Adoptions	419
<i>In re Adoption of Tammy</i>	420
<i>In re Adoption of Jane Doe</i>	425
Notes and Questions	428
3. Interstate Recognition of Adoptions	431
<i>Russell v. Bridgens</i>	431
Notes and Questions	436
<i>Mariga v. Flint</i>	437
Further Reading on Second Parent Adoption	440
D. Rights of the "Second Parent" Who Has Not Adopted	440
1. Common Law Theories that Can Help Establish Parenthood	441
<i>Nancy S. v. Michele G.</i>	441
Notes and Questions	446
<i>Alison D. v. Virginia M.</i>	447
Notes and Questions	449
<i>Titchenal v. Dexter</i>	449
Notes and Questions	456
<i>In re the Parentage of A.B.</i>	457
Questions	460
2. Intentional parenthood	461
<i>In the Matter of the Appeal of Helmi A. Hisserich</i>	461
Notes and Questions	466
3. Genetic Mom and Gestational Mom	467
4. Parenthood by Declaration	467
<i>Kristine Renee H. v. Lisa Ann R.</i>	467
Notes and Questions	468
5. Asserting Rights as a Nonparent	468
<i>In re Guardianship of Olivia</i>	468
Notes and Questions	472
E. The Role of Assisted Reproductive Technologies in Creating Gay and Lesbian Families	473
1. Overview	473
Notes and Questions	474
2. Lesbian Couples and Sperm Donors	475

<i>Tripp v. Hinckley</i>	475
Notes and Questions	476
3. Gay Male Couples and Surrogates	477
Questions	479
<i>A.H.W. v. G.H.B.</i>	479
Questions	484
Further Reading on Reproductive Technology	484
Chapter Six Discrimination, Fairness & Equality	487
A. Introduction	487
B. Constitutional Equality—Sexual Orientation Discrimination	488
1. The pre-Romer cases	490
<i>Padula v. Webster</i>	490
<i>High Tech Gays v. Defense Industrial Security Clearance Office</i>	492
<i>Watkins v. United States Army</i>	496
Notes and Questions	499
2. Post-Romer decisions	500
<i>Nabozny v. Podlesny</i>	500
Notes and Questions	507
<i>Able v. United States</i>	508
Notes and Questions	513
<i>Quinn v. Nassau County Police Department</i>	514
Notes and Questions	517
C. Sex Discrimination and Sexual Minority Rights: Statutory Protection	518
<i>Desantis v. Pacific Telephone & Telegraph Co., Inc.</i>	520
Notes and Questions	526
<i>Ulane v. Eastern Airlines, Inc.</i>	528
<i>Price Waterhouse v. Hopkins</i>	532
Notes and Questions	534
<i>Spearman v. Ford Motor Company</i>	534
<i>Réné v. Mgm Grand Hotel, Inc.</i>	538
<i>Smith v. City of Salem, Ohio</i>	548
Notes and Questions	555
D. Express Bans on Sexuality Discrimination	556
1. The Enforcement of Discrimination Laws	557
<i>Singer v. United States Civil Service Commission</i>	558
Notes and Questions	564
<i>Shelton v. City of Manhattan Beach</i>	565
<i>Goins v. West Group</i>	578
Notes and Questions	583
2. Discrimination in Employee Benefits	583
3. Exceptions to the Non-discrimination Requirement	585
<i>Hurley v. Irish-American Gay, Lesbian and Bisexual Group</i>	585
Notes & Questions	591
<i>Boy Scouts of America v. Dale</i>	591
Notes & Questions	609
<i>Thorson v. Billy Graham Evangelistic Association</i>	610
Notes and Questions	613
E. Immigration and Asylum	613

1. Immigration of Same-sex Partners	614
<i>National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality v.</i> <i>the Minister of Home Affairs</i>	615
Notes and Questions	622
2. Asylum for Sexual Minorities	623
<i>Pitcherskaia v. Immigration and Naturalization Service</i>	624
<i>Hernandez-Montiel v. Immigration and Naturalization Service</i>	628
Notes and Questions	637
 Chapter Seven Sexual Expression, Free Speech and Association	639
A. Introduction: The Constitutional Framework	639
B. Sexually-Oriented Expression	639
<i>Stanley v. Georgia</i>	640
Questions	643
<i>Paris Adult Theatre I v. Slaton</i>	643
Notes and Questions	647
<i>Sable Communications v. Federal Communications Commission</i>	649
Notes and Questions	654
<i>Osborne v. Ohio</i>	655
Notes and Questions	661
<i>Reno v. American Civil Liberties Union</i>	662
Notes and Questions	673
<i>United States v. Extreme Associates, Inc.</i>	674
Questions	680
C. Speaking Out	680
<i>Van Ooteghem v. Gray</i>	680
Notes and Questions	685
<i>National Gay Task Force v. Board of Education of City of Oklahoma City</i>	686
<i>Loring v. Bellsouth Advertising & Publishing Corporation</i>	692
Notes and Questions	698
<i>Olivieri v. Ward</i>	699
D. Forming Ranks	704
<i>In re William J. Thom</i>	704
Application of William J. Thom, Appellant,	705
Application of William J. Thom, Petitioner,	709
Notes and Questions	710
<i>Gay Students Organization v. Bonner</i>	711
<i>Gay Lib v. University of Missouri</i>	717
<i>Ratchford v. Gay Lib</i>	725
<i>Gay and Lesbian Students Association v. Gohn</i>	727
Notes and Questions	733
<i>Boyd County High School Gay Straight Alliance v.</i> <i>Board of Education of Boyd County, Ky.</i>	736
Notes and Questions	749
 Index	751